

# Thus have I read: the place of reading in the practice of Buddhism

Carlos Garcia-Jane

MA Buddhist Studies  
University of South Wales  
March 2021

Carlos Garcia-Jane

Student number: 17147948

Module: RS4T01A\_2019\_v1: Dissertation Buddhist Studies (2019/20)

### **Acknowledgements**

I would like to thank Dr Nick Swann and Dr Warren Todd for all their help and assistance during this MA. I would also like to thank my dissertation supervisor, Dr Sarah Shaw, for her comments during this MA and particularly for all her help, encouragement, and suggestions during the writing of this dissertation.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge Jarel A. Robinson-Brown for the conversations and especially Robert Thompson for all his support and companionship.

## Table of Contents

Abstract.....	5
Abbreviations.....	6
Introduction .....	13
Chapter 1: Literature review, methodology, and definitions .....	16
Literature review.....	16
Methodology.....	18
Phenomenology .....	18
Reader-response criticism, aesthetics of reception, interpretative communities .....	18
Narratology .....	19
Reception theory.....	19
Sources .....	20
Content analysis.....	21
Defining reading.....	21
Reading attitudes .....	21
Reading levels .....	21
Reading purposes.....	22
Chapter 2: Reading in Buddhism.....	24
Theory .....	24
Placing Buddhist reading.....	25
Skilful means .....	27
Two-Truths doctrine .....	27
The end of reading: the ‘Simile of the Raft’ and the ‘Finger Pointing to the Moon’ .....	27
How Buddhists read .....	28
Readers’ intentions .....	29
For purification.....	31
For recollection and meditation .....	31
For knowledge and hermeneutics .....	32
Authenticity, canonicity, and authority .....	33
Chapter 3: Reading, reciting, orality .....	36
Early Buddhism .....	38
Chapter 4: Multiple perspectives of reading in Buddhist traditions.....	40
Theravāda Buddhism .....	40
Mahāyāna Buddhism .....	40
Tantra .....	42

Tibetan Buddhism .....	42
Reading-transmission.....	43
Terma .....	44
Mongolian Buddhism .....	44
Chinese Buddhism.....	44
Japanese Buddhism.....	45
Vietnamese Buddhism .....	45
Ch'an/Zen.....	45
Dōgen .....	47
Pure Land Buddhism .....	47
Nichiren Buddhism.....	47
Chapter 5: Buddhist revivals and modern contexts.....	49
Buddhist revivals .....	49
Buddhism in the West.....	50
You cannot learn Buddhism from a book .....	52
Conversion and affiliation .....	53
Reception and responses .....	55
Readers and text .....	55
Religious reading.....	56
Reading literature .....	59
Religious experiences.....	60
Modernity, secularism, globalization.....	60
Bookshop Buddhists.....	64
Reading responses .....	67
Conclusions .....	70
Appendix A: Merit, cults, and pedagogies .....	74
Merit .....	74
Relics and the cult of the book .....	75
Pedagogical reading.....	77
Scholarly and scholastic reading .....	80
Translating and editing as reading .....	80
Reading biographies.....	80
Appendix B: Merit, copying, and preserving <i>Dharma</i> -texts .....	83
Copying .....	83
Manuscripts .....	83
Printing.....	84

Digital .....	86
Inscriptions.....	86
Dāna .....	87
Libraries, storage, and reading spaces.....	87
Revolving libraries.....	88
Reading locations.....	89
Destruction of texts .....	89
Disappearance of reading .....	90
Appendix C: Reading typologies.....	91
Public readings .....	91
Ritual readings .....	92
Reading for protection and magic .....	92
Cultic reading .....	93
Reading in part.....	94
Reading titles .....	94
Reading formulae.....	95
Reading illustrated manuscripts .....	95
Pictorial reading .....	96
Scripture not to be read.....	96
Relic deposits .....	96
Burials and entombment .....	96
Implausible reading.....	97
Reading while sleeping and dreaming .....	97
Impossible reading.....	97
Ingesting as reading .....	97
Mechanically activated reading .....	98
Prayer wheels.....	98
Prayer flags.....	98
Circumambulation and walking .....	98
Turning-reading.....	99
Reading to the other .....	99
The dying, the dead, funeral readings, and ghosts.....	99
Animals.....	100
Criminals .....	100
Gods .....	100
Reading by the other .....	100

Appendix D: Data analysis.....	102
Appendix E: Corpus .....	104
Notes.....	105
Bibliography .....	119

## Abstract

**Purpose:** Reading plays a central role in the transmission, reception, and practice of Buddhism. This dissertation seeks to address a perceived gap in Buddhist studies by suggesting that reading constitutes a valid strategy of practice and a useful phenomenon to analyse Buddhist roles and identities.

**Aims and objectives:** This study aims to explore several occurrences of reading in Buddhism. It seeks to outline a history of reading in Buddhism and to suggest some theoretical foundations which justify the practice of reading. It also attempts to describe the reception of *Dharma*-texts through reading in different historical contexts, including the contemporary world.

**Methods:** The main body of this dissertation comprises the compilation of a corpus of references to reading found in primary and secondary literature. These references have been contextualised by historical research and justified by an exploration of several Buddhist doctrines and theories relevant to reading. This dissertation adopts a phenomenological stance thus allowing religious agents the capacity to provide meaning to their own actions. Interpretative strategies have been informed by reader-response criticism, aesthetics of reception, narratology, and reception theory. Content analysis of Facebook posts and Goodreads reviews has been employed to analyse recent individual responses to Buddhist literature.

**Results:** A corpus of over 14,500 entries with references to reading in Buddhism has been compiled using primary and secondary literature. An outline of the history of reading in Buddhism has been suggested. A theoretical basis for reading in Buddhism has been proposed. The attitudes of different Buddhist traditions and schools towards reading, including the reception of *Dharma*-texts in contemporary contexts, has been described. A ranking of the top ten recommended *Dharma*-texts has been compiled based on a list of 1,217 recommendations found on Facebook groups posts between March and September 2020. 500 of the most recent book reviews of those recommended *Dharma*-texts on Goodreads have been analysed for content.

**Conclusions:** No similar study could be traced in the literature. This dissertation concludes that reading constitutes a central practice in Buddhism and one of its main means of transmission. Reading supports *Dharma* practice, provides moral exemplars, develops faith, purification, and meditation. Buddhism advocates reading slowly and repeatedly, and encourages embodying the teaching by means of familiarity and memorization of *Dharma*-texts. This study also shows that reviews on social media platforms can be used to understand the reception of *Dharma*-texts by contemporary audiences, hence enriching the knowledge of the practices of Bookshop Buddhists and Buddhist sympathizers and contributing to the debate about religious identity and affiliation. This analysis suggests that most readers of *Dharma*-texts seek spiritual fulfilment, religious knowledge, inspiration, and practical advice from a demystified, non-dogmatic, and relatable perspective.

## Abbreviations

[NB: This includes references found in this dissertation and in ‘Appendix E: Corpus’]

- A *Āṅguttara Nikāya*: Bodhi, B. (ed., trans.) (2012) *The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Āṅguttara Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Āā *Ārya-aparamita-āryurjñāna-nāma-mahāyāna-Sūtra (Sūtra of Boundless Life and Wisdom)*: Percy, A. (trans.) (2007). *Sūtra of Boundless Life and Wisdom* [Updated edition] [Online]. [S.I.]: Lotsawa House. Available at: <https://www.lotsawahouse.org/words-of-the-buddha/sutra-boundless-life> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).
- Aaś *Adhyardhaśatikā Prajñāpāramitā*: Conze, E. (trans.) (1965) ‘The Adhyardhaśatikā Prajñāpāramitā’, in Nakano, G. (ed.) *Studies of esoteric Buddhism and Tantrism in commemoration of the 1,150<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the founding of Koyasan*. Koyasan: Koyasan University, pp. 101-115.
- AKB *Abhidharmakośa-Bhāṣya*: La Vallée Poussin, L. d.; Lodrö Sangpo (trans.) (2012) *Abhidharmakośa-Bhāṣya of Vasubandhu: the treasury of the Abhidharma and its (auto)commentary*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.
- Āsp *Ārya-suvarṇa-prabhā-sottama-sūtrendra-rāja-mahāyāna-Sūtra (The King of Glorious Sūtras called the Exalted Sublime Golden Light)*: Dawa, L. (trans.) (2007) *The King of Glorious Sūtras called the Exalted Sublime Golden Light: a Mahāyāna Sūtra* [Online]. Portland: Foundation for the Preservation of the Mahāyāna Tradition. Available at: [https://shop.fpmt.org/The-King-of-Glorious-Sutras-called-the-Exalted-Sublime-Golden-Light-eBook-PDF\\_p\\_2348.html](https://shop.fpmt.org/The-King-of-Glorious-Sutras-called-the-Exalted-Sublime-Golden-Light-eBook-PDF_p_2348.html) (Accessed: 09 November 2020).
- Aṣṭa *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā Sūtra*: Conze, E. (trans.) (1973) *The Perfection of Wisdom in Eight Thousand lines and its verse summary*. San Francisco: City Lights. Wheel series, 1.
- Ava *Avataṃsaka Sūtra*: Cleary, T. (trans.) (1993) *The Flower Ornament Scripture: a translation of the Avataṃsaka Sūtra*. London: Shambhala.
- A-yu Rongxi, L. (trans.) (1993) *The biographical scripture of King Aśoka: translated from the Chinese of Saṃghapāla (Taishō, Volume 50, Number 2043)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 76-II.
- BA *Blue Annals*: Roerich, G. N. (trans.) (2016) *The Blue Annals* [Third revised edition] Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Baizhang *Baizhang Zen Monastic Regulations*: Ichimura, S. (trans.) (2006) *The Baizhang Zen monastic regulations (Taishō volume 48, Number 2025)* [Online]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka series. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/the-baizhang-zen-monastic-regulations/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).



Bca	<i>Bodhicaryāvatāra</i> : Crosby, K. and Skilton, A. (trans.) (1995) <i>The Bodhicaryāvatāra [by] Śāntideva</i> . Oxford: Oxford University Press. Oxford world's classics.
Bpp	<i>Bodhipathapradīpa</i> : Gyatso, T.; McClen Novick, R., Jinpa, T., and Ribush, N. (eds.) (2002) <i>Illuminating the path to enlightenment: a commentary on Atisha Dipamkara Shrijnana's A Lamp for the Path to Enlightenment and Lama Je Tsong Khapa's Lines of Experience</i> . Translated by Geshe Thupten Jinpa. Long Beach: Thubten Dhargye Ling.
Butön	<i>Butön's History of Buddhism</i> : Stein, L. and Zangpo, N. (trans.) (2013) <i>Butön's History of Buddhism in India and its spread to Tibet: A Treasury of Priceless Scripture; Butön Rinchen Drup</i> . London: Snow Lion Publications. The Tsadra Foundation series.
CB	<i>Chanlin baoxun/Chanmen baoxun = Precious Lessons from the Chan Schools</i> : Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005a) 'Zen Lessons', in Cleary, T. <i>Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume One</i> . Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 3-124.
Cśk	<i>Catuḥśatakakārikā</i> : Sonam, R. (2008) <i>Āryadeva's Four Hundred Stanzas on the Middle Way; with commentary by Gyel-tsap</i> . Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications. Textual studies and Translations in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism.
Csp	<i>Caturaśīti-siddha-pravṛtti</i> : Robinson, J. B. (trans.) (1979) <i>The Buddha's lions: the lives of the eighty-four siddhas: Caturaśīti-siddha-pravṛtti by Abhayadatta, translated into Tibetan as Grub thob brgyad cu rtsa bzhi'i lo rgyus by sMon-grub Shes-rab</i> . Berkeley: Dharma Publishing. Tibetan translation series, 10.
D	<i>Dīgha Nikāya</i> : Walshe, M. (trans.) (2012) <i>The Long Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Dīgha Nikāya</i> . Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
Dā 1	<i>Divyāvadāna. Part 1</i> : Rotman, A. (trans.) (2008) <i>Divine stories: Divyavādana. Part 1</i> . Boston: Wisdom Publication. Classics of Indian Buddhism.
Dā 2	<i>Divyāvadāna. Part 2</i> : Rotman, A. (trans.) (2017) <i>Divine stories: Divyavādana. Part 2</i> . Boston: Wisdom Publication. Classics of Indian Buddhism.
Dhp	<i>Dhammapada</i> : Roebuck, V. J. (ed., trans.) (2010) <i>The Dhammapada</i> . London: Penguin Books. Penguin Classics.
Dīp	<i>Dīpavaṃsa</i> : Oldenberg, H. (trans.) (1879) <i>The Dīpavaṃsa: an ancient Buddhist historical record</i> . London: Williams and Norgate.
Fa-chü	<i>Fa-chü p'i-yü ching</i> : Willemen, C. (1999) <i>The scriptural text: verses of the doctrine, with parables: translated from the Chinese of Fa-li and Fa-chü (Taishō Volume 4, Number 211)</i> . Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 10-II.
Fanwang	<i>Fanwang jing</i> : Muller, A. C. and Tanaka, K. K. (trans.) (2017) <i>The Brahmā's Net Sūtra (Taishō Volume 24, Number 1484)</i> . Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
Hasshū-K	<i>Hasshū-Kōyō</i> : Pruden, L. M. (trans.) (1995) <i>The essentials of the Vinaya tradition by Gyōnen: translated from the Japanese (Taishō, Volume 74, Number 2348)</i> . Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 97-I.

- Hekiganroku *Hekiganroku = The Blue Cliff Record*: Sekida, K. (trans.); Grimstone, A. V. (ed.) (2005) *Two Zen classics: The Gateless Gate and the Blue Cliff Records*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Hvt *Hevajra Tantra*: Snellgrove, D. L. (trans.) (1959) *The Hevajra Tantra: a critical study. Part I: Introduction and translation*. London: Oxford University Press.
- It *Itivuttaka*: Ireland, J. D. (trans.) (1997) *The Udāna: inspired utterances of the Buddha & The Itivuttaka: the Buddha's sayings*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Jāt *Jātaka*: Cowell, E. B. (ed.) (2005-2016) *The Jātaka or stories of the Buddha's former lives*. Bristol: Pali Text Society.
- Jol *Jewel Ornament of Liberation*: Guenther, H. V. (trans.) *The Jewel Ornament of Liberation by sGam.po.pa*. Berkeley: Shambhala Publications. The clear light series.
- Kaimokushō *Kaimokushō*: Murano, S. (trans.) (2000) *Kaimokushō or liberation from blindness by Nichiren: translated from the Japanese (Taishō Volume 84, Number 2689)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 104-IV.
- Kakuban texts Todaro, D. A. (2004) *Shingon texts: The Mitsugonin confession; the illuminating secret commentary on the five chakras and the nine syllables by Kakuban (Taishō Volume 79, Number 2527, 2514)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 98-VI, VII.
- Kūkai texts Giebel, R. W. (2004) *Shingon texts: On the difference between exoteric and esoteric teachings; the meaning of becoming a Buddha in this very body; the meanings of sound, sign, and reality; the meaning of the word Hūm; the precious key to the secret treasure, by Kūkai: translated from the Japanese (Taishō Volume 77, Numbers 2427, 2429, 2430, 2426)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 98-I, II, III, IV, V.
- Kyōgyōshinshō *Kyōgyōshinshō*: Inagaki, H. (trans.) (2003) *Kyōgyōshinshō: on teaching, practice, faith, and enlightenment by Shinran: translated from the Japanese (Taishō Volume 83, Number 2646)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 105-I.
- Lam Rim 1 *Lam rim chen mo*: Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee (trans.); Newland, G. (ed.) (2000) *The great treatise on the stages of the path to Enlightenment by Tsong-kha-pa. Volume one*. Ithaca. Snow Lion Publications.
- Lam Rim 2 *Lam rim chen mo*: Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee (trans.); Newland, G. (ed.) (2004) *The great treatise on the stages of the path to Enlightenment by Tsong-kha-pa. Volume two*. Ithaca. Snow Lion Publications.
- Lam Rim 3 *Lam rim chen mo*: Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee (trans.); Newland, G. (ed.) (2002) *The great treatise on the stages of the path to Enlightenment by Tsong-kha-pa. Volume three*. Ithaca. Snow Lion Publications.
- Linji *Linji Lu = Rinzaï Roku: The recorded saying of Linji*: Cleary, J. C. (trans.) (1999) *The recorded sayings of Linji*, in Sengaku, M. (ed.) *Three Chan classics: the recorded sayings of Linji; Wumen's Gate; The Faith-mind Maxim (Taishō Volumes 47 and 48 Numbers*

- 1985, 2005, 2010). Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 74-I, II, III.
- M *Majjhima Nikāya*: Ñāṇamoli, B. and Bodhi, B. (eds., trans.) (2001) *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Majjhima Nikāya* [Revised]. Oxford: Pali Text Society. Teachings of the Buddha; Pali Text Society Translation series, 49.
- Mātaṅga *Mātaṅga Sūtra*: Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2015) 'The Mātaṅga Sūtra (Taishō Volume 21, Number 1300)' in Mayeda, S. (ed.) *Esoteric texts*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Mav *Madhyāntavibhaṅga*: Dharmachakra Translation Committee (trans.) (2006) *Middle beyond extremes: Maitreya's Madhyāntavibhaṅga with commentaries by Khenpo Shenga and Ju Mipham*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.
- Mhv *Mahāvamsa*: Geiger, W. (trans.) (1912) *The Mahāvamsa, or the great chronicle of Ceylon*. London: Pali Text Society.
- Miln *Milindapañha*: Horner, I. B. (trans.) (1963-1964) *Milinda's questions*. Bristol: Pali Text Society. Sacred books of the Buddhists, 23.
- Ms *Mahāyānasamgraha*: Brunnhölzl, K. (trans.) (2018) *A compendium of the Mahāyāna: Asaṅga's Mahāyānasamgraha and its Indian and Tibetan commentaries*. Boulder: Snow Lion. The Tsadra Foundation series.
- Mumonkan *Mumonkan = The Gateless Gate*: Sekida, K. (trans.); Grimstone, A. V. (ed.) (2005) *Two Zen classics: The Gateless Gate and the Blue Cliff Records*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Nirvana-S *Mahāparinirvāṇa Sūtra*: Blum, M. K. (trans.) (2013) *The Nirvana Sūtra (Mahāparinirvāṇa-Sūtra). Volume 1 (Taishō Volume 12, Number 374): translated from the Chinese*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Paṭis *Paṭisambhidāmagga*: Ñāṇamoli, B. (trans.) (2014) *The Path of Discrimination (Paṭisambhidāmagga)* [Second edition]. Oxford: Pali Text Society. Pali Text Society translation series, 43.
- Plat *Platform Sūtra*: McRae, J. R. (trans.) (2000) *The Platform Sūtra of the Sixth Patriarch: translated from the Chinese of Zongbao (Taishō Volume 48, Number 2008)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Ppn *Prajñāpāramitānaya Sūtra*: Miyata, T. (trans.) (2015) 'The Sūtra of the View of Fulfilling the Great Perpetual Enjoyment and Benefiting All Sentient Beings Without Exception (Taishō Volume 8, Number 243)' in Mayeda, S. (ed.) *Esoteric texts*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Pu-s *Pratyutpanna-Buddha-Saṃmukhāvasthita-Samādhi-Sūtra*: Harrison, P. (trans.) (1990) *The Samādhi of Direct Encounter with the Buddhas of the Present: an annotated English translation of the Tibetan version of the Pratyutpanna-Buddha-Saṃmukhāvasthita-Samādhi-Sūtra with several appendices relating to the history of the text*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies.

- S *Samyutta Nikāya*: Bodhi, B. (ed., trans.) (2000) *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Samyutta Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Saddh-s *Saddhamasaṅgaha*: Law, B. C. (trans.) (1941) *A manual of Buddhist historical traditions (SadDhamma-saṅgaha)* Calcutta: University of Calcutta.
- Samādhirāja *Ārya-sarva-dharma-svabhāva-samatāvipañcita-samādhi-rāja-nāma-Mahāyāna-yāna-Sūtra*: Roberts, P. A. (trans.) (2018) *The King of Samādhis Sūtra: SamādhirājaSūtra* [Online]. Fremont: 84000: Translating the Words of the Buddha. Available at: <https://read.84000.co/translation/toh127.html> (Accessed: 10 November 2020).
- Sdp *Saddharma Puṇḍarīka Sūtra*: Reeves, G. (trans.) (2008) *The Lotus Sūtra: a contemporary translation of a Buddhist classic*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Senchakushū *Senchaku hongan nembutsu shū*: Augustine, M. J. and Kondō, T. (trans.) (1997) *Senchaku hongan nembutsu shū: a collection of passages on the Nembutsu chosen in the original vow compiled by Genkū (Hōnen) (Taishō Volume 83, Number 2608)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 104-II.
- Sengyou I Ziegler H. H. (trans.) (2015) *The Collection for the Propagation and Clarification of Buddhism. Volume I (Taishō Volume 52, Number 2102) [compiled by Shi Sengyou]*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Sengyou II Ziegler H. H. (trans.) (2017) *The Collection for the Propagation and Clarification of Buddhism. Volume II (Taishō Volume 52, Number 2102) [compiled by Shi Sengyou]*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Shinji Sbgz *Shinji Shōbōgenzō*: Nishijima, G. W. (trans.); Luetchford, M. and Pearson, J. (eds.) (2003) *Master Dōgen's Shinji Shōbōgenzō*. London: Windbell Publications.
- Sbgz.1 *Shōbōgenzō. Book 1*: Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1994) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 1*. London: Windbell Publications.
- Sbgz.2 *Shōbōgenzō. Book 2*: Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1996) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 2*. London: Windbell Publications.
- Sbgz.3 *Shōbōgenzō. Book 3*: Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1997) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 3*. London: Windbell Publications.
- Sbgz.4 *Shōbōgenzō. Book 4*: Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1999) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 4*. London: Windbell Publications.
- Sbgz-Z *Shōbōgenzō-Zuimonki*: Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005i) 'Record of things heard: from the Treasury of the Eye of the True Teaching: the Shōbōgenzō-Zuimonki, talks of Zen Master Dōgen, as recorded by Zen Master Ejo', in Cleary, T. *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Four*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 712-850.
- Shabkar *Shabkar's autobiography*: Ricard, M. et al. (trans.) (2001) *The life of Shabkar: the autobiography of a Tibetan yogi: the king of wish-granting jewels that fulfils the hopes of all fortunate disciples who seek liberation: the detailed narration of the life and*

*liberation of the great vajra-holder Shabkar Tsogdruk Rangdrol, refuge and protector for all sentient being of this dark age.* Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.

- Sn *Suttanipāṭa*: Bodhi, B. (ed., trans.) (2017) *The Suttanipāṭa: an ancient collection of the Buddha's discourses together with its commentaries; Paramatthajotikā II and excerpts from the Niddesa*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Snc *Samdhinirmocana Sūtra*: Cleary, T. (trans.) (1995) *Buddhist yoga: a comprehensive course*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Srim *Śrīmālādevīsīṃhanāda Sūtra*: Paul, D. Y. (trans.) (2004) *The Sūtra of Queen Śrīmālā of the Lion's Roar (Taishō Volume 12, Number 353)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Ss *Śikṣā Samuccaya*: Bendall, C. and Rouse, W. H. D. (trans.) (1971) *Śikṣā Samuccaya: a compendium of Buddhist doctrine compiled by Śāntideva, chiefly from earlier Mahāyāna Sūtras*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.
- Ssk *Susiddhikara*: Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2001) *The Susiddhikara Sūtra*, in Giebel, R. W. *Two esoteric Sūtras: the Adamantine Pinnacle Sūtra; the Susuddhikara Sūtra*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 29-II, 30-II.
- Tendai H. *Tendai Hokkeshū Gishū*: Swanson, P. L. (trans.) (1995) *The collected teachings of the Tendai Lotus School by Gishin: translated from the Japanese (Taishō, Volume 74, Number 2366)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 97-I.
- Tsa-pao-tsang *Tsa-pao-tsang-ching*: Willemen, C. (1994) *The storehouse of sundry valuables: translated from the Chinese of Kikkāya and Liu Hsiao-piao (Compiled by T'an-yao) (Taishō, Volume 4, Number 203)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 10-I.
- Ud *Udāna*: Ireland, J. D. (trans.) (1997) *The Udāna: inspired utterances of the Buddha & The Itivuttaka: the Buddha's sayings*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Up *Upāyakauśalya Sūtra*: Tatz, M. (trans.) (1994) *The Skill in Means (Upāyakauśalya) Sūtra*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.
- Uś *Upāsakaśīla Sūtra*: Shih, H.-c. (trans.) (1994) *The Sūtra on upāsaka precepts: translated from the Chinese of Dharmarakṣa (Taishō, Volume 24, Number 1488)*. Berkely: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 45-II.
- Vairocana *Vairocanābhisaṃbodhi Sūtra*: Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2005) *The Vairocanābhisaṃbodhi Sūtra: translated from the Chinese (Taishō Volume 118, Number 848)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Vc *Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitā Sūtra*: Conze, E. (trans.) (2001) *Buddhist wisdom: containing the Diamond Sūtra and the Heart Sūtra* [First Vintage edition]. New York: Vintage books. Vintage spiritual classics.
- Vim *Vimalakīrtinirdeśa Sūtra*: McRae, J. R. (trans.) *The Vimalakīrti Sūtra (Taishō Volume 14, Number 475)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.

Vin I	<i>Vinaya-piṭaka. Mahāvagga</i> : Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2014a) <i>The book of the discipline (Vinaya-Piṭaka). Volume IV</i> . Bristol: Pali Text Society.
Vin IVa	<i>Vinaya-piṭaka. Suttavibhaṅga</i> : Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2012a) <i>The book of the discipline (Vinaya-Piṭaka). Volume III (Suttavibhaṅga)</i> . Bristol: Pali Text Society. Sacred books of the Buddhists, 9.
Vin IVb	<i>Vinaya-piṭaka. Suttavibhaṅga. II</i> : Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2012b) <i>The book of the discipline (Vinaya-Piṭaka). Volume III (Suttavibhaṅga)</i> . Bristol: Pali Text Society. Sacred books of the Buddhists, 13.
Vin V	<i>Vinaya-piṭaka. Parivāra</i> . Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2014b) <i>The book of the discipline (Vinaya-piṭaka). Volume VI (Parivāra)</i> . Bristol: Pali Text Society.
Vism	<i>Visuddhimagga</i> : Ñāṇamoli, B. (trans.) (1997) <i>The Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga) by Bhaddantācariya Buddhaghosa</i> . Singapore: Singapore Buddhist Meditation Centre.
Xin-xin-ming	<i>Xin-xin-ming</i> : Yoshida, O. (trans.) (1999) 'The Faith-mind maxim', in Sengaku, M. (ed.) <i>Three Chan classics: the recorded sayings of Linji; Wumen's Gate; The Faith-mind Maxim (Taishō Volumes 47 and 48 Numbers 1985, 2005, 2010)</i> . Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 74-I, II, III.
Xuanzang	Rongxi, L. (trans.) (1995) <i>A biography of the Tripiṭaka master of the great Cí'en monastery of the great Tang dynasty: translated for the Chinese of Śramaṇa Huili and Shi Yangcong (Taishō, Volume 50, Number 2053)</i> . Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 77.
Xuanzang-R	Rongxi, L. (trans.) (1996) <i>The Great Tang Dynasty Record of the Western Regions (Taishō Volume 51, Number 2087) [by Xuanzang]</i> . Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka.
Yijing's Record	Takakusu, J. (trans.) (1896) <i>A record of the Buddhist religion as practiced in India and the Malay Archipelago (A.D. 671-695) by I-Tsing</i> . Oxford: Clarendon Press.
Zuochan	<i>Zuochan sanmei jing</i> : Yamabe, B. and Sueki, F. (trans.) (2009) <i>The Sūtra on the Concentration of Sitting Meditation (Taishō Volume 15, Number 614): translated from the Chinese of Kumārajīva</i> . Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka.

## Introduction

Many people first experience Buddhism through reading. Buddhist sympathizers occasionally read about Buddhism out of intellectual curiosity or spiritual practice. For some, reading becomes their main cause for converting into more committed, involved, and diverse practices. For a sizable number of self-identified Buddhists and Buddhist sympathisers, reading remains their main or sole contact with Buddhist practice. Certain traditions of practice, however, may see this phenomenon as compromising 'true' transmission and 'beneficial' practice. This dissertation intends to explore how this phenomenon has come about.

This dissertation explores the phenomenon of reading in Buddhism. By exploring textual references to reading, this dissertation surveys several historical and geographical contexts, including contemporary practices. This dissertation also features the main theoretical basis for justifying reading practice in Buddhism.

In this dissertation it is argued that, soon after its inception, Buddhist traditions relied on the written word for its practice and transmission, as manifested in reading, reciting, or chanting in a variety of ritual, ceremonial, and pedagogical contexts and in diverse physical, now also electronic formats. By placing reading within several dimensions of Buddhist practice, this dissertation hopes to demonstrate that reading is central to the transmission, reception, and practice of Buddhism in an international setting.

A literature review will reveal that reading has largely remained unexplored within Buddhist studies. This dissertation will attempt to reconstruct several contexts for reading and attitudes towards its practice from within different Buddhist traditions. In particular, the literature review will show that the reception of Buddhist literature amongst contemporary audiences merits scholarly attention. Hence, this dissertation will undertake an analysis of Bookshop Buddhists and Buddhist sympathisers

by means of a study of reviews of Buddhist literature on social media platforms to account for the practice of reading *Dharma*-texts by contemporary audiences.

‘Chapter 2: Reading in Buddhism’ will explore the role of reading in Buddhism. Particularly, it will examine theories and doctrines with which to justify reading practice. It will also survey the practice of reading in several Buddhist traditions and schools. It will conclude that reading constitutes a core practice in many Buddhist traditions and that it plays a key role in the transmission of the religion.

‘Chapter 3: Reading, reciting, orality’ will place reading within the context of oral and recitative traditions. It will also examine the introduction of writing and hence the possibility of reading in the history of Buddhist transmission. ‘Chapter 4: Multiple perspectives of reading in Buddhist traditions’ will survey the role of reading in the development of several Buddhist traditions and their attitudes towards reading in their descriptions of the path of practice and understanding.

‘Chapter 5: Buddhist revivals and modern contexts’ will analyse the role of reading in nineteenth and twentieth-century Asian Buddhist revivals and its position within the transmission of Buddhism to the West. It will also survey different modes of reading in contemporary contexts and will examine the place of reading among Bookshop Buddhists and Buddhist sympathisers.

Several appendixes accompany this dissertation. ‘Appendix A: Merit, cults, and pedagogies’ will situate reading in relation to the merit associated with textual practices, the cult of the book, and its place within pedagogical traditions. ‘Appendix B: Merit, copying, and preserving *Dharma*-texts’ will define several merit-making activities related to the copying of *Dharma*-texts and its relationship with reading. It will also suggest some ideas about storage, preservation, and destruction of *Dharma*-texts, and the eventual disappearance of reading. ‘Appendix C: Reading typologies’ will survey several modes of reading *Dharma*-texts in a variety of settings as found in the literature. ‘Appendix D: Data analysis’ contains the data gathered and analysed to produce the section ‘Reading responses’ on ‘Chapter 5: Buddhist revivals and modern contexts.’ ‘Appendix E: Corpus’ constitutes a database of examples, with references in the bibliography, of evidence for reading practice found in Buddhist scripture, as well as



in primary and secondary literature. Finally, the large majority of endnotes, all found in the 'Corpus', have been included for illustrative purposes only and develop no further argument.

# Chapter 1: Literature review, methodology, and definitions

## Literature review

This section considers some approaches to the study of reading in general and Buddhism in particular. Research into reading remains underdeveloped. This is due to the pervasive nature and the unreliable evidence of its occurrence (Darnston, 1982, p. 78; Chartier, 1994, p. 1; Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p. 6; Hammond, 2015, p. 240; Howsam, 2015a, p. 5, 12). Thus, readers' experiences remain elusive and difficult to trace (Todorov, 1980, p. 67; Boyarin, 1993, p. 7).

Histories of religious reading usually focus on Abrahamic religions.<sup>1</sup> The interest falls on texts, seldom on human interaction with scripture (Smith, 1993, ix; Hoover, 2006, p. 2).

In Buddhism, reading is used for philosophical, doctrinal, mythical, ritual, meditative, and contemplative purposes (Smart, 1996, p. 125). In fact, reading in Buddhism appears in all the religious dimensions developed by Smart (1996, p. 10-11): ritual/practical; doctrinal/philosophical; mythic/narrative; experiential/emotional; ethical/legal; organizational/social; and material/artistic. To reflect that variety, this dissertation will draw from a number of disciplines which provide valid approaches to study reading, including textual and philological studies, anthropology and sociology, and psychology, among others (Smart, 1996, p. 17; Darnton, 2009, p. 206).

Transmission of knowledge, reading techniques, and discursive practices in South, Southeast, and East Asia remain largely unexplored (Graham, 1986, p. 6; Kornicki, 1998, p. 252; Veidlinger, 2007, p. 9; Zwilling, 2013, p. 214). However, as a socially embedded practice, attitudes towards reading may be reconstructed (Darnton, 1982, p. 79; Boyarin, 1993, p. 4; Chartier, 1994, p. 3; Veidlinger, 2007, p. 14). In this sense, pedagogical reading practices have received special attention (Blackburn, 2001; Samuels, 2004; Veidlinger, 2007; McDaniel, 2008; Baldanza, 2018).

Buddhist studies, historically more interested in theological and hermeneutical discussion than in social and cultural practices, have largely dismissed reading (Bielefeldt, 2005, p. 243). Histories of

reading in Buddhism deal with textual creation and transmission, and occasionally with textual usage and reception (Schopen, 1991, p. 5; Wu, 2016b, p. 46). Thus, the writing and reading of *Dharma*-texts for contemporary audiences remain largely unexplored (Coleman, 2001, p. 10).

Several studies contain some references to attitudes towards reading and responses to reading Buddhist texts, including reading *Dharma*-texts as literature (Levering, 1989b; Waterhouse, 1997; Flores, 2008). Buddhist literature has also been the object of stylistic analysis (Cole, 2005), reader's response criticism (Berkwitz, 2004; McDaniels, 2005; Flores, 2008), and reception theory (Segdwick, 2005; Snodgrass, 2009). Buddhist literature has also been analysed from the perspective of conversion (Gordon-Finlayson; 2012), textual practices (Bielefeldt, 2005; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009), ethical reading (McClintock, 2017), religious practice (Wright, 1998; Humphreis, 1999; Wright, 2003, p. 269), and ritual uses (Kim, 2013), among others.

Griffiths (1999) compares religious and consumerist forms of reading and argues that religious reading ought to be intrinsic to religious practice. Griffiths (p. 3-13) asserts that each religion conveys a comprehensive, unsurpassable, and central account of reality through its literature. It is on the basis of these propositions that this dissertation argues a place for reading in the practice of Buddhism.

Several scholars investigate the existence and practices of contemporary Buddhists in terms of religious affiliation and identity (Nattier, 1998; Hayes, 2000; Coleman, 2001; Cox, 2007; McMahan, 2008). Tweed (1999, 2002) conceptualizes a 'nightstand Buddhist', thus enriching the spectrum of categories to define Buddhists while acknowledging the diversity of religious identities.<sup>2</sup> Despite the difficulty in interpreting the reception of Buddhist literature, Buddhist sympathisers and those who have been influenced by Buddhism are insufficiently examined and merit scholarly attention (Tweed, 1999, p. 83; Withnow and Cadge, 2004, p. 364).

This dissertation attempts to establish some basis for reading in Buddhism. Following on from Tweed, this dissertation seeks to explore some responses to Buddhist texts by Buddhist sympathisers.

## **Methodology**

This section explores some methodological issues arising from examining the place of reading in Buddhism. This study draws from de Certeau's idea that what appears to be a marginal practice might possibly be a universal, heterogeneous one (Certeau, 1988, xvii). For de Certeau (xix, 30), reading constitutes a way of operating in the world, an everyday tactic or strategy of practice. This framework enables an analysis of reading habits and reading materials (Chartier, 2002a, p. 49).

## **Phenomenology**

This dissertation takes a phenomenological stance and assumes an attitude of 'informed empathy' so that religious actors provide meaning to their own actions (Smart, 1996, p. 2). By focusing on textual usage and reception, a 'phenomenology of the act of reading' is adopted (Ricoeur, 1990, p. 167; Regan, 1998, p. 143). This stance has facilitated the compilation of evidence of reading and reading responses found in 'Appendix E: Corpus' as well as the data gathering and analysis discussed in the section 'Reading responses' in 'Chapter 5: Buddhist revivals and modern contexts.'

## **Reader-response criticism, aesthetics of reception, interpretative communities**

In order to explore the phenomenon of reading in Buddhism, this dissertation considers several theories with a bearing on the act of reading and the role of readers. Reader-response criticism and aesthetics of reception focus on reading practices and readers' roles.

Reader-response criticism, as formulated by Fish and Iser, analyses readers' experiences of texts and their production of meaning through reading. In aesthetics of reception, Jauss formulates a 'horizon of expectation' to account for literary genres and the reception history of literary works (Culler, 1997, p. 123). A reader's horizon of expectation and an author's model of writing are elements of genre theory useful for analysing reading reception since they establish possible parameters of interpretation (Todorov, 2010, p. 199-200). This analysis includes Fish's concept of interpretive communities according to which certain strategies and beliefs held in common determine textual reception and usage (Fish, 2002, p. 355, 357; Fish, 2004, p. 217).

## **Narratology**

A history of reading must account not only for how actual readers understand texts, but also for how texts portray ideal, implied readers, thus framing readers' responses (Darnton, 2009, p. 202; Montgomery *et al.*, 2013, p. 187). A history of reading must also consider uses of texts other than reading to provide a fuller context (Colclough, 2009, p. 52). Narratology accounts for how texts represent themselves and for which effects texts intend to provoke (Zwilling, 2013, p. 206).

This results in the portrayal of historical readers based on actual instances of their experiences and responses to reading, both intellectual (hermeneutics) and emotional (aesthetics), including norms, convention, and traditions within their communities (Chartier, 2002a, p. 48; Fish, 2002, p. 351; Colclough, 2009, p. 53, 61; Hammond, 2015, p. 250). It also shows how readers actualise and assert themselves and their identities through reading (Holland, 1975, p. 816). Manuscript and print cultures (authors, scribes, printers, librarians, among others) and the sociology of texts of specific times and places provide a wider context for reading practices (Howsam, 2015a, p. 1). This context determines the practice of reading and places each instance of a text in a communication circuit where readers both affect and are affected by textual production (Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p. 12, 24).

## **Reception theory**

Besides reading-response theory,<sup>3</sup> bibliographical analysis, including the publishing history of individual titles and their presence in libraries and collections, among other forms of transmission history, forms another basis to study the reception of authors and their works (Suarez, 2015 p. 200). Religious literature must also be examined in terms of its commercial value and historicity (Howsam, 2015b, p. 257). Thus, scriptural reception can be analysed through the history of commentaries, sub-commentaries, miracle tales, and other such literature (Campany, 2018).<sup>4</sup> For instance, commentaries inform of the reception of texts and their interpretation and constitute an unending search for meaning (Lopez, 1992b, p. 67).

## Sources

From the unreliability of the evidence available for reading described above arises the issue of the means to obtain data about readers and their behaviour, historically and nowadays. Histories of reading rely on data from myriad sources: marginalia, reading records, diaries,<sup>5</sup> biographies, subscription lists, book clubs, printers' and publishers' booklists, texts, and libraries and archives catalogues, among others (Littau, 2006, p. 2006; Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p. 24-25).

Marginalia is the most common source of information about historical, ordinary readers (Colclough, 2009, p. 54; Darnton, 2014, p. 19). Marginalia authors are generally educated, professional intellectuals. Signs of marginalia in students' textbooks and in master-texts from teaching sessions abound<sup>6</sup> (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 129). Other signs of usage, like copyediting marks, sandalwood and vermillion, or fingerprints, are evidence of the physical handling of books and can suggest evidence of their being used (Kim, 2013, p. 8).

Since this dissertation is mainly concerned with general, common readers, other sources must also be examined (Rose, 2002, p. 324; Towheed, 2011, p. 3). Like marginalia authors, book reviewers are self-conscious, autonomous, interactive readers aware that their reading contributes in constructing their identities (Jackson, 2001, p. 87-88). Their testimonies might seem unreliable when taken individually (Hammond, 2015, p. 250). However, these testimonies might provide some useful insights into their intentions and experiences when collated and analysed together. Importantly, their reading is neither passive nor homogeneous (Certeau, 1988, p. 169). Hence, 'Reading responses' in 'Chapter 5' analyses some readers' responses to Buddhist literature.

To sum up, despite its elusive nature, reading constitutes a pervasive presence throughout the history of Buddhism which merits scholarly interest. As a socially-embedded practice, the locatedness of reading can be reconstructed. By examining textual references and readers' responses, the role of reading in Buddhism can be described. The need to contextualise reading within broader practices

involving texts is developed in 'Appendix A: Merit, cults, and pedagogies', 'Appendix B: Merit, copying, and preserving *Dharma*-texts', and 'Appendix C: Reading typologies'.

## **Content analysis**

Content analysis offers a systematic and quantitative analysis of media content. Easy to integrate with other research methods, content analysis proves useful to examine social and cultural issues, values, and phenomena, as well as the intentions of the originator of messages. Although there is no simple correspondence between media content and its reception, ratings and reviews constitute responses to reading and therefore inform of its reception (Hansen and Machin, 2019).

## **Defining reading**

This final section provides a summary of attitudes, forms, and purposes of reading by which reading in Buddhism in general and readers' responses to Buddhist literature in particular can be framed.

## **Reading attitudes**

From a psychological perspective, readers present the following attitudes:

- a) cognitive, created by logical, rational analyses, led by thought;<sup>7</sup>
- b) emotional, related to morality, driven by feelings;<sup>8</sup>
- c) behavioural, based on habits and tendencies.

Most readers show mainly emotional attitudes towards reading. Readers usually base these attitudes not on their own judgment or behaviour, but on what they find exciting or rewarding (Willingham, 2017, p. 138).

## **Reading levels**

Four basic levels of reading can be established depending on the depth and purpose of reading tasks (Adler and Van Doren, 1972, p. 16-20):

1. elementary or rudimentary;

2. inspectional or skimming;
3. analytical or thorough, conducted for the purpose of understanding;
4. syntopical or comparative reading, when a text is placed in context and compared.<sup>9</sup>

## **Reading purposes**

According to its reception and effect, scripture becomes (Levering, 1989a, p. 13-14):

- i. informative, as it shapes one's worldview;
- ii. transformative, as it enacts some power in oneself or the world;
- iii. transactive, as it is used for inner cultivation;
- iv. symbolic.

Three basic goals of reading are (Adler and Van Doren, 1972, p. 9-10):

1. information, as one accumulates data about a subject;
2. understanding, as one deepens one's understanding about a subject;
3. entertainment.

From this perspective, reading always operates a transaction between texts and readers' expectations, knowledge, or interests. This transaction produces different reading strategies according to the goal and purpose of the reader (Waples, Berelson and Bradshaw, 1940, p. 7; Rosenblatt, 1969, p. 38-39; Davis and Womack, 2002, p. 54-55):

- aesthetic reading strategies occurring during the reading event;
- nonaesthetic, cognitive strategies gained after the event.

Readers' production of meaning results from that transaction. Future reading will verify or contrast this reading (Smagorinsky, 2001, p. 149). It will also, in turn, encourage or discourage further reading.

As a learning process, reading becomes a method of instruction and discovery (Adler and Van Doren, 1972, p. 13). Within religious practice, learning can be (Van Voorst, 2008, 8-9):



- i. cognitive: to understand the doctrines and determine meaning;
- ii. worship and ritual, including public readings;
- iii. private or communal;
- iv. meditative or devotional;
- v. non-cognitive: texts and sacred objects, for iconic and magical power.

Regarding intentions, reading can be (Von Voorst, 2008, p. 10):

- informative, documenting history or doctrine;
- performative, to achieve something for oneself or the world;
- transformative, if expecting to be changed as a result of hearing/reading.

Reading produces both knowledge and aesthetic enjoyment<sup>10</sup> (Graham, 1986, p. 7). Hence, all reading has a political and moral aspect. For instance, reading might be restricted or banned as a way of controlling power, pleasure, or agency, and to dissuade dissention (Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p. 109; Hammond, 2015, p. 238-239).

Different intentions when reading might produce different experiences and knowledge. Survey data from the UK indicates that 52 percent of respondents read for relaxation, 27 percent as escapism, and 24 percent for intellectual stimulation (Hammond, 2015, p. 244).

Reading occurs in all types of environments (before going to sleep, while commuting, etc.) and in all modes (scanning for content and reference, reading silently for enjoyment, etc.) (Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p. 131). Further research suggests people choose books over other media to satisfy their psychological needs, particularly for intellectual stimulation, but also for aesthetic enjoyment (Adoni and Nossek, 2011, p. 54-55). However, increasingly people are turning to audiobooks, podcasts, websites, and video material as their main references source.

## Chapter 2: Reading in Buddhism

This chapter explores the role of reading in Buddhism. It places reading within the Buddhist path of practice and understanding. It also examines some Buddhist doctrines justifying reading practice and considers several sources supporting its occurrence. Additionally, this chapter surveys some examples of how Buddhist ought to read according to different Buddhist traditions. Finally, by identifying some readers' intentions and purposes for reading, this section suggests some outcomes of reading practice.

### Theory

Buddhism favours direct experience of the Buddha's *Dharma* existentially and practically, and ultimately, of liberation and *Nirvāṇa* (Smart, 1996, p. 179-180). *Dharma* comprises the body of the teaching (*pariyatti*), the practice of the way (*paṭipatti*), and the realization of each stage towards achieving *Nirvāṇa* (*paṭivedha*). Thus, *Dharma* is to be heard/read, understood, practiced, and realized (Harvey, 2013, p. 245). In this context, reading ought to support *Dharma* practice (Dhp 51-52). *Dharma*-texts become guidebooks to inform doctrinal content and address practical problems (Adler and Van Doren, 1972, p. 193). Hence, reading constitutes a form of intellectual nourishment and a key component of spirituality (Lam, 2010).

Within the path of understanding and practice leading to liberation, reading constitutes part of practices for achieving Right View/Understanding and for eliminating ignorance (M i 70, M iii 230; D 1; i 52, ii 305). Ordinarily, reading facilitates the intellectual understanding of Buddhist doctrines. Hence, hearing/reading corresponds to the first level of wisdom (*paññā/prajñā*) (Harvey, 2013, p. 83). By reading descriptions and prescription of the path, reading becomes both a 'second-hand experience of the world' and an 'illuminating possibility' of existence (Manguel, 2008, p. 18).

Sanskrit and Pāli lack words to distinctly describe the activity of reading. Even when translated as 'to read', the originals may refer to a field of meaning comprising 'reading', 'reciting', 'causing to recite', 'hearing', 'studying', or 'pondering' (Griffiths, 1999, p. 116).

Descriptions of the Buddhist path offer faith and practice alternatives (S iii 225). Emphasis on reading and its uses varies according to one's understanding and tradition. Whereas traditions describing a gradual path tend to place reading at several stages of practice, particularly initial stages, those traditions promoting sudden enlightenment tend to downplay or disparage certain reading practices (Butön, p. 288). On occasion, certain schools include reading within their monastic regulations.<sup>11</sup> Some *Sūtras* contemplate that reading and other textual tasks might be suitable for certain individuals as their path<sup>12</sup> (Schopen, 1978, p. 324-325).

Common descriptions of the path include the following stages: (i) observing morality; (ii) learning (listening/reading) the teachings; (iii) reflecting on the truths represented by the teachings; (iv) and meditating on these truths. Hence, reading for understanding supports reflection and concentration (ABK vi 142). Understanding through reading also removes all obstacles to liberation (ABK vi 276).

Mimesis, the desire to identify with exemplars offered in Buddhist texts and to achieve the goals described therein, provides another theoretical model to define reading as Buddhist practice (Flores, 2008, p. 36-37, 44). In particular, mimesis and inspiration encourage the compilation and reading of the biographies of Buddhist masters, Tantric practitioners, proficient meditators, and other celebrated individuals.<sup>13</sup>

## **Placing Buddhist reading**

This section offers some examples of advice on how reading ought to be done according to some Buddhist traditions.

The Pāli *suttas*, as an authoritative, complete, self-consistent body of texts, offer practical advice, sustain faith<sup>14</sup> and trust<sup>15</sup> in the *Dhamma*, support meditation practice, and develop skilful qualities (Access to Insight, 2001). Both *Access to Insight* (2001) and *Reading Faithfully* (2018) encourage broadly reading suttas in a regular, committed, and serendipitous manner. They advocate rereading to improve understanding,<sup>16</sup> perusing over refrains, discussing the suttas, studying the commentaries, and even learning some Pāli. It recommends that reading is done slowly, as contemplation, wondering

about the meaning of the teaching and its significance to the reader<sup>17</sup> (Sumedho, in Walshe, 2012, p. 12; Bodhi, 2017, p. 19). Mahāyāna *Dharma*-texts also require slow, contemplative reading (Williams, in Crosby and Skilton, 1995, xxvi).

Reading in Zen constitutes a meditative, thoughtful, engaged, self-aware activity, in which texts become mirrors<sup>18</sup> reflecting a reader's own mind<sup>19</sup> (Wright, 1998, xii-xiii). Reading in this context requires critically thinking and reflecting while pursuing self-transformation and freedom from grasping and illusion. Reading in Zen thus becomes experiential (Cleary, 2005g, p. 322). Patience and rereading are required to deepen one's understanding (Grimstone, in Sekida, 2005, p. 16). For Blofeld, reading has a place in the first stages of Zen practice before forms of direct experience occur (Wright, 1998, p. 22). However, some Zen masters engaged in reading all their lives (Wright, 1998, p. 25).

Reading in Tibetan Buddhism is also to be done slowly and repeatedly<sup>20</sup> (Van Schaik, 2016, p. 12; Gyatso and Chodron, 2018, p. xvi). After reading a passage, one should ponder quietly over its meaning (Mullins, 1999, p. 21). One should keep an attentive, altruistic intention when setting on reading *Dharma*<sup>21</sup> (Gyatso and Chodron, 2018, p. xvi). Mindfulness is needed to process and retain all learning (Gyatso and Kamalaśīla, 2019). Reading constitutes an aspect of the *Sūtra* path for realizing emptiness and should be done under the guidance of a competent teacher (Tashi Namgyal, 2019, lix, p. 140).

This brief overview shows how, although certain qualities when reading, like slow-paced reading, a contemplative attitude, and the regular engagement with scripture, are common to all Buddhist traditions, each different Buddhist tradition largely define reading so that it aligns with the general outlook of that tradition. Thus, whereas the Theravāda emphasises the role of the Pāli suttas and the role of Pāli as a canonical language, Zen underlines the importance of experience and the mirror-like quality of *Dharma*-texts, and Tibetan Buddhism highlights the need to set an altruistic intention before reading to develop bodhicitta and the role of the guru in the transmission of the *Dharma*.

## **Skilful means**

The Buddha's expedient teaching (Sanskrit '*upāya-kauśalya*') implies he had the ability to adapt his preaching to specific audiences according to their capacity for understanding (Mizuno, 1982, p. 138). This means that the Buddha taught in particular pedagogical contexts, which need to be considered when examining *Dharma*-texts<sup>22</sup> (Flores, 2008, p. 14). Although the Buddha acknowledged the conventional, arbitrary, empty nature of language, the rhetorical devices and figurative speech used by the Buddha when teaching constitute Right Speech (A v 198; D i 202; Abé, 2005, p. 308; Flores, 2008, p. 88). As such, language contributes towards liberation although it also presents several dangers (Humphreis, 1999, xi).

## **Two-Truths doctrine**

By reading, one can only access conventional truths rooted in language. Thus, reading becomes merely an entry point into an absolute truth that remains only conceptualised. Ultimately, the emptiness of all phenomena and the equivalence between *Samśāra* and *Nirvāṇa* in certain traditions allow language and literature to be valid practices towards liberation (Humphreis, 1999, p. xii).

Reading should be done according to one's level of practice and understanding, personality, temperament, needs, and abilities. *Dharma*-texts are classified according to themes (devotion, morality, penetration, etc.) pertinent to different people at different times, and in relation to their understanding (Kramer, 1987, p. 153; Bond, 1992, p. 35-38).

Therefore, whereas the concept of skilful means conveys the idea that *Dharma*-texts carry the provisional means by which practitioners can fare towards enlightenment in ways appropriate to different individuals and in diverse contexts, the two-truths doctrine points out some of the limitation of using language to convey the truths necessary to attain that enlightenment.

## **The end of reading: the 'Simile of the Raft' and the 'Finger Pointing to the Moon'**

It is in this light that can be said that reading in Buddhism is for practicing *Dharma*, for dwelling in the *Dharma*, for liberation and not an end in itself (A iii 86-87; S ii 267). The 'Simile of the Raft' (M i 135)

expresses the idea that the teaching is for crossing over the stream, not for holding on<sup>23</sup> (Ānanda, 1996, p. 377). Likewise, '(...), the teachings of the Buddhist scriptures are like fingers pointing to the moon' (Cleary, 2005b, p. 164-165). Thus, all Buddhist traditions limit the capacity of reading to be able to produce final liberation. For instance, traditions that emphasize experience advocate abandoning reading once its skilful means has served its purpose (Sharf, 2004, p. 267).

### **How Buddhists read**

Buddhism comprises the following reading modes (Chartier, 2002a, p. 54):

- according to the sound produced when reading: articulated, out-loud, subvocalized, or silent reading;
- according to the number of readers and the occasion: individual, solitary, private, or communal reading, including reading to a group, public reading, and simultaneously, by a group of readers reading the same or different texts;
- according to the value placed on the texts: intensive reading of texts to be memorized and/or recited, or extensive, consumerist reading.

Whereas reading out-loud is 'slow, laborious, and externalized', silent reading is 'faster, easier' and perhaps more impactful in terms of understanding (Chartier, 2002b, p. 125). Both articulated reading and silent reading can add prosody to aid comprehension (Willingham, 2017, p. 67). Although silent reading is generally static, as an embodied activity vocalised reading usually involves bodily movements (Littau, 2006, p. 2-3, 37). Memorization also contains a somatic, physical dimension, as monastics often accompany their recitations with bodily gestures and movements (Dreyfus, 2003, p. 85). The materiality and format of texts affect their reading and prompt different responses in readers (Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p. 3).

Reciting *Dharma*-text activates their contents. By reading, one recalls the Buddha and invokes his presence<sup>24</sup> (Ray, 1994, p. 334; Elliot, Diemberger and Clemente, 2014b, p. 8). Those unable to recollect must first learn *Dharma*-texts by reading or by repeating after a reciter until they are memorized

(Eubanks, 2011, p. 50-51). Textual supports are only required for reading, not necessarily for reciting. Certain contexts however require that a volume also be present to activate its content.

Further, Eubanks (2011, p. 176-177) argues that the materiality and format of texts presuppose a space of reading:

- Linear reading involves reading lines of texts in sequence;
- Radial reading implies access to secondary texts to support the reading of primary texts;
- Representative, emblematic reading, of abridged versions of *Dharma*-texts;
- Circumambulatory reading where turning or circling is required for textual activation.

Eubanks (2011, p. 17, 177) argues that the rotation found in prayer wheels or rotating libraries is a metaphor for textuality in Buddhism: the same way the Buddha turned the Wheel of *Dharma*, readers turn scriptures, these devices, or themselves, literally and figurately, as they read.

Particularly relevant for contemporary practice is silent, private reading, largely developed from the sixteenth century onwards (Chartier, 2002b, p. 125). Modern Christian monastic orders and Protestantism had developed a mode of practice essentially based on the capacity for silent, intimate reading of scripture and other religious texts as a way to establish a personal relationship with the divine (Chartier, 2002b, p. 126).

## **Readers' intentions**

This section explores how Buddhists themselves read and how they regard reading as practice. Readers of Buddhist texts, it seems, are motivated by adventure, spiritual inspiration, intellectual stimulation, academic prestige, distraction, and/or pedagogical instruction<sup>25</sup> (Cleary, 1993, p. 50-51; Griffiths, 1999, p. 40; Flores, 2008, p. 184; Reeves, 2008, p. 5). Additionally, sacred literature in general has an inspiring and transformative capacity and it is both the focus of devotion and of religious performance (Olson, 2013, p. 19-20).

The benefits obtained by hearing/reading *Dharma*-texts are:

Bhikkhus, there are these five benefits in listening to the *Dhamma*. What five? One hears what one has not heard; one clarifies what has been heard; one emerges from perplexity; one straightens out one's view; one's mind becomes placid. These are the five benefits in listening to the *Dhamma* (A iii 248).

Butön (2013, p. 7-9), quoting scriptural authorities, adds the following benefits: knowledge, discriminating good from bad and meaningful from meaningless, attaining transcendence, ethical conduct, training in meditation and insight, right view, overcoming afflictions and karma, renouncing mundane life, guarding the senses, confidence, and faith, among others.

A rationale for reading and the capacity of scripture to convey truths needed towards Enlightenment is found in *Dharma*-texts (Levering, 1989b, p. 61):

(...) You should live as islands onto yourselves, being your own refuge, with no one else as your refuge, with the Dhamma as an island, with the Dhamma as your refuge,<sup>26</sup> with no other refuge (D ii 100).

*Dharma* thus learned becomes weapons<sup>27</sup> for the noble discipline, who then:

Abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome, abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless, and maintains [one]self in purity (A iv 110).

All the Buddha taught was for the purpose of liberation (Lamotte, 1988, p. 142). Therefore, Buddhist reading ought to serve the same purpose. The wisdom required for attaining liberation derives from hearing/reading (*śrūtamayī*) and from meditation (*bhāvanāmayī*)<sup>28</sup> (Bielefeldt, 1992, p. 504n24).

Reading can also help in working with hindrances and defilements,<sup>29</sup> particularly against doubt,<sup>30</sup> passion,<sup>31</sup> or restlessness and lethargy<sup>32</sup> (Buswell and Gimello, 1992, p. 12-13; Kyabgon, 2013, The Five Hindrances). Reading cannot be a substitute for any practices<sup>33</sup> however, particularly the imperative of experience and own perception<sup>34</sup> (Cook, 2010, p. 105; Hawkeye, 2013, p. 43). As such, reading belongs in the second of the seven limbs of awakening (Pāli '*bojjhaṅga*') required to attain to path of vision: investigating and researching doctrines (Rahula, 1978, p. 75). In the Zen classic *Finding the Ox*, which represents ten different stages in the path toward enlightenment and the functioning of an



enlightened person in society, reading appears at the second stage (finding the traces or discovery of the footprints). It is later forgotten at the eight stage (both bull and man forgotten or both bull and Self transcended) (Myokyo-ni, 1990, p. 41; Sekida, 1985, p. 224-225).

### **For purification**

Within the path of practice, listening to oral teachings, recitation, and reading helps produce the purification,<sup>35</sup> particularly verbal, needed to progress in mediation and realisation (Coward, 1986, p. 300; Van Schaik, 2016, p. 67). Used for meditation,<sup>36</sup> recollecting through recitation/reading produces the mental purification required for obtaining meditation (*dhyana/jhāna*)<sup>37</sup> (Harrison, 1992b, p. 217). This is evidenced by the early practice of carrying a handbook (*muṭṭhipotthaka*) detailing the virtues of Buddha and *Sangha* and read whenever unwholesome thoughts arose in one's mind (Adikaranam, 1946, p. 128; Collins, 1992, p. 122).

### **For recollection and meditation**

Reading is also for the purpose of memorization,<sup>38</sup> internalization, and embodiment<sup>39</sup> (Gyatso, 1992a, p. 14; Eubanks, 2011, p. 51-52). Memory is a mark of superior character and intellect (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 26). Memorization helps to 'uphold' a *sūtra*, that is, the retaining and reciting of a *sūtra* at all times (Yen, 1994). Reciting *Dharma*-texts is for recollecting<sup>40</sup> the *Dharma*, and developing wisdom, mindfulness,<sup>41</sup> and faith, among other benefits and purposes (Gethin, 1992, p. 166-167; Harrison, 1992b, p. 218; Collins, 1992, p. 127; Yen, 1994). It can also be for recollecting one's previous existences.<sup>42</sup> Some meditation manuals say that one can enter single-mode *samādhi* by reading, for instance, *Prajñāpāramitā* literature like the *Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitā Sūtra* (Fauré, 1986, p. 100, 108). For Rinzai, one's mind can be fully absorbed in a kind of *samādhi* while reading, among other tasks (Sekida, 1985, p. 91). Reading also produces visualizations, visionary experiences,<sup>43</sup> and yogic attainments.<sup>44</sup> Some meditations require the reading of a text for their successful completion (Anacker, 1991, p. 85). Additionally, reading supports several forms of analytical meditation (Lodrö, 1998, p. 173). Thus, 'even reading (...) is *bhāvana*' (Anālayo, 2007, p. 15-16; Shaw, 2014, p. 14).

Conversely, meditation can also help in reading more efficiently,<sup>45</sup> since one develops calmness, relaxation, and concentration, hence making the mind more pliable and receptive while turning reading activity into practice of the path.

### **For knowledge and hermeneutics**

Reading is for cultivating knowledge and wisdom,<sup>46</sup> and attaining Right View/Understanding (Jayatilleke, 1963, p. 353; Harvey, 2013, p. 318). It appears in three stages (De Silva, 2014, p. 109-110; Gyatso, 2018, p. 121):

1. initial understanding produced by hearing/reading. Path factors produced by listening/reading comprise wholesome but impure factors since they are not produced by cultivation (ABK ii 265);
2. understanding clarified by thinking, with some feelings and experiences (Ñāṇamoli, 2014, xlii; Coward, 1986, p. 304);
3. 'meditatively acquired wisdom', with intellectual understanding and practical experience produced by meditation.<sup>47</sup>

Along with the oral tradition, sophistry, or inference, among others, '*piṭakasampadāya*', the authority of scripture taken as *dicta theologica*, and thus reading, constitutes one of multiple ways of gaining knowledge<sup>48</sup> (Jayatilleke, 1963, p. 175, 200).

For religious readers, reading is key for developing understanding (Yen, 1994; Griffiths, 1999, p. 74; Parker, 2007, p. 74). However, salvation obtained from intuitive knowledge gained by reading might be insufficient for liberation as much as salvation is unavailable without such knowledge<sup>49</sup> (Jayatilleke, 1963, p. 426; Truman, 1978, p. 35; Ray, 1993, p. 165; Jantrasrisalai, 2008, p. 131). Indeed, memorization without understanding or only attending to literal textual interpretations are both undesirable and detrimental<sup>50</sup> (Lamotte, 1992, p. 14, 22).

The Four Reliances (Pali '*paṭisaraṇa*'; Sanskrit '*pratisaraṇa*'), used to examine statements of truth, suggest one should rely on (Truman, 1978, p. 19; Lamotte, 1992, p. 12; Ray, 1993, p. 161):

- the teaching, not the teacher or person;
- the meaning, not the letter or words;<sup>51</sup>
- definitive meanings (*nītārtha*), not interpretable meanings (*neyārtha*);
- wisdom, not ordinary consciousness.

Similar recommendations exist elsewhere. The *Kālāma Sutta* (A i 188) recommends relying on intuitive knowledge and enlightened experience for interpreting teachings, rather than depending on the authority of texts, the reputation of teachers, or mere tradition (McDermott, 1984, p. 24; Lopez, 1992a, p. 5; Lamotte, 1992, p. 11). The *Netti* and the *Peṭakopadesa* show how to engage in textual interpretation as part of a gradual path of practice (Bond, 1992).

Together with the role of the concept of Skilful Means and of the Two-Truths Doctrine, these recommendations about the capacity of words to convey truths caution readers about the ability of *Dharma*-texts to support Buddhist practice and the need to rely on intuitive knowledge, wisdom, and the teaching, rather than on ordinary consciousness, authority, or a teacher's reputation.

### **Authenticity, canonicity, and authority**

Despite the caveat that practitioners should not rely solely on the authority of scripture, each Buddhist tradition and lineage place great value in the source of their teachings as a way to ascertain their authenticity. This section examines some ideas about the status of textual collections and the role these play in defining Buddhist practices and identities.

The following four rules dictate the authenticity of teachings/texts and the validity of their contents if received from or approved by (D iv 7-11):

- The Buddha;
- The *Sangha*;

- A group of elders;
- Monastics keeping the faith handed down by tradition.

Teachings must accord with *Vinaya* and *Sūtras*, particularly with disciplinary rules, and with certain central Buddhist doctrines, namely the Four Noble Truths and Dependent Origination, or else be rejected (Lamotte, 1984, p. 13; Wynne, 2004, p. 101; Cousins, 2005, p. 97-98). Additionally, teachings expounded by previous Buddhas, sages, gods, and other apparitional beings are also deemed authoritative (Lamotte, 1984, p. 6). For the Theravāda, the corpus of authorized scripture constitutes *Buddhavaṇṇa*, the word of the Buddha (Williams, 1970, p. 162). Using different strategies of legitimization, the Mahāyāna also claims its *sūtras* as *Buddhavaṇṇa* (McDermott, 1984, p. 25; Lopez, 1992b, p. 47).

Buddhism is not a religion of the book and has no textual collection accepted by all Buddhist traditions (Appleton, 2014, p. 574).<sup>52</sup> Each Buddhist tradition developed different canons. Since canons differ, the terms ‘canon’ and ‘*Buddhavaṇṇa*’ are not synonymous (Skilling, 2010, p. 39).

The canons of several early Buddhist schools, including the Theravāda Pāli canon, are essentially closed, stable canons, which provide a sense of coherence and completeness to their interpretations (Collins, 1990, p. 91; Berkwitz, 2009, p. 37). Contrarily, Mahāyāna canons constitute open, developing entities. This is because Mahāyāna sutras developed over time and exist in different versions, thus reflecting an evolving reading reception. Different reading/textual communities arose around these sutras (Smith, 1993, p. 153; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 2). Whereas for early Buddhist schools, scriptural authority depended on the criteria detailed above, Mahāyāna Buddhism developed inclusive canons built around Indic precedents (Skilling, 2010, p. 1; Zacchetti, 2016, p. 82). Nonetheless, paracanonical and apocryphal texts have also been popular and widely read.

The status of each tradition’s scriptures constitutes a powerful element of their self-identity (Coward, 1992, p. 142). Reading/textual communities compete to promote their own *Dharma*-texts. They structure their practice around these texts, which they also use to categorize all other Buddhist

literature<sup>53</sup> (Coward, 1992, p. 129; Coleman, 2001, p. 46; Hartmann, 2009, p. 104). Altering the canon served particular social and pedagogical functions (Skilling, 2010, p. 38). Although Buddhists were concerned with an accurate, authentic transmission of the teaching, both in form and in content, several schools emerged with distinct canons and versions of scriptures partly the product of differences of interpretation of doctrines and practices, which in turn encouraged the production of further texts (Collins, 1992, p. 124; Wynne, 2004, p. 103; Skilling, 2009, p. 55; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 46; Obadia, 2013, p. 168). Therefore, views on authority and authenticity affect the status of written scripture and reading as means for the transmission of Buddhism (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 3).

This chapter has shown that Buddhists in many traditions view reading as a core practice connected to several stages of the path and as facilitating its transmission. It has developed a theory dependant on the concept of Skilful Means, the Two-Truths doctrine, and the Four Reliances, with the support of the 'Simile of the Raft' and the 'Finger Pointing to the Moon', to justify a place for reading in Buddhism. It has also described how ideas about authenticity, canonicity, and authority affect not only Buddhist identities but also reading practices. As will be developed below, modern Buddhists and Buddhist sympathisers both accept and challenge authority, and develop their own identities, through reading.

### Chapter 3: Reading, reciting, orality

This chapter places reading in the context of earlier and concurrent oral and recitative traditions. It examines the origin of writing and the development of reading in early Buddhist traditions. Finally, it also shows how writing and reading influence the transmission of Buddhism in different contexts.

Buddhism originally developed in an oral/aural context (Sujato and Brahmali, 2013, p. 51). Since the inception of Buddhism, and for a period of three to four centuries, knowledge and texts were composed, preserved, and transmitted orally (Collins, 1990, p. 95; Allon, 1997, p. 3). Texts were memorized and expounded through recitation (McDermott, 1984, p. 23). Oral compositions were designed to facilitate memorization and recitation (Gethin, 1992, p. 149; Anālayo, 2007, p. 5). This tradition, still alive throughout Buddhist cultures, coexisted and interacted with manuscript cultures (Goody, 1968, p. 12; Bechert, 1992, p. 53; Skilling, 2004, p. 84; Shaw, 2009, p. 126).

Texts were later written down to ensure their preservation<sup>54</sup> (Bechert, 1992, p. 45). Indeed, preservation and transmission were the two main roles monastics played (Gombrich, 1984, p. 77). For the Mahāyāna, writing represented both a method of transmission and preservation and the main factor for its survival (Gombrich, 2005, p. 74). Non-Mahāyāna schools denied the authenticity of these new *sūtras* (Reynolds, 1977, p. 376; McMahan, 1998, p. 252). Despite these preservation efforts, different canonical arrangements and differing sutra versions coexist (Cousins, 2005, p. 97; Hartmann, 2009, p. 95-96; Appleton, 2014, p. 575).

Orally composed texts use repetition as mnemonic device. However, repetition can also be employed as a meditative element in performed and ritual texts (Winternitz, 1972, p.68; Gethin, 2008, xxviii). The emphasis placed on orality and memorization varies by tradition. The advent of writing never fully replaced these practices. Writing and reading merely added another conduit for textual transmission, which in turn created new ritual and devotional practices (Zhiru, 2010, p. 97). Thus, Buddhism remained predominantly an oral tradition (Allen, 1997, p. 3; Gethin, 2008, xvii; Shaw, 2009, p. 129; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 2; Skilling, 2009, p. 71; Collins, 2010, p. 122; Salomon, 2018,

Chap. 3). Early evidence indicates some thought writing/reading inferior to orality as a medium for transmission (Veidlinger, 2006, p. 415). Yet, some *vinaya* include reading as a valid means of transmission for reciting the *Pātimokkha* if no other mean for its performance is available (Schopen, 2014, p. 52-53).

The adoption of writing responds to local traditions. In the Indic context, accurate recitation and exact oral transmission were paramount. Writing and reading were generally distrusted and deemed inferior activities. To this day, memorization is still highly regarded (Ray, 1994, p. 31; Allon, 1997, p. 367; Bronkhorst, 2002, p. 1; Gethin, 2008, xvii; Shaw, 2009, p. 129; Hartmann, 2009, p. 98; Malalasekera, 2013, p. 39). This distrust partly emanates from the fact that literacy facilitates unmediated access to reading (Brooks, 2005, p. 158). Buddhism, however, adapted to new contexts and changing environments by translating and writing down its scriptures. This process facilitated the collection and further development of scripture (Wiegand, 2009, p. 532). The expansion of heterodox religions facilitated the transition from orality to literacy in the Indic context (Gupta, 2013, p. 553).

Writing down scriptures has practical consequences (McMahan, 1998, p. 262). Writing has the advantage of potentially preserving the teaching verbatim (Fischer, 2013, p. 41). Regardless of whether *Dharma*-texts are orally composed or written, their recitation/reading must be easy and aesthetically pleasant (Mizuno, 1982, p. 18). Moreover, writing facilitates analysis, reflection, and discussion, tasks which are not readily available in purely oral contexts. Thus, writing furthers the creation of commentarial literature meant for reference, exegesis, or debate, rather than just for recitation or performance (Anderson, 1999, p. 125; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 105).

In addition to oral, communal recitation conducted in pedagogical, ritual, or ceremonial contexts, writing enables individual, private recitation/reading. However, neither early texts nor religious specialists charged with preserving the scriptures contemplated this scenario (Smart, 1996, p. 106). Access to reading material partly contributed to the dissolution of the *bhāṇaka* or reciters institution (Bowden, 2009, p. 161). However, transmitting and translating scripture has been a constant in

Buddhist history and a key factor of modern Buddhist revivals (Smart, 1996, p. 125). Access to written materials, particularly printed matter, facilitates the dissemination of ideas and critical reflection, which in turn affects practice (Smart, 1996, p. 286).

## Early Buddhism

Early texts contain ‘pleasing and agreeable’ monastics who have heard much,<sup>55</sup> engaged in conversation, and preached (A iii 262; Rahula, 1966, p. 288). After the Buddha’s death, monastics convened several councils to ascertain the authenticity of the teachings. As a result, differing canons were created. These were transmitted orally via the *Dharma*-reciters (*Dhammabhāṇaka*) institution<sup>56</sup> for centuries (Adikaram, 1946, p. 24-32; Allon, 1997, p. 2-3; McQueen, 2005, p. 331; Gummer, 2012, p. 139; Frasch, 2013; Shaw, 2015, p. 427). By then, settled monasticism had developed to preserve and transmit the scriptures, among other duties (Ray, 1994, p. 31). A monastic path centred around learning, preserving, and transmitting scripture (*pariyatti*) frames writing and reading practices (Adikaram, 1946, p. 78). In this context, writing was for the purpose of preservation, reading reserved for public recitation and instruction, not for private reading (McMahan, 1998, p. 253).

The use of writing for recording Buddhist scriptures establishes *a terminus post quem* for reading. Due to famine, war, and the decline of the *Dharma*-reciters institution, Pāli scriptures were first recorded in Sri Lanka<sup>57</sup> in the first century CE (Mhv 33, 100-101; Dīp 20, 20-21; Law, 1941, p. 9; Adikaranam, 1946, p. 76; Rahula, 1966, p. 158; Gombrich, 2005, p. 80; Berkwitz, 2009, p. 35; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 49; Olson, 2013, p. 33). Prophecies of decline also justified efforts towards preserving the scriptures (Salomon, 2018, Chap. 2). Concurrently, writing appeared in Gandhāra for similar reasons (Salomon, Allchin and Barnard, 1999, p. 164; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 1; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 50; Salomon, 2018, Chap. 3). Following a Sarvastivāda council, a *Dharma*-text was engraved in copper plates in Kashmir in the first century CE (Mizuno, 1982, p. 161). Writing possibly also developed elsewhere contemporaneously (Salomon, 2006, p. 12). The Pāli *Vinaya* lacks references to the writing of *Dharma*-texts. The Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* develops rules concerning writing scripture. This



however never turned into a grand enterprise (Datta, 1960, p. 15; Schopen, 1997, p. 582). The second-century *Divyāvadāna* also mention reading and writing.<sup>58</sup> Prior to this, although *Vinaya*,<sup>59</sup> *Jātaka*,<sup>60</sup> *Udāna*,<sup>61</sup> and *Milindapañha*<sup>62</sup> mention texts and writing, the use of writing to preserve religious literature appears unlikely (Allon, 1997, p. 1; Norman, 1997, p. 41; Griffiths, 1999, p. 38; Gombrich, 2005, p. 79; Sujato and Brahmali, 2013, p. 31-32; Malalasekera, 2013, p. 39).

Presumably writing, copying, and reading *Dharma*-texts existed before these complete projects occurred (Mizuno, 1982, p. 161; Norman, 1997, p. 81-82). An Aśokan inscription (third century BCE) identifies seven texts known by title, whose existence implies the first known 'reading' list (Bloch, 1950, p. 154-155; Datta, 1960, p. 14; Winternitz, 1972, p. 607; Lamotte, 1988, p. 234; Wynne, 2004, p. 119; Skilling, 2009, p. 63; Collins, 1992, p. 122-123). By the fourth century, books had become more predominant (Bronkhorst, 2002, p. 20; Apple, 2014, p. 43). The existence of Mahāyāna *sūtra* compilations<sup>63</sup> suggests many *sūtras* circulated widely in written form (Lopez, 1995c, p. 24; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 121).

With the advent of reading as practice, handbooks for reading might have been produced. One such example is Dānaśīla's *Pustakapāthopāya* ('Means of reading a book') (Datta, 1960, p. 30). The existence of such manuals suggests the extent to which reading had been integrated as a Buddhist practice.

This chapter has shown several attitudes towards writing and reading found amongst early Buddhist schools. It has emphasized the oral character of the earliest Buddhist literature and the relevance of orality in the transmission of the Buddhist dispensation. It has also established a context that enabled the writing down of Buddhist literature and has outlined some of the effects writing had amongst the earliest Buddhist schools.

Although an analysis of these early attitudes is beyond the scope of this dissertation, the following chapter offers a historical overview of reading in Buddhism and surveys reading in different geographical settings to show how various traditions have defined reading and its practice.

## Chapter 4: Multiple perspectives of reading in Buddhist traditions

This chapter surveys the various ways some Buddhist traditions have defined, adapted, and sometimes praised or condemned reading as a path of practice.

### Theravāda Buddhism

Buddhaghōṣa, a fifth-century erudite scholar known for his extensive reading, inaugurated the Pāli commentarial literature (Winternitz, 1972, p. 204). Theravāda commentaries define two non-exclusive tasks: scriptural preservation and meditation (Gombrich, 2005, p. 77). Village-dwelling monastics engaged in book-duty (*ganthadhura*) and teaching (*pariyatti*). Though less important, older monastics and those lacking the intellectual skills necessary for executing scholarly duties primarily practiced meditation (*vipassānadhura*) (Rahula, 1966, p. 159; Carrithers, 1983, p. 141; Tambiah, 1984, p. 53). However, anthropological data suggests many monastic settings disdain scholarly interests and favour meditation and other ascetic practices (Tambiah, 1984, p. 148).

Theravāda monastic institutions developed practical canons<sup>64</sup> in several vernacular languages and scripts (Blackburn, 1999b, p. 281; Berkwitz, 2009, p. 39; Appleton, 2014, p. 579). Pāli, as prestige language, is used for recitation while vernaculars are honoured as languages of instruction (McDaniel, 2009, p. 125).

The colophons of Sri Lankan manuscripts describe the benefits of hearing/reading *Dharma*-texts: reading has a physical and moral transformative effect, develops wisdom, and brings good fortune (Berkwitz, 2009, p. 43-44). Indeed, listening/reading to *Dharma*-texts constitutes one of the ten wholesome actions (Crosby, 2014, p. 119).

### Mahāyāna Buddhism

The Mahāyāna produced new *sūtras* considered inspired speech (*pratibhāna*) as well as *Buddhavacana* (Harrison, 2003, p. 124; McQueen, 2005, p. 312). However, earlier schools discouraged

their reading since they could count only as poetry, but not as *Buddhavacana* (Mizuno, 1982, p. 125; McQueen, 2005, p. 314).

Mahāyāna *sūtras* were also stylistically different from earlier sutras (McMahan, 1998, p. 249). Whereas earlier *sūtras* display stylistic traits aimed at facilitating their memorisation and recitation, Mahāyāna *sūtras* use hyperbole and imagery as a way to engage new audiences. They use direct address, assume the presence of listeners/readers, and discuss reading. This immerses Mahāyāna literature largely within an oral culture where transmission was rarely exclusively oral (McMahan, 1998, p. 251; Cole, 2005, p. 14; Flores, 2008, p. 14; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 2; Drewes, 2011, p. 362; Montgomery *et al.*, 2013, p. 188-189).

Regarding content, some Mahāyāna scriptures read as guides to meditation and visualization, which adds a performative element to the practice (Cleary, 1993, p. 50; Harrison, 2003, p. 122; Williams, 2009, p. 45). This contrasts with compositions in Theravāda contexts, where oral preaching was the main performative aspect (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 55).

As to authority, each Mahāyāna *sūtra* claims a unique position within the Buddhist teaching and legitimizes its worship. This self-referential attitude justifies several cults revolving around specific texts (Smith, 1993, p. 6; De Simini, 2016, p. 2). Each of these cults claims their *sūtra* is a complete, authoritative path of practice which can be fully grasped and experienced through *sūtra* reading and worship<sup>65</sup> (Cole, 2005, p. 2).

As writing was becoming a cultural tool in India, it also became one of the main means for disseminating and establishing Mahāyāna Buddhism (McMahan, 1998, p. 254-255; Gombrich, 2005; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 77). Mahāyāna *sūtras* still praised memorization and its virtues, but adapted its uses and functions to include a cultic, ritual dimension, and assign roles to the laity (McMahan, 1998, p. 273; Skilling, 2009, p. 72).

Mahāyāna favours communal, aloud reading, rather than solitary, silent reading, possibly as a form of chanting or psalmody to aid memorization (Williams, 2009, p. 45; Zürcher, 2013, p. 334).

## **Tantra**

A new genre of *Dharma*-texts containing its own strategies of legitimization, Tantras form an open-ended, incomplete canon transmitted in secret (Davidson, 2002, p. 241; Gray, 2009, p. 1). Tantras are revealed in dreams, rituals, or meditations (Gray, 2009, p. 16, 22). Some Tantras stipulate the reading of *Prajñāpāramitā* literature and ritual actions and initiations for all aspirants to Enlightenment (Winternitz, 1972, p. 390). Some Tantras are allegedly hidden in rock formations and caves, which became pilgrimage sites over time (Elliot, Diemberger and Clemente, 2014, p. 16). Consonant with the *terma* tradition, Tantric revelations might have textual precedents in earlier Mahāyāna literature<sup>66</sup> (Harrison, 2003, p. 124; Williams, 2009, p. 40). Reading Tantra is restricted to adepts initiated in its practice and prohibited to the rest (Rambelli, 2006, p. 55; Yoeli-Tlalim, 2009, p. 420). Even seeing a copy of a Tantric text is forbidden without initiation.<sup>67</sup> Thus, most Tantras remain ontologically unreadable since they exist somewhere inaccessible to most until revealed. Esoteric Theravāda traditions partly participate in this secrecy. For instance, Cambodian *achar/grū* (meditation teachers) in the *borān kammaṭṭhāna* tradition would carry meditation manuals with them that only they would access and use to corroborate the meditation attainments of their disciples (Crosby, 2020, p. 72).

## **Tibetan Buddhism**

Tibetan Buddhist observances comprise several forms of verbalized religion, including writing and reading (Ekvall, 1964, p. 55, 98; Van Schaik, 2016, p. 4). Tibetans treat all writing with reverence (Elliot, Diemberger and Clemente, 2014a, p. 47). Schaeffer (2014, vii) defines Tibet as a culture of the book. Shuchen, the eighteenth-century editor of the Dergé Tengyur, lists ten scholarly practices integral to the path, including listening, reading, and reciting texts (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 142). Reading follows a practical pedagogy comprising liturgical, ritual, and meditational texts, canonical reading being of secondary importance (Kapstein, 2000, p. 78). Canonical collections, representing the presence of the

*Dharma*, surround Tibetan and Bhutanese altars (Kapstein, 2000, p. 237; Rigyal and Prude, 2017, p. 67).

### **Reading-transmission**

Reading-permissions or reading-transmissions (*lung*) are a characteristic element within Tibetan Buddhism.<sup>68</sup> Used to formalize a teacher-student relationship, occasionally reading-transmissions are given simultaneously to many people,<sup>69</sup> or are given by *dākinī*<sup>70</sup> (Rheingang, 2010, p. 282; Van Schaik, 2016, p. 29). Reading-transmissions consist of a teacher reading a text aloud,<sup>71</sup> thereby authorizing a student to study a restricted text while also showing how to understand it by giving its accompanying oral instructions<sup>72</sup> (Harvey, 2013, p. 207, 348). This liberating instruction should be accompanied by empowerments by a qualified master. Practice guides sometimes also accompany the oral instructions (Padmakara Translation Group, 1994, xxxv). Receiving a reading-transmission situates a practitioner within a legitimate transmission lineage (Kim, 2013, p. 247; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 2; Van Schaik, 2016, p. 5; Khandro, 2020). Reading from the physical script is *conditio sine qua non* for an effective transmission, as well as listening to the sound of those words, since these implicitly contain the guru's blessing (Urgyen Rinpoche, in Kungsang, 1994, p. 18; Khandro, 2020). Reading-transmissions ensure the accurate transference of form and content, particularly important if mantras and other formulas are written in Sanskrit. A reading-based transmission without a qualified teacher's oral instruction implies the end of genuine practice (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 1). Reading-transmissions, and the authority derived from them, thus depend on the presence of teacher, teaching, student, reading, and the manuscript which symbolises the teaching. Hence, reading without having acquired the prerequisites is deemed useless and possibly dangerous (Bretfeld, 2007, p. 355; Khandro, 2020).

Related to this, in Zen contexts, copies of certain *sūtras*, like the *Platform Sūtra*, functioned as transmission documents indicating that one belonged to a particular school, namely the Huineng's school (Schlütter, 2017, p. 436). It also meant that one had read enough, the text becoming a symbol of one's status along the Path (Rambelli, 2006, p. 55).

## Terma

*Terma* (treasure-texts) are texts concealed by the eight-century yogi Padmasambhāva and his consort Yeshe Tsogyal in secret locations awaiting their discovery by treasure-finders (*tertöns*) (Dorje, 2006, xli). Their discovery requires faith, merit, another *terma*, a teacher's instruction, or instructions written in guides to these locations (Clemente, 2014, p. 57). Padmasambhāva grants reading-permissions and empowerments to *tertöns* directly (Urgyen Rinpoche, in Kungsang, 1994, p. 16). The concealment of texts has precedents in India and China (Dorje, 2006, xli). *Dharma*-texts can also suddenly appear<sup>73</sup> (BA, p. 38-39; Steinkellner, 2004, p. 7; Apple, 2014, p. 4). Texts others than *terma* are also hidden to avoid their disappearance.<sup>74</sup>

## Mongolian Buddhism

*Dharma*-texts entered Mongolia with the introduction of Tibetan Buddhism. Due to Mongolian paper production, *Dharma*-volumes proliferated in the seventeenth century (Wallace, 2009a, p. 83). Originally, texts were copied in Tibetan, which only a few could read (Wallace, 2009a, p. 86). Besides canonical collections, abridged, easy to carry textual collections in Tibetan, Mongolian and/or Manchu were produced to suit nomadic lifestyles (Wallace, 2009a, p. 78-79).

## Chinese Buddhism

Chinese Buddhism encouraged copying, translating, reading, and collecting *Dharma*-texts (Mizuno, 1982, p. 57; Edgren, 2009, p. 101; Edgren, 2013, p. 575). Different book formats were produced to enhance the reading experience (Drègue, 1991, p. 90-91; Edgren, 2013, p. 577). Growing numbers of readers, publishers, and booksellers implied the production of *Tripitaka* editions for general consumption, as well as new works, reading digests, and anthologies for the general public, which became sourcebooks for reading/reciting (Mizuno, 1982, p. 94, 147; Smith, 1993, p. 160; Edgren, 2013, p. 584).

## Japanese Buddhism

From China and Korea, Buddhism entered Japan through the transmission and copying of texts (Kornicki, 2009, p. 111). Scriptures in Japan kept the original Chinese and were read/recited using the traditional Chinese pronunciation (Smith, 1993, p. 156). This meant that reading for understanding was the domain of a few intellectuals and trained monastics until later in Japanese history (Tanabe, 2004, p. 137).

## Vietnamese Buddhism

In Vietnam, as in Korea, Chinese remained the main canonical language (McHale, 2004, p. 149). Whereas reading was reserved for a few educated intellectuals, most accessed Buddhist knowledge via vernacular works and sermons. From the seventeenth century, printing presses produced works on history, philosophy, Zen and Pure Land *Sūtras*, and magazines, initially still in Chinese, but increasingly in Vietnamese from the 1920s (McHale, 2004, p. 151, 153-154).

## Ch'an/Zen

Both Zen monastics and the laity engage in *sūtra*-recitation/reading daily<sup>75</sup> (Mohr, 2000, p. 256; Welter, 2008; Joskovich, 2019, p. 53). However, some Zen literature questions the authority of scriptures and undermines merit-making textual and ritual practices involving texts and readings as they reify both *Dharma* and Buddha (Wright, 1998, p. 30). This aniconic, apophatic attitude, based on some Buddhist and Taoist precedents, emphasizes direct experience and sudden enlightenment, and disparages overreliance on texts for practice and transmission<sup>76</sup> (Levering, 1989b, p. 63; Bielefeldt, 1992, p. 490; Heine and Wright, 2004, p. 3; Heine, 2008, p. 38; Flores, 2008, p. 121, 126; Heller, 2009, p. 111; Joskovich, 2019, p. 54). As a special transmission outside the scriptures,<sup>77</sup> Zen anti-scripturalism saw some Zen masters destroying,<sup>78</sup> discarding,<sup>79</sup> and abusing scriptures (Heine and Wright, 2004, p. 3; Joskovich, 2019, p. 54). Dōgen believes that this attitude is regrettable<sup>80</sup> as *sūtra*-reading implies accessing the transmission of the Patriarchs (Sbgz. 3 Bukkyo).

Paradoxically, reverence for the biography and teachings of Zen masters popularised and reformulated reading<sup>81</sup> by monastics and the laity as education or enjoyment (Smith, 1993, p. 154; Wright, 1998, p. 21; Wright, 2003, p. 267; Welter, 2004, p. 198; Heller, 2009, p. 122). Reading became a means to receive transmission directly from a Patriarch's heart/mind (Hori, 2006, p. 205). Additionally, Zen has created not only new literary genres (*kōan*, commentaries, recorded sayings,<sup>82</sup> letters, Zen phrase books), but also the largest scriptural canon in East Asia (Wright, 2003, p. 261, 263; Heine and Wright, 2004, p. 4; Heine, 2008, p. 37).

Zen transmission, particularly via *kōan*<sup>83</sup> and poetry,<sup>84</sup> requires the use of rhetoric and figurative speech<sup>85</sup> for its transmission (Wright, 1998, p. 22; Flores, 2008, p. 126; Heine, 2016 p. 349). To this end, Zen employs language and literary devices to overturn readers' expectations and experiences (Heine, 2016, p. 354). An analysis of the content of Zen literature also shows that, far from being purely the produce of a master's enlightened mind, as it is often claimed, it draws material from folk stories, hagiographies, and other Buddhist literature, among other material<sup>86</sup> (Berling, 1987, p. 71; Cole, 2005, p. 23; Flores, 2008, p. 129). Its inclusion in canonical collections expanded the definition of scripture (Heller, 2009, p. 112).

For understanding, Zen recommends the study of *sūtras*<sup>87</sup> (Mumon, 2004, 30). However, Zen denies ultimate wisdom can be obtained from this (Mizuno, 1982, p. 145; Mohr, 2000, p. 263). As practice, however, Zen monastics engage in *sūtra* recitals, 'turning texts', and reading the entire canon (Wright, 2003, p. 264-265).

Reading in Zen becomes a form of meditation. While reading, readers negotiate their place in the text, respond to it, imitate teachers and patriarchs, and place themselves within the tradition<sup>88</sup> (Wright, 2006, p. 6-7). For Zen readers, reading is also an expression of their mastery.<sup>89</sup> *Kōan* reading, for instance, constitutes a conduit for experiencing language *samādhi* (Sekida, 1985, p. 99). Thus, some Zen masters encouraged the reading of collections such as *Wu-men kuan* (Shūdō, 2004, p. 207-208).



## Dōgen

For Dōgen, *sūtra*-reading leads to understanding of Buddhist doctrines and to faith in Buddha and *Dharma* (Harvey, 2013, p. 232). Dōgen instructs reading for the benefit of sponsors and for merit-making purposes. Reading can be done silently, aloud, or by ‘turning’ pages and/or libraries (Griffith Foulk, 2006, p. 143).

Dōgen repeats that through reading alone, however, ultimate truth cannot be obtained (Nishijima and Cross, 1994, p. 261; 1997, p. 85). Dōgen argues that contemplating nature, the ‘realization of the words of eternal buddhas’ is no different than reading *Sūtras* (Sbgz. 1 Sansuigyo 175; Nishijima and Cross, 1994, p. 167). Thus, Dōgen expands the definition of *sūtra* to include the whole universe, equated here with the *Dharmakāya* (Sbgz. 1 Kankin; Nishijima and Cross, 1994, p. 261; Sbgz. 3 Bukkyo 23; Sbgz. 4 Jisho-zanmai 82). For the truth of the practice is in the reading act itself, not in the content of what is read:<sup>90</sup> reading is for the purpose of expressing Buddha-nature, not for the attainment of Buddhahood (Humphreis, 1999, xvii, 41; Joskovich, 2019, p. 61).

## Pure Land Buddhism

Reading as spiritual practice of Pure Land texts constitutes a performative act (Williams, 2009, p. 40). In Pure Land Buddhism, reading transforms readers as a form of grace (Wright, 2003, p. 270). This contrasts with the Ch’an/Zen self-power attitude towards reading as meditation, where its efficiency depends on the reader.

## Nichiren Buddhism

Besides faith and chanting practice, Nichiren-inspired Buddhisms recommend reading to understand Nichiren’s teachings (Causton, 1988, p. 243). Nichiren’s letters and treatises (*Gosho*) are the object of non-academic reading. The *Gosho* is read in lectures and courses, and in daily practice, where it can be read one line or phrase a day (Causton, 1988, p. 264-265).

This chapter has offered an overview of how different Buddhist traditions have regarded reading as it acquired roles within ceremonial, ritual, pedagogical, and merit-making contexts. ‘Appendix A: Merit, cults, and pedagogies’ describes some of these roles in detail. Buddhist texts appear in a number of supports, from rock carving, to manuscripts and printed books, to electronic formats and digital platforms. In particular, electronic and digital resources not only facilitate access to reading material but also open up new ways of reading texts and produce new forms of merit-making activities involving texts and reading. ‘Appendix B: Merit, copying, and preserving *Dharma*-texts’ offers a fuller account of reading formats and typologies.

The following chapter explores reading in modern Buddhism and the reception of Buddhist texts by contemporary readers. It first presents reading in the context of Asian Buddhist revivals and the transmission of Buddhism to the West. It then examines the role of reading in terms of conversion to Buddhism and as an element of knowledge and practice of Buddhism in contemporary settings.

## Chapter 5: Buddhist revivals and modern contexts

This chapter examines the role reading played in nineteenth and twentieth-century Buddhist revivals. It also surveys the position of reading in the transmission of Buddhism to the West. Lastly, it reviews the modes of reception of Buddhist literature and the place reading occupies for modern Buddhists.

### Buddhist revivals

Throughout its history, Buddhism has spread through texts and reading. Particularly since the nineteenth century, texts and reading have been used to revive Buddhist practice and to counteract and compete with other religions (Smart, 1996, p. 286). In some places, like Sri Lanka or Vietnam, colonial authorities thought monastics had neglected their scriptural duties since many appeared to be illiterate. In response, and sometimes motivated by the laity, Buddhism encouraged the production and dissemination of *Dharma*-texts (Malalgoda, 1976, p. 27; Zürcher, 1984, p. 211; McHale, 2004, p. 145-146). By emphasizing textual duties, however, other practices and esoteric traditions were neglected (Thompson, 2017, p. 245).

Several nineteenth-century *sūtra* anthologies were compiled and distributed emulating the model of Christian Bibles in Japan and Sri Lanka (Bond, 1988, p. 119; Wilkinson and Friedrich, 2017). The Theravāda promoted its revival by emphasizing the authority of the Pāli canon. This is somewhat paradoxical considering the currency of practical canons in the pedagogies of Theravāda Buddhism throughout history (Collins, 1994, p. 102-103). Anagārika Dharmapāla (1864-1933), inspired by his reading of pioneer Western titles like Olcott's *Buddhist Catechism* (1881),<sup>91</sup> promoted the revitalization of Buddhism in Sri Lanka. Olcott's book is still popular in Sri Lanka (McMahan, 2008, p. 99).

Nineteenth-century revivalist and reformist Buddhist movements are characterised by scripturalism, rationalism, individualism, and universalism, among other traits consonant with Westernising tendencies of Buddhist modernism (Tambiah, 1976, p. 208; Bond, 1988, p. 35; Hanse, 2007, p. 2;

Proceski, 2017, p. 85). Scripturalism is characterized by a normalization of the monastic curriculum, a return to canonical texts and languages, and the production and dissemination of scripture, among other factors (Tambiah, 1976, p. 211-212).

Scripturalism and modernism form the basis of most contemporary Buddhist education (Tikhonov, 2017, p. 519, 521). Scripturalism also brought about the translation of scripture into vernacular languages<sup>92</sup> so that 'everyone could read, understand, and follow the Buddhist way' (McHale, 2004, p. 159; Scott, 2013, p. 32; Thompson, 2017, p. 246). It also encouraged the reading of English texts and translations among educated elites (Bond, 1988, p. 80; Gombrich, 2006a, p. 173; Hansen, 2007, p. 143; Huh, 2010, p. 25; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 173).

This emphasis on reading moved knowledge transmission further from mainly an oral transmission to a reading-based transmission (McHale, 2004, p. 171; Scott, 2013, p. 32). These dissemination efforts also encouraged the production of scholarly works on lexicography and textual study, among others genres, which furthered the academic interest on Buddhism, as well as the publication of works by contemporary monastics and periodicals, many of which included articles translated from foreign languages (Scott, 2013, p. 39; Soucy, 2017, p. 186; Poceski, 2017, p. 90).

## **Buddhism in the West**

Buddhism was first introduced in the West principally as a textual tradition (Almond, 1988, p. 33; Baumann, 1994; Lopez, 1995a, p. 7; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 8; Obadia, 2013, p. 165; Cheah, 2017, p. 329). These first texts catered to Western audiences, and often lacked accuracy (Coleman, 2001, p. 7; Kasulis, 2007, p. 42-43). These texts, full of Western stereotypes of Asian cultures, betrayed a European Protestant focus on texts and rational/scientific explanations proper of Orientalized, Protestant Buddhisms (Goldberg, 1999, p. 344-345; Snodgrass, 2009, p. 49; Falk, 2011).<sup>93</sup> They form a hybrid tradition amply drawing from the European Enlightenment, Romanticism, and Transcendentalism, among other sources<sup>94</sup> (McMahan, 2008, p. 5).

Literary popularisers helped create a sense of Buddhist identity in its readers (Whalen-Bridge and Storhoff, 2009, p. 2-3). They presented a Buddhism without reference to mythology, ritual, or tradition, largely using psychological terms for a wide non-specialist reading public (Almond, 1988, p. 34; Baumann and Prebish, 2002, p. 3; McMahan, 2002, p. 219; McMahan, 2008, p. 42).

The popularity of these texts was also felt in Asia, where they were published and translated into many languages (Nathan, 2017, p. 113). One such text is Carus' *The Gospel of Buddha* (1894), once read for edification in Sri Lanka and Japan (Winternitz, 1972, p. 422). However, Asian Buddhism showed modernising and scripturalist trends already before colonization, and modern, new Buddhism responds to global trends and movements in relation to exclusive local settings (McMahan, 2008, p. 6; Foxeus, 2017, p. 213).

Buddhism has aligned with several therapies by emphasizing individualism through a psychologizing<sup>95</sup> process (Illouz, 2008, p. 2-3). This has produced a number of therapy-like, self-help approaches and publications, often providing 'commodified quick-fix advice' (Illouz, 2008, p. 13-14).

Modern Buddhism has created new forms of reading. Modern Buddhists and sympathisers favour written texts (and increasingly audiobooks, podcasts, and a range of other formats) and solitary, silent reading. Given the popularity and availability of *Dharma*-texts, that type of reading is now felt across the Buddhist world (Smith, 1993, p. 165). Preference for book reading over ritual chanting is also observed in some Asian traditions transplanted to the West (Coward, 1986, p. 302).

Popular monastic figures and international bestsellers like Thich Nhat Hanh, Deshimaru, or the Dalai Lama reinterpret traditional Buddhism for these new audiences (Obadia, 2013, p. 179). This partly results in the Westernization of Buddhism and the selection and adaptation of some doctrines. Western publications are often commentarial or popularising works based on historical or Asian *Dharma*-texts or scripture simplified for general consumption (Obadia, 2013, p. 175-176). Due to globalization, these reinterpretations have become normative across the Buddhist world (Konik, 2009, p. 10). Zen popularisers have transplanted an anti-scholastic, anti-intellectualist streak of Zen

literature consonant with Western countercultures (Segdwick, 2005, p. 179). This has partly produced an intellectualised version of Buddhism which neglects ritual and popular forms of practice and emphasizes rationality, meditation, and compatibility with science (McMahan, 2008, p. 7; Obadia, 2013, p. 172).

Western *Dharma* practitioners feel freer to organise their own reading due to a more democratic access to education in the West (Obadia, 2013, p. 177). Modernists and modern Western practitioners are generally self-conscious, well-off, well-educated, middle-class, more liberal and respectful of diversity, less committed to organised religion, and more inclined toward exploring spirituality through meditation and reading (Coleman, 1999, p. 95; Coleman, 2001, p. 20; Bluck, 2006, p. 190; Tamney, 2008, p. 226, 228-229, 232). Given its commodification, Buddhism is most visible as a form of elitist practice, requiring access to resources and time to read, acquire equipment, or attend lectures and retreats (Nattier, 1997, p. 79-80).

### **You cannot learn Buddhism from a book**

A frequent trope asserts that Buddhism cannot be learnt from a book<sup>96</sup> and that practitioners always require the guidance of a teacher<sup>97</sup> (Bell, 2002, p. 230). This partly contradicts historical evidence indicating that, histories of Buddhism, biographies, meditation manuals,<sup>98</sup> and descriptions of the path were immensely popular and were in many cases considered definitive instruction handbooks (Goonatilake, 2000, p. 38-39; McMahan, 2008, p. 185). For instance, the *Visuddhimagga* is considered by the mainstream Theravāda tradition both a reference work and a detailed meditation manual<sup>99</sup> (Carrithers, 1983, p. 46). Contemporary meditation handbooks for Western practitioners serve the same purpose<sup>100</sup> (Brahm, 2006b, p. 4). However, meditation and practice manuals in esoteric transmission lineages served as memory-aids to practical instructions rather than explicit meditation manuals. This made these documents impossible to read for narrative instruction, which in that context could only and fully be supplied by a teacher (Crosby, 2020, p. 71).

These assertions emphasize practice and direct experience<sup>101</sup> over book learning. This overemphasis on experience, partly produced by revivalist and reformist Asian movements and Western transformations, is not necessarily corroborated by ethnographic and historical data (Sharf, 1995).

This trope appears frequently in Western Zen.<sup>102</sup> However, some of the same books expressing these ideas often also recount, and praise, the benefits of reading.<sup>103</sup> More balanced positions, however, recommend abandoning unwholesome, unhelpful, indiscriminate reading of, for instance, novels, newspapers, or magazines, among other unsuitable material<sup>104</sup> (Kapleau, 2000b, p. 24).

Statistical data indicates that most Western Buddhists frequently or occasionally read about Buddhism, with only under five percent rarely or never reading about Buddhism (Coleman, 1999, p. 97). This means that most Western Buddhists base or complement their practice with reading.

This section has shown that texts and reading have a far-ranging effect in contemporary Buddhist transmission and practice. Reading *Dharma*-texts, practice manuals, and other Buddhist-related literature is commonplace for Buddhist practitioners, Buddhist sympathizers, and spiritual seekers. Reading, once reserved for a privileged few with the skills and means necessary willing to engage with its practice, has now possibly become, together with podcasts, audiobooks, and other media, the primary means by which Buddhism is not only transmitted, but, to a certain extent, also sustained.

### **Conversion and affiliation**

Several generations of readers and Buddhists in the West have been influenced and converted to Buddhist practice through reading. This section explores some of the issues around conversion and affiliation to Buddhism in relation to reading.

Reading is a means of gaining knowledge of one's own religion, but also of 'encountering the religious "other"' (Paloutzian, 1996, p. 19-20; Roland, 2012, p. 341). Each time a text is heard/read constitutes an opportunity for conversion. Conversion denotes 'a change towards more religious belief,

behaviour, or commitment' (Argyle, 2000, p. 19). This could happen without an individual participating or affiliating to any organised group (Lowenthal, 2000, p. 47).

Conversion, either sudden or gradual, could result from reading/hearing<sup>105</sup> (Waples, Berelson and Bradshaw, 1940, p. 13, 121). Exposure to a text might produce a gradual shift in identity or belief due to intellectual and cognitive factors following a personal, conscious quest to seek meaning<sup>106</sup> (Paloutzian, 1996, p. 149; Bowman, 2000; Sutcliffe, 2000). This intellectual/cognitive conversion type/motif usually follows a life-changing situation, like an illness or the death of a relative.<sup>107</sup> 'Intellectual' conversion describes learning about a new religion by reading books or attending lectures, among other disembodied means of involvement (Lofland and Skonovd, 1981, p. 376; Rambo, 1993, p. 14, 166; Paloutzian, 1996, p. 158).

This type of self-conversion seems prevalent given the popularity and accessibility of books,<sup>108</sup> websites, and other media (Strauss, 1979, p. 162; Lowenthal, 2000, p. 47; Snook, Williams, and Horgan, 2019, p. 231). Access to spirituality through literature belongs to the mythic/narrative religious dimension (Smart, 1996, p. 163). Several generations of Buddhists in the West can be said to be in fact 'self-converted followers of the teaching' through reading<sup>109</sup> (Baumann, 2002, p. 87).

This is however not just a contemporary phenomenon. There are historical instances of conversion and spiritual transformation through reading.<sup>110</sup> For instance, Tibetan biographies abound with examples of experiences leading to contemplative trances and more committed forms of practice.<sup>111</sup>

For the West, reading once represented an access point for knowledge of Buddhism and perhaps conversion to its practice. Titles like Arnold's *Light of Asia* (1879), Olcott's<sup>112</sup> *Buddhist Catechism* (1881), or Carus' *The Gospel of the Buddha* (1894) had a profound impact in early Western Buddhist readers<sup>113</sup> (Almond, 1988, p. 1; Baumann, 1995, p. 56; Tweed, 2000, p. 46; Obadia, 2013, p. 173).

Reading still represents a means of access to Buddhism, since converts to Buddhism in the West often encounter it through reading (Parker, 2007, p. 31; Tanaka, 2007, p. 122). Converts tend to be 'young,



affluent, liberal, intelligent, and overwhelming white’ (Gordon-Finlayson and Daniels, 2008, p. 101). When reading determines conversion and/or constitutes a central element in someone’s practice, one can be defined as a bookshop Buddhist (Gordon-Finlayson and Daniels, 2008, p. 100). In this sense, bookshop Buddhists could more appropriately be referred to as sympathizers or practitioners (Campergue, 2015, p. 447).

Gordon-Finlayson (2012, p. 171-173) provides some examples of responses to reading as conversion motif. His informants relate how reading about Buddhism was revelatory, bewildering, inspirational, or stimulating. Importantly, some individuals relate how reading about Buddhism confirmed their existing worldview or made them resolute to pursue Buddhist practice (Parker, 2007, p. 95; Gordon-Finlayson, 2012, p. 195-196). Convert Buddhists often prefer easy, accessible *Dharma*-texts, such as the *Dhammapada*, as well as Western, lay commentators, such as Jack Kornfield, Joseph Goldstein, Sharon Salzberg, or Tara Brach, and popular, relatable texts by ordained authors such as Ajahn Chah, Thich Nhat Hanh, the Dalai Lama, or Pema Chödrön, over scripture (Eddy, 2012, p. 35-36). Interestingly, Gordon-Finlayson (2012, p. 162) reports cases of converts to Buddhism whose descriptions of meditation experience resemble what they had read in books, although they claimed to be an inner experience. This shows how the content of what one reads mediates one’s experience of the world.

## **Reception and responses**

Based on the context presented above, the following section examines some issues related to the reading of Buddhist texts by modern Buddhist readers and some of their responses to these texts.

### **Readers and text**

Literary works are actualised and acquire meaning through reading (Eagleton, 1983, p. 74; Ricoeur, 1990, p. 158; Manguel, 2008, p. 113; Zwilling, 2013, p. 209-210). This actualisation also occurs every time a text is remembered, recited, and meditated upon (Collins, 2010, p. 122). The experiences of

readers when reading and after reading confer meaning to the texts. The study of these practices of interpretation constitutes a history of reading (Culler, 1997, p. 63; Chartier, 2002a, p. 48).

Readers adopt at least three strategies when reading religious literature (Flores, 2008, p. 19, 49):

- traditional readers accept all aspects of the text, including its inherent worldview, and can also read texts as literature;
- sympathetic readers accept the content of the text but offer symbolical interpretations;
- recent readers, who, suspicious of the claims made by texts, read texts as literature but often reject any epic, mythical, and dogmatic claims.

Whereas traditional readers accept the claims found in religious texts, suspicious and sceptic readers interpret texts in political, psychological, or other terms. Literary readers are more open than dogmatists or sceptics and appear more flexible in their interpretations (Flores, 2008, p. 29, 49).

The Buddha praises those who accept the *Dharma* in order to practice it rather than those who engage only in its interpretation (M i 145). The Buddha, who disapproves of self-deception and mimicry, also reprimands those monastics who delight in literary works but fail to understand the Dhamma. Thus, skilful readers would be those who read mindfully and understand figurative language in doctrinal terms and who can therefore put the teaching into practice (Flores, 2008, p. 100).

### **Religious reading**

For Griffiths (1999) religions offer comprehensive, unsurpassable, and central accounts of reality. Reading religiously implies obtaining the knowledge necessary to learn that account (Griffith, 1999, p. 40). The main motivation for acquiring reading skills in most contexts is to access religious, mainly ritual, literature (Drewes, 2003, p. 82). Religions employ several literary genres to convey their accounts of reality, doctrines, and practices (Kramer, 1986, p. 11-12).

Religious readers are a type of ideal reader who read/hear, reread, memorize, ponder, comment, anthologize, expound, and embody scriptures (Griffiths, 1999, p. 147). Odiseos (2020) believes that

(...) until we western Buddhists embrace this more immersive way of studying the core texts and teachings of whatever traditions we are in, it will be harder for the *Dharma* to really take root in the soil here, like it has wherever it has gone, taking on its own characteristics reflecting our culture but not budging an inch in its authenticity and potency.

Reading religious literature raises theological as well as ethical issues, as one might be reading on a religion to which one does not subscribe (Barnes, 2011, p. 390). Religious literature expects adherents and non-believers alike to read respectfully and requires a reverential attitude towards what is read (Kramer, 1987, p. 13; Griffiths, 1999, p. 42). Religious literature asks readers to find statements of truth from within texts or from an authority (Adler and Van Doren, 1972, p. 293-294). Besides, religious readers experience a range of aesthetic responses, like joy, while reading (Griffiths, 1999, p. 43).

There is a practice within Western traditions of reading literature, including philosophy, as a spiritual, meditative exercise (Hadot, 1995; Stock, 1998). Reading spiritually requires a mindful, reflective practice whereby readers confront themselves with authors, texts, and other readers in a humble, vulnerable way (Coleman, 2009, p. 39, 60). Thus, reading becomes work on the self and for self-improvement (Bloom, 2000, p. 19, 24; Fischer, 2013, p. 344). Buddhist stories, when read ethically, can have a transformative effect on individuals seeking to understand their own condition and place in the world (McClintock, 2017, p. 185-187).

To lead to enlightenment, reading also needs the right motivation (Humphreis, 1999, p. 80). For instance, Shinran commended those who read bearing Amida's vow in mind (Smith, 1993, p. 167). Using reading as contemplation enables readers to distinguish emotional responses from intellectual responses so that reading becomes not only the object of experience also but the subject of knowledge (Littau, 2006, p. 94, 98). As a spiritual discipline, reading develops qualities consonant with the Buddhist path: alertness, attention, and compassion, among others (Coleman, 2009, p. 125-126). Moreover, literary works, including scripture, can have a liberating effect on readers (Regan, 1998, p. 147).

Although there is no correlation between literacy and spirituality, reading might lead to religious attitudes and engagement, but not constitute the whole of the spiritual life (Coleman, 2009, p. 8, 25). Reading can however lead to confusion<sup>114</sup> and become a hindrance to personal development and spirituality<sup>115</sup> (Vism, iii 29; Smith, 1993, p. 155; Shaw, 2009, p. 89-90). This is because readers might overidentify with characters or action. They might assume mastery, possession,<sup>116</sup> and ideological control over texts. They might also indulge in self-gratification, confuse the practice of reading with the practices described in the text,<sup>117</sup> or reduce the content of the teaching to rules and regulations to be followed literally<sup>118</sup> (Littau, 2006, p. 65, 156; Hawkeye, 2013, p. 44; Flores, 2008, p. 3; Coleman, 2009, p. 45). Readers might also become attached to the teachings (D i 135; Ñāṇamoli and Bodhi, 2001, p. 1209n255) or to the merit and benefit expected from the reading act<sup>119</sup> (Shūdō, 2004, p. 228). Similar caveats can be raised against recitation (Vism 95; Collins, 1992, p. 123).

Religious readers are ideal readers because, as Nichiren and Dōgen recommended, they receive, recreate, and embody the story they read (Kramer, 1987, p. 13; Smith, 1993, p. 167; Eubanks, 2011, p. 180). That story becomes thus part of their experience and memory and so each text becomes autobiographical (Manguel, 2010, p. 151-152). Hence, the end of reading, like the end of practice, is unending (Griffiths, 1999, p. 41; Manguel, 2015, p. 97).

Careful, slow, vocalised reading and rereading aids memorization and deeper understating (Kramer, 1987, p. 12; Griffiths, 1999, p. 51). Religious reading can also be silent and meditational, while being withdrawn from the world (Kramer, 1987, p. 13). Readers recreate the world represented in *Dharma*-texts through rereading (Cole, 2005, p. 13).

Religious reading is opposed to consumerist and critical readings of scripture mainly because critical reading undermines the religious account and the claim to authority made by scripture (Griffiths, 1999, p. 42; Zwilling, 2013, p. 212).

Religious literary genres, like all literary genres, imply norms and expectations for their composition and reading (Berling, 1987, p. 58-59). The analysis of these genres thus gives indication as to their readership and the limits of their interpretation.

### Reading literature

Several scholars have analysed Buddhist literature from a literary perspective.<sup>120</sup> The Buddha, like later authors, used metaphors, similes, analogies, and other rhetorical devices (Gombrich, 2006b, p. 65-95). The need to adapt a teaching to its audience justifies the use of these devices. Thus, through skilful means, audiences are brought to the *Dharma* by both the content and the style of sermons (Chaturvedi, 2010, p. 74).

Reading religiously imposes certain parameters, like faith, devotion, instruction, or authority, which might limit textual interpretation. However, reading *Dharma*-texts as literature might free readers from these constraints. As Flores (2008, p. 9) puts it:

More than those who are committed to the doctrine, those who read Buddhist scriptures as literature may read freely and creatively, since they temporarily suspend disbelief, or indeed belief on the text's solicitations. They read with due respect, but less piously, less pedantically, and more playfully, more critically. Reading the texts as literature allows and encourages readers to imagine and speculate—in ways which dogmatists or scholars may disdain—about the existential pathos behind the texts' formulaic repetitions.

Most readers/hearers have become acquainted with the doctrinal content of Buddhism through sermons, stories, and chants, many of a narrative, poetical, and literary character (Appleton, 2014, p. 581). Thus, reading Buddhist literature *qua* literature offers some parameters of interpretation to understand reading *Dharma*-texts.

However, reading *Dharma*-texts only as literature might produce misunderstandings about the contexts where sermons originated and the purpose for their transmission.<sup>121</sup> When reading *Dharma*-texts as works of imagination, readers might access the aesthetic dimension of texts and disregard the truth statements and religious accounts proposed by these texts (Adler and Van Doren, 1972, p. 205).

In fact, Brehm (2017, p. 188) encourages poetry readers to focus on noticing with mindfulness rather than analysing and interpreting. Brehm (2021, p. 11-13) however suggests poetry can guide readers in their spiritual practice, serve as spiritual exemplars and teachers, and be beneficial in developing qualities, like awareness or nonduality, consonant with some aspects of the Buddhist path.

Certain Buddhist traditions also regulate the reading of non-Buddhist literature. For instance, the precept to refrain from entertainment is understood to mean that some genres, for instance, romantic novels or thrillers make unsuitable reading material (Bell, 1991, p. 278). However, some of this type of literature has occasionally been read *qua* Buddhist literature. For example, Hesse's *Siddhartha* or Rampa's *The Third Eye* and its sequels,<sup>122</sup> among others, have enjoyed great popularity.<sup>123</sup>

### **Religious experiences**

There are numerous cases of religious and enlightenment experiences produced by reading.<sup>124</sup> These usually occur either while reading,<sup>125</sup> forming in one's mind<sup>126</sup> and producing trances,<sup>127</sup> or after reading, producing a transformation<sup>128</sup> (Goodell, 2008, p. 94-95). The authenticity of these experiences requires corroboration from scriptural authority<sup>129</sup> and/or a teacher's approval<sup>130</sup> (Sbgz. 3 Menju 186). By experiencing a realization by reading, one can be said to be born directly from the Buddha's mouth (Abé, 2005, p. 301).

### **Modernity, secularism, globalization**

Buddhist religious readers, Buddhist sympathisers, and Buddhist literature *qua* literature readers inhabit modern, literate societies that assume private study and silent reading as the most efficient means to acquire knowledge (Graham, 1986, p. 23). Books as commodities and readers as consumers constitute signs of this modernity (Towheed, 2011, p. 4; Frost, 2011, p. 29; Fischer, 2013, p. 295). Their cheapness and availability in bookshops, temples, train stations, or online and electronic environments, stimulates literacy, but also turns reading into a more undetermined, anonymous practice (Raven, 2015, p. 143; Scott, R., 2017, p. 202). Buddhist organizations embrace media technologies to disseminate Buddhism and promote themselves (Grieve and Veidlinger, 2017). Hence,

some Buddhist books and literature participate in the commodification of the religion and its practice (Coleman, 2009, p. 27). For Borup (2016, p. 141):

Buddhism has been transformed from an intellectual capital and practice path for the elite to an easily approachable mindset for the masses in which consumerism, commodification, and mediatization are part of the neo-liberal market where spirituality is for sale.

Commodification, syncretism, adaptability, individualism, and susceptibility to trends characterize Buddhist modernism (Smart, 1996, p. 59-60; Cox, 2017, p. 340). Indeed, individualisation, privatization, self-identity, optimism, subjectivity, suspicion of authority, and religious fluidity describe contemporary spiritual practice, or self-religion (Tweed, 2000, xxxvi; York, 2001, p. 366; Beckfort, 2003, p. 209; Tanaka, 2007, p. 115; McMahan, 2008, p. 188; Hervieu-Léger, 2013, p. 164).

Western and non-Buddhist readers, culturally determined by their own literacy and religious practices, impose their own interpretative parameters onto their Buddhist reading (Elster, 2003, p. 663; Carrette and King, 2005, p. 95). In this context, Buddhism appeals to educated individuals for whom faith operates as a rational reflection consonant with the European Enlightenment: reason, truth, universal validity, and betterment (Heelas, 2005, p. 261). For most of them, Buddhism is consonant with individualism, personal responsibility, and liberal, democratic values, and fosters introspection and scientific knowledge rather than the adoption of doctrines and the practice of rituals (Wynne, 2015, p. 266).

Books, being agents of societal change since the Enlightenment period, are now also a paramount element of consumerism (Certeau, 1988, p. 166-167). In post-Enlightenment contexts, the predominant mode of reading is silent, solitary, informational, and efficient reading detrimental to rhetoric and memorization (Graham, 1986 p. 23). Due to the effect of secularization and print culture, reading scripture remains historically anomalous in this context (Graham, 1986). In this sense, writing and reading represent solitary, disembodied activities which 'throw the psyche back on itself' (Ong, 2012, p. 68).

Consumption might incite addictive, ephemeral types of reading, leading to 'hasty and impressionistic' reading experiences, often for 'self-gratification' and opposed to religious reading (Littau, 2006, p. 43, 48, 156). Consumerist or commodity readers read texts fast and only once. They appreciate texts for their perceived value and discard them after reading (Griffiths, 1999, p. 51, 59; Frost, 2011, p. 31). Nevertheless, commodity readers are neither passive nor emotionless (Littau, 2006, p. 61). In fact, it might be that they are better informed to adapt and adopt Buddhist doctrines and practices than other Buddhist practitioners (Cox, 2017, p. 340).

Religious/spiritual publishing, particularly Buddhist, as well as popular psychology, has multiplied in recent decades and it thrives in the current marketplace (Heelas, 1996, p. 113-114; Wright, 1998, ix; Coleman, 2001, p. 19, 189; Ruthven and Medbh-Mara, 2001, p. 111-112; Tweed, 2002, p. 21; Beckfort, 2003, p. 220n11; Hoover, 2006, p. 62-63; Illouz, 2008, p. 162; Fischer, 2013, p. 311; Odiseos, 2020). Popular Buddhist publications target both spiritual consumers and Buddhist audiences formed by political, moral individuals immersed in family, working lives (Coleman, 2001, p. 189; Carrette and King, 2005, p. 87; Bluck, 2006, p. 189; Popp-Baler, 2010, p. 61). Mass-market publications and magazines<sup>131</sup> are also a feature in Asian Buddhism.

In Postmodern contexts, 'reading became a means to make sense of past events and the uncertainty of the future' (Brock, 2009, p. 271). The New Age movement and its concomitants respond to a perceived crisis of modernity, particularly consumerism, secularisation, and faith in technology and science (Heelas, 1996, p. 135-136). Although this literature strives to make sense of the world, it is mainly employed by readers to emotionally mediate between themselves and the world (Illouz, 2008, p. 18).

Religious/spiritual literature benefits from the transmission of Asian religions to the West and the development of New Age traditions, mindfulness and, more recently, positive thinking (Cabanas and Illouz, 2018, p. 94). Prior to the 1960s, the available literature on Buddhism was scant (Arai, 1980, p. 1). Nowadays, beside academic literature, there is a wide range of mass-market literature aimed at



non-Asian readers partly consonant with self-help, therapy, and New Age genres<sup>132</sup> (Segdwick, 2005, p. 164). Buddhist scholarly literature also grew substantially following the development of Religious Studies during the 1960s (Lopez, 1998, p. 160).

Significantly, now it is also possible to access texts 'which had been considered secret'<sup>133</sup> teachings for centuries' (Seager, 1999, p. 119). Current publishing makes some of these texts available, thus creating a situation in which these *Dharma*-texts can be read without the empowerments and teachings accompanying their transmission by an authorised teacher of recognised lineage (Odiseos, 2020; Khandro, 2020).

The merit accumulated from copying and distributing *Dharma*-texts stimulates publishing activities (Levering, 1989b, p. 82). Thus, many of these texts have become reading material even in traditional Buddhist countries: 'modern readings, often inflicted by Western philosophical ideas, are now moving back into Asia as students study these modern texts' (Garfield, 2016, p. 302). For instance, young, educated Tibetans tend to learn about Buddhism using English-language books even when these are translations from Tibetan, as traditional Tibetan proves often incomprehensible to them (Dreyfus, 2003, p. 157-158; Garfield, 2016, p. 302).

Books and other media have become primary sources for the transmission and representation of religious concepts, particularly populist, individualistic ideas in the form of 'banal religion' (Graham, 1986, p. 28; Hjarvard, 2008; Hoover, 2011, p. 610; Mitchell, 2012). Many publications downplay or distort content related to ritual, cosmology, monasticism, authority, or doctrine while emphasizing self-exploration, interdependence, science, and self-satisfaction.<sup>134</sup> This banalization reflects what some see as the 'cannibalization of the faith' by quasi-Buddhist groups appropriating decontextualized Buddhist practices (Matthews, 2002, p. 132). The result might be a Neo-Buddhism or Buddhism '*à-la-carte*' reflecting the 'desire for fulfilment which characterizes the individual in contemporary societies' (Fauré, 2009, p. 139). Self-help and popular psychology texts often also simplify the range of human emotions and experiences and codify these by means of banal language (Illouz, 2008, p. 238-239).

Banal Buddhism appears in Buddhist quotes and memes which often contain little if any authentic Buddhism,<sup>135</sup> in publications of the 'Zen and the art of...' type, and in Tantric sex titles bearing little if any resemblance with Tantric practices (Coleman, 2001, p. 158, 188; Bodhipaksa, 2017). This banalization represents a 'fetishist mode of ideology' which participates in forms of capitalism perhaps contrary to Buddhist thought (Žižek, 2007, p. 253). Critics of this type of literature notice that the so-called happiness experts promote a narcissistic, ego-fulfilling culture consonant with contemporary capitalism (Cabanas and Illouz, 2018, p. 95).

Publishing constitutes a clear indicator of the commodification and availability<sup>136</sup> of Buddhist practice (Mathé, 2010, p. 523; Díez de Velasco, 2013, p. 97; Díez de Velasco, 2018, p. 71). Bookshops, libraries, and publishers produce and disseminate content and thus affect the practice of spiritual seekers (Huthnow, 2013, p. 315).

### **Bookshop Buddhists**

This section describes a type of Buddhists in modern, globalized contexts for whom reading constitutes their main or only practice and connection to Buddhism.

Bookshop or nightstand or not-just-Buddhists or *Dharma* hoppers are a group of Buddhist sympathizers. As an 'audience cult', bookshop Buddhists are individuals influenced by or introduced to Buddhism by reading books<sup>137</sup> (Stark and Bainbridge, in Nattier, 1998, p. 185; Tweed, 2000, p. 43; Coleman, 2001, p. 187).<sup>138</sup> This mirrors a trend found among spirituality seekers where most of their learning is reading-based at several stages of their development or involvement with a religion (Ruthven and Medbh-Mara, 2001, p. 133). They also partly align with other spiritual seekers within modern and New Age movements and with modern expressions of privatized religion (Tanaka, 2007, p. 115; Huevieu-Léger, 2013, p. 166; Cox, 2017, p. 340). Thus, many Bookshop Buddhist can partly be defined as converts to New Age-type religious practice (Parker, 2007, p. 60; Dawei, 2012, p. 55).

Bookshop Buddhists fit in the categorisation of those who believe but might not necessarily belong to a religion.<sup>139</sup> The term 'bookshop Buddhist' refers to self-identification, not to commitment to religious practice (Tweed, 2002, p. 20).

Based on figures of book sales, publishing activities, and media accounts, the size of this group is considered significant and their presence ubiquitous (Coleman, 2001, p. 188; Wuthnow and Cadge, 2004, p. 364; Bluck, 2006, p. 13). Considering the amount of SBNR and SBNA,<sup>140</sup> there are possibly millions of Buddhist sympathizers (Cheah, 2017, p. 317).

As explained above in the section 'Buddhism in the West', since the nineteenth century Buddhist sympathizers have played an important role in establishing Buddhism in the West (Tweed, 2000, xii). However, this phenomenon is not exclusively Western.<sup>141</sup> Contexts facilitating syncretic religious practices, like China, Taiwan, Korea, of Japan, might enable individuals to read Buddhist literature without formally belonging to the religion (Pittman, 2001, p. 53).

Regarding strategies for establishing religious identity (membership and/or attendance), bookshop Buddhists negotiate an alternative affiliation, that of sympathisers (Tweed, 2002, p. 17-18). Buddhists who identify as such by normative strategies of affiliation, like attending temple services or participating in meditation retreats, tend to dismiss bookshop Buddhists as amateurish or inauthentic. Solitary practitioners, however, might have dedicated practices and procure their own authoritative sources to justify their practices and beliefs (Coleman, 2001, p. 188-189). Besides, some bookshop Buddhists, as well as certain Zen or Vipassanā practitioners, and those subscribing to various secular Buddhist ideas might not identify as Buddhist (Borup, 2016, p. 44). Contrariwise, many individuals engaging in some sort of Buddhist practice might not identify as Buddhist either (Wallace, 2002, p. 34). For instance, it is estimated that half of the readership of the popular Buddhist magazine *Tricycle* consider themselves not Buddhist (Coleman, 2001, p. 187; Tweed, 1999, p. 74; Tweed, 2002, p. 20). However, it is clear that they engage with Buddhism by at least reading about it.

Based off their reading, Bookshop Buddhists largely see Buddhism essentially as a philosophy, often neglecting the ritual and symbolic dimensions of the practice (Lopez, 1995a, p. 7). Bookshop Buddhists display a form of unregulated, unguided reading. The charisma and popularity of Buddhist teachers and authors rather than one's understanding of the path often dictates what material is read. Traditionally, however, reading guidance was found within textual communities and directly from teachers (Griffiths, 1999, p. 65). The lack of traditional ritual and pedagogical contexts for the transmission of scripture and access to reading material poses some problems as practitioners read certain texts and engage in various practices without guidance or initiation<sup>142</sup> (Thrangu, 1993, p. 65-66; Lopez, 1996, p. 184; Kapstein, 2000, p. 238n76; Kroll, 2017, p. 87). In Western settings, practitioners deem reading books by an authoritative master as auspicious as attending teachings or participating in ritual (Campergue, 2015, p. 448). For traditional readers, Western ways of reading might appear 'superficial and foreign to them' (Odiseos, 2020).

Since individuals practice on their own and create their own paths, in addition to formal and practical canons, readers might create their own 'individual' or 'private' canons. Therefore one must choose what to read (Bloom, 1994, p. 15).

Modern Buddhism has also formed its own 'commodified' or 'commercial' canon comprising popular and quasi-scholarly works capable of creating new communities of interpretation and practice<sup>143</sup> (McMahan, 2008, p. 259). This is largely the result of a crisis of authority in the modern world by which practitioners might not require the guidance of a teacher to mediate access to knowledge (Goody, 1986, p. 13). In ignoring the oral dimension of texts and undermining the role of the author, modern readers place themselves at an ontological distance from the texts (Ong, 2012, p. 167). By practicing solitary, silent reading, and neglecting the oral, communal dimension of *Dharma*-texts, particularly scripture, bookshop Buddhists might fail to appreciate not only the aesthetic, emotional dimension of scripture, but also the benefits of memorization, internalization, and embodiment.

As part of Buddhist modernism, bookshop Buddhists are generally middle-class individuals who rely on reading for their spiritual fulfilment without generally identifying as Buddhist or belonging to a particular Buddhist denomination (Tamney, 2008, p. 234; Rocha, 2017, p. 303-304). Given the spread of literacy and the availability of texts and other media, 'Bookshop Buddhism' might not exclusively be a Western phenomenon.

The following section explores some book reviews on social media platforms to account for the reception of Buddhist literature among Buddhist and non-Buddhist ordinary readers.

### **Reading responses**

Between March and September 2020, eight Buddhist-related Facebook groups<sup>144</sup> were monitored for content discussing reading and book recommendations. Sixty-seven posts were selected and analysed, from which 1,217 individual recommendations for an author or title were extracted. From these, a ranking of the ten top titles<sup>145</sup> were collated to reflect popularity and authorship. A content analysis of a sample of the 50 most recent reviews of each title (500 reviews) from Goodreads was conducted to produce a semantic analysis of the occurrence of specific words and themes regarding reading experience and reception.<sup>146</sup>

These reviews suggest that readers of Buddhist literature value practical, useful, and comprehensive introductions to Buddhism, often used for reference. They favour simple, clear, easy, concise, and accessible texts on Buddhism presented in a straightforward, demystified manner. On the other hand, they dislike repetitive, difficult, and disorganized texts. They appreciate these texts for their philosophical rather than their doctrinal content, particularly those which cater for Western audiences and which they perceive as having universal validity regardless of religious identity or adherence. They often feel displeased and disappointed with condescending, pretentious, and boastful authors and with simplistic, self-help-type, non-Buddhist, mystifying, and sermonizing content. Additionally, several reviewers feel a teaching is tainted if its author falls into disrepute.<sup>147</sup> Most of all, they prefer texts from which they can extract applicable, relatable, and relevant advice for their lives and dismiss

them if found unrelatable and impractical. Besides, they value examples and cases which resonate with their experience and corroborate their worldview, but disdain content deemed impractical or irrelevant to them. However, many reviewers also highlight the transformative, life-changing, enlightening effects produced by their reading experience as well as the challenging, thought-provoking, and encouraging ideas presented in these texts. Moreover, several readers adduce reading a text sparked their interest in Buddhism or encouraged them to practice, reading thus constituting a conversion motif. Finally, it seems that for a few readers at least reading constitutes their main connexion with Buddhism.

These readers mainly approach Buddhist literature to gain information and knowledge of Buddhism and obtain wisdom and insights applicable to their spiritual journeys, although some also emphasize enjoyment and entertainment as part of their reading experience. Many readers also relate emotional responses to the texts, particularly expressing gratitude towards authors, while also emphasizing the calming, pacifying, purifying, awe-inducing, delightful, comforting, beautiful, wonderful, amazing, profound, uplifting, hopeful, lovely, or delightful effects of their reading, among others. In particular, some readers describe how their reading help them through difficult, challenging times, especially illness, death, and grief.

For some reviewers, these text deserve slow, repeated readings, allowing time to ponder over their contents and put their teaching into practice. Many reviewers would also recommend these texts to others. Lastly, a large number of them declare they often reread or have the intention to return to a text to better comprehend Buddhism and/or themselves, to find inspiration or encouragement for practice, or as an object of meditation.

This analysis portrays Buddhist literature reviewers on social media as showing traits consonant with those of Western and non-Buddhist readers in general, and Bookshop Buddhists in particular. Their reading preferences and attitudes appear consonant with the conclusions drawn by Gordon-Finlayson (2012) and Eddy (2012). Through this analysis it transpires that reading triggered an interest in

Buddhism and its practice in some cases, while for other reviewers reading represents a central component in their knowledge and practice of Buddhism. Significantly, these reviewers appear in many instances as reflective individuals aware of their relationship with Buddhist practice. Some of them also seem to represent a type of reader who is not solely consumerist, but who shows several traits characteristic of religious readers in that they read, reread, use, and ponder over the meaning of the texts, whose content partly accounts for their worldviews. Thus, these readers partly follow the dictum suggested by various Buddhist schools of slow, repeated, and meditative reading conducive to its assimilation and practice.

This analysis suggest Buddhist literature reviewers mainly communicate cognitive and emotional attitudes regarding their reading, particularly emphasizing the reward they obtain in their reading experience, although entertainment is also mentioned. Their reading is conducted mostly for understanding for a variety of purposes, mainly influencing their worldviews and their spiritual cultivation, hence having an informative and transformative result. Reviewers describe both aesthetic and nonaesthetic reading strategies where learning largely comprises cognitive, private, and meditative functions, and where worship, ritual, communal, devotional, and non-cognitive strategies are absent. These readers use linear, silent, individual, solitary, private, and extensive/consumerist reading modes, although a few participate in book discussions and reading clubs. According to their reading strategies, these reviewers are sympathetic readers who tend to emphasize symbolical interpretations of Buddhism, as well as recent, suspicious readers who reject dogma and mystical interpretations.

## Conclusions

This dissertation has argued that reading constitutes a central element in the transmission, reception, and practice of Buddhism. Despite the pervasiveness of its nature, the difficulty in examining evidence for its existence, and the elusiveness of its experience by readers, by exploring reading as a religious signifier and examining the contexts for its occurrence, this dissertation has addressed a perceived gap in Buddhist studies. It has argued that historically, down to the present day, reading offers a valid, convenient phenomenon to analyse Buddhist roles and identities.

This study has explored several instances of reading practice in Buddhism. First, by outlining a history of reading in Buddhism it has been shown how the reading of *Dharma*-texts first became possible in the first century CE and possibly earlier, the consequences this had in the way that Buddhism was transmitted, and how reading coexisted or complemented orality amongst the earliest schools. A characterisation of reading across Buddhist traditions has revealed how reading was adopted and adapted to fit each school's perspective of the practice. For instance, whereas some early schools emphasized the importance of orality, recitation, and memorization, the Mahāyāna not only adapted writing and reading as a way of transmitting Buddhism, but also made this an element of their self-definition without failing to appreciate memorization and recitation. Secondly, in support of this, this study has proposed a number of theories, namely the concept of Skilful Means, the doctrine of the Two Truths, the 'Simile of the Raft' and the story of the 'Finger Pointing to the Moon', as well as the 'Four Reliances', as hermeneutical tools with which to frame the roles and capacity of reading as an element within the larger context of Buddhist practice. Finally, this dissertation has surveyed the impact of reading in contemporary practice and its reception by contemporary audiences.

In addition to these concepts and doctrines with a bearing in the practice of Buddhism, and in order to help define reading in Buddhism, this dissertation has described several attitudes, levels, and purposes of reading. These categories have been useful to analyse the content of statements about reading found in the literature and described in 'Appendix E: Corpus' as well as to examine the roles,



intentions, and experiences of historical and contemporary readers of *Dharma*-texts. Reading is said to support *Dharma* practice as it appears at several stages of the path and performs several tasks. Reading practice is regarded as particularly helpful for gaining understanding and achieving Right View. It is also felt that reading develops faith and offers moral exemplars and inspiration for practice.

This dissertation has described several modes of reading in Buddhism in relation to their perceived benefits and according to different readers' intentions. Ultimately, reading in Buddhism is seen as a means for removing hindrances, eradicating defilements, and attaining liberation. Purification, recollection, meditation, and understanding feature prominently amongst perceived benefits of reading, either to oneself or to others, silently or aloud.

This study has also summarised how some Buddhist traditions define reading for *Dharma* practice. Most Buddhist traditions advocate reading slowly and repeatedly as a way to familiarize oneself with the teaching. These traditions encourage maintaining a reverential, mindful, contemplative, and meditative attitude while reading. They also urge the pursuit of patience, self-awareness, self-transformation, and direct experience, among other traits, when reading. Importantly, some Buddhist schools, like Ch'an/Zen or the Forest tradition, include warnings about the degree to which practitioners should rely on reading for their practice and knowledge of Buddhism.

In this connexion, this thesis has also suggested that views on authority and on the authenticity of texts affect the status of written scriptures and the capacity of reading as a valid means for the practice and transmission of Buddhism. By placing the discussion of authority and authenticity of reading materials within oral and recitative traditions, this thesis has shown that historical reading cultures coexisted and interacted with traditions emphasizing orality and memorization. It has also accentuated historical trends which facilitated the use of writing and reading in early Buddhism and which formed the basis of several Buddhist traditions. Furthermore, by surveying the position of different Buddhist traditions and schools regarding reading, this dissertation has shown that reading has acquired different roles within particular ceremonial, ritual, pedagogical, or merit-making

contexts, among others, and has been adapted to the needs of Buddhist practitioners. To serve this purpose, different Buddhist traditions have used, developed, rejected, and created literary genres compatible with their practice. For instance, Ch'an/Zen developed kōan and recorded sayings, whereas Tibetan Buddhism developed the *terma* tradition. This aspect of reading in Buddhism has been further developed in 'Appendix A: Merit, cults, and pedagogies' and in 'Appendix B: Merit, copying, and preserving *Dharma*-texts'.

This dissertation has discussed how nineteenth and twentieth-century Asian Buddhist revivals encouraged the production, distribution, and reading of *Dharma*-texts. These processes affected Buddhist practice and conditioned the transmission of Buddhism outside of Asia. This thesis has argued that Buddhism was transmitted to the West mostly as a textual tradition and that this emphasis on texts and reading deeply affected the practice and understanding of Buddhism. This analysis was supported by an exploration of conversion to Buddhism, particularly in terms of the central role reading plays in the access, knowledge, and transmission of Buddhism. Given the success and visibility of the Buddhist publishing industry and the availability of *Dharma*-texts, it has become clear that reading constitutes a key factor in the knowledge and practice of Buddhism.

Following a discussion of the different modes of reception and responses to texts, this study has defined ways for reading Buddhist literature religiously or as literature. By placing these reading strategies against the background of modernity, secularism, and globalization, several possible ways of understanding reading in Buddhism in the current context have been framed. In this context, books have become commodities, readers consumers, and 'new' Buddhists amongst Westerners have introduced elements of syncretism and adaptability, within a largely individualist ethos.

'Bookshop Buddhism', evident amongst those in the international community for whom reading has become their main involvement with Buddhist practice, has enriched scholarly definitions of Buddhist identity, commitment, and affiliation. As part of Buddhist modernism, Bookshop Buddhists have been

described as readers seeking spiritual fulfilment, religious knowledge, and practical advice from a demystified, non-dogmatic, and scientific perspective.

Previous scholarship had identified the need to research the reception of Buddhist literature amongst contemporary audiences and the practices of Buddhist sympathizers. By examining responses to Buddhist literature by reviewers on social media, it has been found that, when taken as a whole, these reviews give an indication of the role reading plays for Bookshop Buddhists and Buddhist sympathisers, as well as their expectations from and involvement with the practice. Hence, these reviews have proven helpful in measuring the impact of reading amongst contemporary audiences. It has become apparent that these readers approach Buddhist literature for information, knowledge, and practice of Buddhism, and display traits of both consumerist and religious reading. For some of these reviewers, who largely align with general Western and non-Buddhist modernist and postmodern reading trends, reading constitutes their main connection with Buddhist practice and, in some occasions, a factor in their conversion to more engaged practice.

Both the history of reading in Buddhism and the reception of *Dharma*-texts amongst historical and contemporary audiences merit further scholarly research. Histories of the transmission, use, and reception of texts and of their ritual and pedagogical contexts would shed light on the history of reading in Buddhism as it relates to Buddhist practice. The study of historical and contemporary audiences of Buddhist *Dharma*-texts would enrich the knowledge of the transmission of Buddhism and contribute to the debate on Buddhist practices and identities as well as to the discussion on the creation, transmission, and definition of idiosyncratic canons of Buddhist literature and their relationship with Buddhist practice.

## Appendix A: Merit, cults, and pedagogies

Reading has been associated with ceremonial, ritual, and merit-making practices throughout Buddhist history. This appendix surveys reading in relation to the writing, distribution, and veneration of *Dharma*-texts and canons. This survey is completed by examining the place of reading in pedagogical contexts and the merit generated by reading and other scholarly practices.

### Merit

Since early Mahāyāna, and particularly within *Prajñāpāramitā* literature, certain textual roles and duties are said to produce merit, either for oneself or for transfer to another: reading, reciting, revering, respecting, worshipping,<sup>148</sup> preaching, expounding, memorizing, copying, distributing, and keeping sutras<sup>149</sup> (Mizuno, 1982, p. 162; Drewes, 2007; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 3). To become a Buddha, one ought to engage in these activities<sup>150</sup> (Lopez, 1996, p. 148). Thus, *Dharma*-texts are read and performed (Rambelli, 2006, p. 52).

The fruits of this merit are good rebirth, beauty, longevity, remembering past lives, visions of Buddhas and bodhisattvas, trust, and faith, among others<sup>151</sup> (Lewis, 1996, p. 23; Schopen, 2005, p. 159, 165, 208). Fulfilling these duties is a sign of Right Conduct (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 177). When reading for a sponsor,<sup>152</sup> sometimes the reward is material<sup>153</sup> (Welch, 1967, p. 204; Nishijima and Cross, 1994, p. 269n53; Coleman, 2001, p. 34; Griffith Foulk, 2004, p. 293).

These merit-making activities partly account for the establishment and self-definition of the Mahāyāna (Schopen, 1975, p. 170; McMahan, 1998, p. 255). Merit promulgated in the texts turns reading into sacred practice and the volumes of text into sacred objects (Winternitz, 1972, p. 320). Scriptures are identified with the Buddha and the place where *sūtras* are kept becomes a Buddha's abode (Mizuno, 1982, p. 164). This phenomenon is also found in other Indian religions. For instance, the *Purānas* extol the merits of worshipping, writing, reciting/reading, or donating texts (Schopen, 2008, p. 43; Apple, 2014, p. 38).

The merit of donating manuscripts and writing materials also appears in non-Mahāyāna Buddhist literature (De Simini, 2016, p. 4). Some colophons in Theravāda manuscripts suggest that reading, copying, and possessing manuscripts generates merit and engenders knowledge. This reverential attitude in the Theravāda began to appear in the twelfth century (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 168, 178). The fourteenth-century *Saddhammasaṅgaha* praises the benefits of copying the *Tipiṭaka* since each teaching implies the Buddha's presence.<sup>154</sup> These benefits include freedom from suffering, good rebirths, and happiness, among others (Law, 1941, p. 15-16).

Despite this dictum, as late as the fifth century, scripture was still mainly transmitted orally, at least in the Indic sphere. Mahāyāna Buddhism resorted to manuscript transmission early in areas where Indic languages were unknown (Mizuno, 1982, p. 163). Thus, manuscripts were unevenly distributed across the territory.

### **Relics and the cult of the book**

The Buddha's induction that 'whoever sees the Dhamma sees me' (S iii 120) justifies several distinct practices, including building *stūpas*, relic worship, chanting, visualisation, and importantly, creation, transmission, preservation, and enactment of *Dharma*-texts<sup>155</sup> (Flores, 2008, p. 85). Cultic veneration of the Buddha's enlightened body, speech, and mind corresponds to the production and worship of statues, scriptures, and *stūpas* (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 33). The Buddha realized *Dharma*, had *Dharma* for his body, became one with it (DN iii 84; Miln 73; Habito, 1986, p. 54). This correspondence indicates that reading scripture amounts to attending to the Buddha's presence through his speech (Germano, 2004, p. 52). Buddhists take refuge in Buddha and *Sangha* as well as *Dharma*, scripture being one of its most obvious expressions (Habito, 1986, p. 54). *Dharma*, together with discipline (*Vinaya*) was to become the Teacher upon the Buddha's departure (D ii 100). This is an important validating point for reading practice: reading scriptures becomes a means to access the Buddha's preaching directly (Lopez, 1992a, p. 9; Abé, 2005, p. 300). Reverence towards teachings and teachers forms the basis of textuality, even bibliolatriy, in Buddhism (Kinnard, 2002, p. 101). Some even refer to Buddhist

grapholatry when reverence includes all written material (Goody, 1986, p. 16). This might occur when dependence on scripture is excessive (Smith, 1993, p. 163; Von Voorst, 2008, p. 9).

According to the cult of relics, scriptural volumes physically represent<sup>156</sup> the body of the Buddha (*Buddhakāya*) and the body of his teachings (*Dharmakāya*) (Habito, 1986, p. 55; Harrison, 1992a, p. 44, 76; Jantrasrisalai, 2008, p. 129; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 72; Kim, 2013, p. 38-39). The *Sumaṅgalavilāsinī* (1, 34; 3, 865, in Reynolds, 1977, 377) explicitly relates *Dharmakāya* to the *Tipiṭaka* (Bond, 1992, p. 29). This identification extends so that ‘every letter is an image of the Buddha’ (Ruiz-Falqués, 2014, p. 33). Thus, *Dharma*-volumes are considered the Buddha’s body<sup>157</sup> (Sbgz. 3 Nyorai-zenshin 225). The identification of *Buddhakāya* with books as material objects becomes evident in Tibetan Buddhism (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 132). As *Dharma*-volumes become Buddha-relics, so places where *sūtra*-cults are conducted become shrines (Schopen, 1975, p. 162).

In this context, reading the *Buddhakāya* and the *Dharmakāya*, and revering the Buddha<sup>158</sup> and his *Dharma*, constitute Buddhist practices for embodying the *Dharma* (Harrison, 1992a, p. 50-51; Zhiru, 2010, p. 97). From this perspective, reading becomes a means to actualise the teaching in one’s own practice. Thus, *Dharmabhāṇakas*, having memorized *Dharma*-texts and embodied the *Dharma*, merit veneration as Buddhas<sup>159</sup> (Apple, 2014, p. 26).

The metaphor extends through to Tantra, where Tantric texts not only represent the mind and body of adepts, but also ultimate reality (Wallace, 2009b, p. 179). The metaphor of embodiment extends to cases in which people can be reborn as books<sup>160</sup> or turned into books.<sup>161</sup> Tantric readers therefore participate in the creation of texts by their reading (Wallace, 2009b, p. 188).

Ritual and worship use scripture metaphorically to represent the very content of scripture (Smart, 1996, p. 126; Cummings, 2013, p. 93). By a process of bibliofication, that is, a *sūtra* describing its own content, status, and cult, the *sūtras* themselves become elements of the textual structure of some *sūtras* and constitute themselves as sacred objects (Berling, 1987, p. 67; Apple, 2014, p. 25).

The symbolic content of *Dharma*-texts affects their physical representation and their cultic status (Cummings, 2013, p. 95). When *Dharma*-volumes are used for cultic purposes rather than for reading, they are *Dharma*-relics (Kim, 2013, p. 40). For instance, Chinese devotional literature mention reverence toward *sūtras* but seldom discuss reading (Campany, 1991, p. 35-36).

Some *sūtras* even claim *sūtra*-cults are the higher form of *pūjā*<sup>162</sup> (reverence, worship) thus creating individual title-cults (Schopen, 2005, p. 116). When a collection of texts becomes the object of devotion, scholars identify a cult of the canon. Canon-cults have their own protective deity, Fu Xi (Wu, 2016b, p. 46, 56). However, other Mahāyāna *sūtras* praise memorization and recitation over these practices (Drewes, 2007, p. 137).

Venerating texts is not exclusive to the Mahāyāna (Drewes, 2007, p. 137). Manuscripts are also held in high esteem in Theravāda contexts (Appleton, 2014, p. 580). Sinhalese culture treats religious manuscripts as animate objects and there is evidence that manuscripts were placed in shrines in lieu of Buddha images (Nandadeva, 2009, p. 165). Worshipping *Dharma*-volumes is however excluded from authoritative Theravāda literature except for an eleventh-century sub-commentary (Veidlinger, 2006, p. 405). Thus, manuscripts, although exalted as embodiments of the Buddha's teaching, were never equivalent to relics in most Theravāda contexts (Wijayawardhana, 1979, p. 67; Veidlinger, 2007, p. 9).

## **Pedagogical reading**

Educational institutions use reading and other pedagogical tools to convey their religious accounts.<sup>163</sup>

These institutions are often referred to as textual or interpretative communities, or reading cultures (Blackburn, 2001, p. 77; McDaniels, 2008, p. 9). Their views on 'authority, hierarchy, community, and tradition' are embedded in their accounts (Griffiths, 1999, p. 63). Textual communities compile reading lists and/or revolve around an authoritative text or interpretation (Griffiths, 1999, p. 64, 80).<sup>164</sup>

These accounts justify the existence of practical canons resulting from pedagogical strategies, book-cults, and the availability of texts (Blackburn, 1999b, p. 283; McDaniel, 2008, p. 192). Even when

monasteries hold complete canonical collection, these volumes are kept for symbolic functions and seldom used (Blackburn, 2001, p. 198; Samuels, 2004, p. 957; Hansen, 2007, p. 79; McDaniels, 2008, p. 7).

Library collections vary across time and geography. This partly explains doctrinal and practical differences among Buddhist schools (Blackburn, 2002, p. 2). Changes to monastic curricula also occur over time, often responding to geopolitical, nationalistic, and centralizing trends<sup>165</sup> (Blackburn, 2001, p. 198).

The ideal of complete canons remains an abstract entity (Salomon, Allchin and Barnard, 1999, p. 156). Despite the circulation of *Dharma*-text and the use of reading, learning never developed independently from the guidance of teachers (Blackburn, 2001, p. 142; McDaniel, 2008, p. 181). Practical canons partly respond to an 'action-oriented pedagogy' reportedly more important than textual learning whereby novices learn actions and behaviours according to their teachers' example (Nishijima and Cross, 1994, p. 189; Samuel, 2004, p. 956, 962; Schopen, 2014, p. 63).

Some educational systems embed reading and self-study in their study programmes to supplement debate and memorization and further understanding (Cabezón and Dorjee, 2019, p. 250-251). Pedagogical works include a diversity of genres used in a variety of settings: sermons, bilingual glosses, grammars, anthologies, commentaries, storybooks, biographies, and horoscopes, among others<sup>166</sup> (Griffiths, 1999, p. 97; Kapstein, 2000, p. 78; McDaniel, 2009, p. 130). These genres are the product of religious reading in its effort to develop understanding (Griffiths, 1999, p. 77). As the basis for monastic curricula, these are probably the texts most read by monastics and laity for their education<sup>167</sup> (McDaniel, 2009, p. 131, 135). As such, these pedagogical texts, rather than only canonical ones, are the primary agents in the transmission of doctrinal knowledge. Pedagogical *Dharma*-texts are also revered as *Dharmakāya*-relics and thus treated as sacred objects (McDaniels, 2005, p. 332; Nandadeva, 2009, p. 169). Additionally, some religious specialists engaging in protective and divining



activities might only learn to manipulate religious implements and to read and memorize spells (Tambiah, 1986, p. 92).

Reading material for instruction is written in canonical and/or several vernaculars languages (McDaniel, 2008). Canonical and classical languages remain symbolically relevant due to their sacred status. However, most people access teachings in vernacular languages using a number of media (Crosby, 2014, p. 71). Vernacular works of literary value were particularly esteemed (McDaniel, 2009, p. 129).

Except scholars, few monastics choose to read anything outside the curriculum (Kapstein, 2000, p. 79; McMahan, 2008, p. 17). In other contexts, however, temple complexes operated as centres of literary activity, as printers, publishers, educators, and distributors (Trần, 2018, p. 116). Temples and monasteries also operated as schools, teaching Buddhism and many other subjects (Dutt, 1962, p. 326; Han, 2009, p. 345). Laity tend to read liturgies, anthologies, magical formulae, textbooks, biographies, or poems (Foxeus, 2017, p. 219; Soucy, 2017, p. 185).

Many curricular texts are still read to be memorized,<sup>168</sup> thus placing transmission<sup>169</sup> within an oral context (Seeger, 2014, p. 156). For instance, Sri Lankan monastics first memorize parittā texts and study their ritual uses in monastic schools (*piriveṇas*) (Samuels, 2005, p. 349). In most Theravāda contexts, reading serves as preparation to deliver oral instruction through sermons and lectures (McDaniels, 2005, p. 302). Other Theravāda pedagogical texts comprise the *Paṭimokkha*, selections of *Jātaka* and *Vinaya*, and ritual abridgments of the *Abhidhamma* (Appleton, 2014, p. 579). In other traditions, for example Ch'an, monastics exempt from other duties engage actively in scriptural reading (Goodell, 2008, p. 93-94).

Nowadays, Buddhist organizations express their sectarian affiliation and religious accounts through pedagogical curricula and their attitudes towards reading.<sup>170</sup> These attitudes range from ecumenical, inclusive, and nonsectarian to exclusive, restrictive, and partisan.

### **Scholarly and scholastic reading**

Writing facilitates academic uses of texts for assimilation, debate, and criticism (Graham, 1986, p. 15). It also enables both introspection and the examination of the external world (Ong, 2012, p. 104). Reading allows the examination of other authors, traditions, and philosophical schools (Bronkhorst, 2002, p. 24). The use of manuscripts for scholastic reading first appears in second to third-century Gandhāra (Kim, 2013, p. 25). Whereas in Tibet debating was purely an oral event, in Thailand and Burma texts and reading supported debating (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 71). In most contexts, scholastic recitation and liturgical reading involves reading aloud, often communally. However, silent, introspective reading also exists (Dreyfus, 2003, p. 150, 153-154).

### **Translating and editing as reading**

Translation facilitated the transmission of Buddhism outside its birthplace by making the *Dharma* intelligible. The first translations occurred in an oral context. However, translators working with written texts in China or Tibet possibly inscribed translations of texts being dictated from memory or read aloud from a manuscript<sup>171</sup> (Mizuno, 1982, p. 101; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 20). Translation bureaux collected, collated, compared, and proofread several renderings of each *sūtra* when creating new translations (Muzuno, 1982, p. 61). Proofreading involved a ‘reader intoning a text out loud and scribes listening and reading along’ (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 22). Translators cared about the reading experience. For instance, Kumārajīva’s translations were praised for their lyrical, pleasant qualities (Mizuno, 1982, p. 101). Given the emphasis on disseminating the *Dharma*, translating *Dharma*-texts can be seen as a merit-making act (Hureau, 2010, p. 1).

### **Reading biographies**

Biographical writing participates in the mythic/narrative dimension. As a genre, it originates with the Indian epic (Flores, 2008, p. 12). Intended for large audiences, biographies constitute repositories of collective memory which offer ethical referents to an audience’s identity (Smart, 1996, p. 131-132; Shaw, 2010, p. 19, 25). Biographies also legitimize the cult of certain figures and try to demonstrate

the superiority of Buddhism over other religions (Schober, 1997, p. 2; Hureau, 2015, p. 109). Gotama's biography, found in textual narratives and visual iconographies, offers both entertainment and a moral exemplar for spiritual edification<sup>172</sup> (Smart, 1996, p. 156; Berkwitz, 2010, p. 23).

Reading/chanting biographies becomes a transformational activity whereby readers recollect both Buddha and *Dharma* in order to develop understanding,<sup>173</sup> and arouse calm and cheerfulness (Shaw, 2010, p. 30, 38). This proves consonant with the benefits of listening, reciting, and contemplating *Dharma*-texts as it leads to delight, joy, concentration, and the destruction of fetters (Jantrasrisalai, 2008, p. 132; Hureau, 2015, p. 111).

Biographies also convey instruction, both exoteric and esoteric (Rhenigans, 2010, p. 253). This includes *Jātaka* tales, which not only operate at an intellectual level as narratives, but also at an ethical and experiential/emotional level (Smart, 1996, p. 164-165; Roesler, 2010, p. 4). Inspirational in nature, biographies offer examples of model behaviour, expound and validate doctrinal points in practice, and arouse faith<sup>174</sup> (Schober, 1997, p. 1; Roesler, 2010, p. 3). In portraying both the individual and the ideal they represent, a life-story and a path to liberation, biographies become theoretical and practical guides (Ricard, 2001, xviii; Van Schaik, 2016, p. 154-155).

Monastics treasured the biographies of other monastics, and often kept personal copies for their personal reading (Lopez, 2004, p. 286).

Some biographies included injunctions warning of the dangers of reading the text without a reading-permission (Roberts, 2010, p. 191). Sumedho (2014c, p. 272), aware of rhetorical devices used in biographical accounts, warns that they may give readers unrealistic prospects about practice.

Learning to read effortlessly and prodigious skill in reading feature prominently in Tibetan biographies. Reincarnated individuals might have learned that skill in previous lives (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 6). Chinese biographies often praise an individual's reading abilities (Pao-ch'ang, 1994, p. 7).

This appendix has placed reading within ritual and pedagogical contexts and has examined its existence from the perspective of the accumulation of merit.

## **Appendix B: Merit, copying, and preserving *Dharma*-texts**

This appendix develops some ideas around the merit of copying *Dharma*-texts using a variety of supports and technologies. It examines the role of generosity in copying and its relationship with reading. This appendix also locates some sites for the preservation of *Dharma*-texts and mention some ritual uses of libraries and storage cabinets. This appendix closes with some ideas around the destruction of texts and the disappearance of reading thus illustrating when the reading of Buddhist literature is no longer possible.

### **Copying**

Copying *Dharma*-texts is amongst the most common merit-making activities in Buddhism. Copying benefits scribes and sponsors. Merit is accrued for oneself, transferred to others, or in commemoration of an event or anniversary (Crosby, 2014, p. 78). When the names of scribes and sponsors written in the colophons of *Dharma*-texts are read aloud, these individuals also accumulate merit (Hartmann, 2009, p. 103; Van Schaik, 2020, p. 59). All material components of a manuscript were considered sacred and therefore treated reverentially (Crosby, 2020, p. 78).

### **Manuscripts**

Making manuscript copies of *Dharma*-texts became amongst the most meritorious ways to read *sūtras* as calligraphy turned copying into a meditative practice (Mizuno, 1982, p. 162; Kieschnick, 2000, p. 182; Edgren, 2009, p. 102; Shaw, 2009, p. 195). Making manuscript copies of printed *Dharma*-books, due to their rarity, was also considered the best way to read *sūtras* (Konicki, 2013, p. 607).

Copying strives for accuracy to ensure the correct transcription of texts lest readers abandon Buddhism due to bad practices. Scribes were praised for finely produced creations (McDaniel, 2009, p. 133; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 32). Fine copies preclude pedagogical reading and suggest ritual uses (Griffiths, 1999, p. 128).

Copies were done by scribes reading a source text or by oral dictation (Collins, 1992, p. 128; McDaniel, 2009, p. 136). Copying became a textual economy: castes of professional scribes developed in India and Nepal, many unable to read for understanding, but only able to arrange and shape letters; conversely, in China and elsewhere, reading and writing were a prerequisite for any educated scribe (Lancaster, 1979, p. 224-225). Some scribes reflected on the reading experience and made editorial marks to facilitate reading (Drègue, 1991, p. 89).

Rooted in scripture,<sup>175</sup> the metaphor of embodiment is also present in sutra-copying (Kieschnick, 2000, p. 179; Heller, 2009, p. 110). Human remains were used as writing and printing material to produce *Dharma*-volumes. In Tibet, the remains of eminent individuals were mixed with ink to produce fine manuscripts (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 116). According to some Tantric texts, human bones were used as pens<sup>176</sup> (Kim, 2013, p. 247). In China, blood was mixed with ink to copy *Dharma*-texts on human skin used as writing support (Kieschnick, 2000, p. 177; Harrison, 2003, p. 128; Wu, 2016b, p. 59). Human skin itself could be the support of yantra incantations in the form of tattoos. These were also printed in clothes and worn, or even inserted under the skin (Crosby, 2020, p. 77).

## Printing

Buddhists employ printing technologies to multiply the meritorious effects of *sūtra*-copying, produce complete canonical collections, and distribute *Dharma*-texts to a growing readership.<sup>177</sup> Both lay Buddhists and monastics organizations have led publishing efforts (Gombrich, 2006a, p. 182; Fisher, 2012, p. 72; Baldanza, 2018, p. 11). The availability of printing presses in the Buddhist world has been historically unequal, with manuscripts and printed texts coexisting (Heller, 2009, p. 109; Wu, 2016b, p. 59; Baldanza, 2018, p. 16; Crosby, 2020, p. 86-87).

Mass producing *Dharma*-texts initially encouraged ritual practices rather than reading (Kornicki, 2009, p. 111, 118; Fischer, 2013, p. 106). One of the most extended ritual uses of printed and manuscripts texts is to insert them into reliquaries and *stūpa*<sup>178</sup> (Kornicki, 2009, p. 118). In Japan, for instance, printing for reading started only from the eleventh century (Kornicki, 2009, p. 112). In Korea, from the

tenth century, printing produced texts for study and devotion (Kornicki, 2009, p. 118). In China, where printing and reading was reserved for nobles, bureaucrats, and monastics, mass printing encouraged literacy from the thirteenth century (Fischer, 2013, p. 107). Sinhala Buddhists had no printing press until the late nineteenth century (Malalgoda, 1976, p. 6). Sinhala publishing efforts first modelled themselves on their Christian counterparts (Gombrich, 2006a, p. 179-180).

Printing affects both the availability and audience of texts and the reading experience. Print formats are conducive to private, solitary reading, and produce a sense of ownership over the text (Ong, 2012, p. 128). Thai printing practices, influenced by the West, shifted the focus of the *Dhammapada* from the narrative, commentarial sections, to the verse component. Thus, these sections began to be published separately, contrary to how the text is taught in educational settings (McDaniels, 2005, p. 315-316). Similarly, editors and translators negotiate how to present orally composed, performative, repetitive texts, meant for memorization and recitation, in publications for silent, private readers (Winternitz, 1972, p. 68; Gethin, 2008, xlv). Some editors recommend mentally expanding the elided content to fully appreciate the text and use it for contemplation (Ñāṇamoli and Bodhi, 2001, p. 53). Modern editions also include auxiliary material, like glossaries, notes, or thematic guides, to aid readers (Bodhi, 2012, p. 12, 66). Regarding format, smaller, portable volumes of scriptures promote their circulation and reading (Wu, 2016a, p. 38; Scott, 2017).

Printing also comes with assumed cultural practices, which some traditionalist in the Buddhist world resisted as they undermined practices and values regarding the merit inherent in manuscript copying (Crosby, 2020, p. 87). Some nineteenth-century Thai monastics refused to read government sponsored and distributed printed books because they saw that format as intrinsically Christian (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 116). Some nineteenth-century Cambodian monastics supported the spread to printing and literacy so that people could read and understand the scriptures directly (Hansen, 2007, p. 103-104). However, printing was prohibited there until the 1920s for fear scriptures lose their sacrality and copyist their standing (Grieve and Veidlinger, 2017, p. 469; Crosby, 2020, p. 89). In

nineteenth and twentieth-centuries China, the development of a Buddhist print culture not only expanded readership but also helped create a sense of common identity (Scott, 2013, p. 36).

Printing facilitated the transmission of Buddhist literature beyond traditional pedagogical settings and established canons, thus enabling a more diverse range of voices to be circulated. However, the multiplication and distribution of authorised texts and pedagogical practices by central regulatory bodies meant that certain minority discourses were silenced and their traditions and lineages almost forgotten (Crosby, 2020, p. 88-89).

## **Digital**

Digital formats and the Internet have multiplied textual reproduction and consumption. This includes sophisticated tools for radial reading, thus fulfilling devotional and scholarly needs (Obadia, 2013, p. 181; Crosby, 2014, p. 94; Wu, 2016a, p. 24; Wittern, 2017). In a context where readers enjoy autonomy and access to resources, canon creation is a matter of personal choice as well as authority (Purves, 1998, p. 98; Wu, 2016a, p. 38). Ritual reading in digital environments also exists, for instance online prayer-wheels (Elliot, Diemberger and Clement, 2014, p. 79). Digital formats and media access have produced a 'global folk Buddhism' where practitioners draw from their own traditions while participating in a transnational culture (McMahan, 2008, p. 262). A mediascape composed of books, films, tv programmes, podcasts, magazines, and social media, participates in the commodification of Buddhism in a globalized world (Rocha, 2012, p. 299). Most contemporary Buddhist organizations employ most of these media (Poceski, 2017, p. 95).

## **Inscriptions**

Starting with the Aśokan inscriptions and pillars, *Dharma*-texts are inscribed on different supports for a variety of purposes and not meant to be read in a conventional way. In China and elsewhere, monumental *sūtras* were carved on mountains (Mizuno, 1982, p. 97). *Dharma*-texts were also engraved on the walls of palaces and temples in China and elsewhere (Griffiths, 1999, p. 52). Mantra-



bearing rocks, carrying the Avalokiteśvara mantra, human-made or self-produced, populate Tibetan cultural areas (Elliot, Diemberger and Clemente, 2014, p. 16).

## **Dāna**

Generosity (*dāna*) extends the metaphor of embodiment so that the gift of the Buddha's body (*dehadāna*) becomes the gift of *Dharma* (*Dharmadāna*) (AN i 91; It 98; Jāt 499; Ohnuma, 1998, p. 325). The Buddha's gift is the dispensation itself (Ohnuma, 1998, p. 357). Reading a *Dharma*-text produces the motivation to expound it and copy it (Cole, 2005, p. 335). The gift of *Dharma* is the highest gift. Giving produces merit and benefits such as longevity, strength, or faith (Uś Chap xix, 1059b-c). Printed and electronic copies of texts for free distribution often recall the merit of *Dharma*-gifts<sup>179</sup> (Harvey, 2013, p. 268).

The *Prajñāpāramita*, biographies, Buddhist poetry collections, and other *Dharma*-texts are copied to accumulate good karma and merit (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 61). These copies were often gifted and treated as objects of worship (Schopen, 2005, p. 6). In India and elsewhere, patronage was often, but not always, lay-based<sup>180</sup> (Kim, 2013, p. 15; De Simini, 2016, p. 6). The choice of texts for copying and distribution indicates which *Dharma*-texts were popular and informs about proselytizing activities (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 125). Fine editions and commemorative volumes served symbolic functions rather than reading needs (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 64). *Dāna* accounts partly for the content of temple collections, particularly in South and Southeast Asia (Blackburn, 2002, p. 58).

## **Libraries, storage, and reading spaces**

Evidence for reading can be traced through the history of library buildings and their contents.<sup>181</sup> From the fifth century, most Buddhist establishments, including universities, had some library provision (Steinkellner, 2004, p. 6). Books were seldom on display and mainly stored away (Levering, 1989b, p. 87; Schopen, 2008, p. 38; May and Igunma, 2018, p. 31). Private individuals kept scriptures in shrines at home,<sup>182</sup> where they were read and venerated.<sup>183</sup> Texts are kept in libraries, cells, and temples, alongside images, religious implements, and other valuables, often in conditions designed to ensure

their preservation (Datta, 1960; Campany, 1991, p. 34; Schopen, 2004, p. 51; McDaniel, 2009, p. 125). Buddhist establishments dedicate reading space for the use of *Dharma*-texts and appoint librarians to manage them (Datta, 1960, p. 21; Welch, 1967, p. 37-38; Wu, 2016a, p. 33). Several deities protect the places where scriptures are present<sup>184</sup> (Campany, 1991, p. 34; Schopen, 2008, p. 51).

Monasteries often keep practical, ritual canons, rather than complete scriptural collections (Ekvall, 1964, p. 125; Collins, 1990, p. 104). Besides religious literature, monastic collections include works on astrology, medicine, anthologies, study guides, and fiction, among others necessary to provide a broad education (Gethin, 1998, p. 104; McDaniel, 2009, p. 135; Baldanza, 2018, p. 9). Since texts copied for symbolic purposes tended to be stored away, texts used for study show the most signs of use (Baldanza, 2018, p. 24). Monastic establishments kept all material gifted by donors (Berkwitz, 2009, p. 40-41). Some monastic regulations include clauses detailing which books belong to the library and advice on book theft (Bronkhorst, 2002, p. 27; Schopen, 2004, p. 11, 199, 402). Monastic leaders control access to library collections (Dreyfus, 2003, p. 363n41; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 123). Libraries often reflect the ideological position held by monastic leaders and their views on reading and the transmission of knowledge.<sup>185</sup> Personal copies of books passed from master to disciple and remained within family collections, thus enabling devotional uses of scripture (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 122).

Most of these manuscript libraries are now largely irrelevant since, except for a few symbolic uses, most monastics rely on printed books.

### **Revolving libraries**

Revolving, carousel, or octagonal cabinet libraries are a convenient storage and retrieval system designed to enable illiterate individuals and others to produce the merit accrued by *sūtra*-reading by simply rotating these devices (Ekvall, 1984, p. 120-121; Drègue, 1991, p. 91-92; Wright, 2003, p. 265; Wu, 2016b, p. 55). Thus, revolving libraries participate in the cult of the canon (Wu, 2016a, p. 33; Wu, 2016b, p. 53-56). Allegedly invented by sixth-century Chinese lay master Fu Ta-shih, these libraries, now being revived, were popular in China and Japan until the modern period (Mizuno, 1982, p. 167;

Loveday, 2000, p. 228; Eubanks, 2010; Wu and Wilkinson, 2017, Introduction). They might also have Indian antecedents<sup>186</sup> (Schopen, 2005, p. 5; Eubanks, 2011, p. 183).

## Reading locations

Monastic regulations stipulate when and where to read<sup>187</sup> (Welch, 1967, p. 79). Beside monastic libraries or cells, other places, some unusual,<sup>188</sup> appear in the literature.

Reading is prohibited in the *Sangha* Hall of Zen monasteries (Griffith Foulk, 2004, p. 292). Some Chinese monasteries reserve quarters for laity engaged in scriptural reading and contemplation (Pittman, 2001, p. 54). Likewise, monastics may voluntarily enter periods of meditation and reading in special cells or 'sealed confinement'<sup>189</sup> (Pittman, 2001, p. 82). Scriptural reading also occurs in Tibetan retreats in caves, huts, and cells for periods of months to years<sup>190</sup> (Ray, 2002, p. 437). Laypersons able to read may read aloud to their families, during their spare time, or as religious practice<sup>191</sup> (Wijayawardhana, 1979, p. 68). Nowadays, besides these contexts described, most forms of Buddhism would locate their reading at private settings (Tanaka, 2007, p. 123). Public forms of reading are described in 'Appendix C: Reading typologies'.

## Destruction of texts

Evidence of the destruction of *Dharma*-texts began shortly after they were first written (Dowden, 2009, p. 143). Book destruction is due to monastic rivalries<sup>192</sup> and affiliations,<sup>193</sup> political prosecution,<sup>194</sup> or ideological control<sup>195</sup> (Steinkeilner, 2004, p. 19-20). Book destruction is attested in virtually all countries with Buddhist presence (Baumann, 2002, p. 89-90; Bowden, 2009, p. 143). Destroying, desecrating,<sup>196</sup> or abusing *Dharma*-texts imply a punishment, whose karmic retribution equals that of either the Buddha and his teachings (Campany, 1991, p. 41, 43).

*Dharma*-text were often miraculously spared destruction<sup>197</sup> (Campany, 1991, p. 42). Despite Ch'an/Zen dislike of textual transmission,<sup>198</sup> destruction of *Dharma*-texts<sup>199</sup> appears only exceptionally (Joskovich, 2019, p. 55).

Destruction can also serve other purposes. For instance, in Northern Thailand, merit is accrued by burning worn-out manuscripts and palm-leaf *Dharma*-texts are crushed into powder to make amulets (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 190; Crosby, 2014, p. 79; Crosby, 2020, p. 79).

### **Disappearance of reading**

*Dharma*-texts, like all phenomena, are impermanent, and will eventually disappear (Olson, 2013, p. 34). With the partial loss of the original recitation, many sutras were lost. The Buddha's teaching career prior to Ānanda becoming his attendant, after which he retained all teachings he witnessed, remained partially unrecorded. After Ānanda's passing more sutras were lost (Lamotte, 1984, p. 8; Lamotte, 1988, p. 163). Butön (p. 264-265) lists destroyed or lost portions of *Dharma*-texts.<sup>200</sup> Further loss occurs if practitioners attend to teachings other than the Buddha's or if they attend to the teachings not with faith and acceptance but for their poetic qualities (Lamotte, 1984, p. 9; Lamotte, 1988, p. 164). Incorrect memorization and failing to rehearse recitation add to scriptural loss (Gombrich, 2005, p. 78). Translation of recited scriptures might imply content loss (Coward, 1986, p. 299). A prophecy dictates that the *Dharma* shall disappear within 500, 1,000, or 5,000 years after the Buddha's death (Harvey, 2013, p. 80; Salomon, 2018, Chap. 2). *Dharma*-scriptures will disappear at the last stage of the degeneration of the *Dharma*<sup>201</sup> (Hartmann, 2009, p. 97). In another prophecy, after the disappearance of attainments and methods, scriptures and their commentaries will disappear, followed by the disappearance of signs and of relics (Nattier, 1991, p. 57). Writing down *Dharma*-texts was a way to ensure their preservation (Becher, 1992, p. 51).

This appendix has described the merit of copying, giving, and preserving *Dharma*-texts and has described some cultic functions related to the collecting of *Dharma*-texts. It has also surveyed some justifications for the destruction of *Dharma*-text and for the ultimate disappearance of reading.

## Appendix C: Reading typologies

This appendix surveys different typologies of reading *Dharma*-texts to show the diversity of modes of using *Dharma*-texts and the variety of settings where reading takes place.

### Public readings

Recitation and psalmody are the default modes of public reading in Buddhism (Drègue, 1991, p. 91).

Public readings, recitation, and sermons would have been the only exposure to *Dharma*-texts for most.<sup>202</sup> Reading, as indicated by numerous colophons, often started with a formula for protection (Kim, 2013, p. 8).

Reading stories as part of sermons, adding oral explanations, and public monastic reading at temple festivals, customarily on *Uposatha* days, possibly constitute one of the most extended reading practices (Dutt, 1962, p. 105; Tambiah, 1986, p. 103; McHale, 2004, p. 155). Public readings are first suggested in Aśokan inscriptions (Bloch, 1950, p. 43). Early Gandhāran literature also attest to public readings with *avadāna* compositions supplementing sermons (Salomon, Allchin and Barnard, 1999, p. 164). When reading in canonical languages, for instance Pāli, a paraphrase in the vernacular, for instance Sinhala, most likely follows (Rahula, 1966, p. 253).

Public readings of popular stories, like the *Jātaka*, had a ceremonial dimension. An individual might read a *Dharma*-text, but often monastics divided texts among themselves and read simultaneously (Veidlinger, 2007, p. 199). Readings vary around the calendar. Often performed around the Rains Retreat, reading the *Vessantara Jātaka* was used as thanksgiving for harvest, to petition for rainfall, to raise funds for the temple, or for merit (Collins, 1998, p. 376; Hansen, 2007, p. 28-29; Crosby, 2014, p. 108; May and Igunma, 2018, p. 233). Public readings of the biography of the Buddha, sometimes going through the night, are offered for *Visakha Puja* (Buddha's Day) (Swearer, 2010, p. 43-44). Chronicle readings and recitals in Sri Lanka situate audiences in historical continuity with the past, thus

providing a sense of identity and causing an aesthetic, transformative effect<sup>203</sup> (Berkwitz, 2004, p. 167, 231). Japanese tales also illustrate several acts of mass, public reading (Kornicky, 1998, p. 252).

Some literary genres, like Sinhala preaching texts (*baṇapot*) are meant to be read (Berkwitz, 2010, p. 154). Read aloud and rhythmically, *baṇapots* have both an aesthetic and a moral dimension (Deegalle, 2007, p. 17). Senior monastics might prefer to have a *baṇa* read to them rather than listen to a preacher due to differences in their status. Those unwilling or unable to attend *baṇa* readings might resort to reading books describing the virtues of the Buddha by themselves (Deegalle, 2007, p. 75-76). This might also be a convenient solution for contemporary lay practitioners (Wijayawardhana, 1979, p. 76).

## **Ritual readings**

Ritually reading the canon is for ‘turning the scripture’, that is, to activate the teachings. This reading recollects the Buddha’s first sermon or the first turning of the Wheel of *Dharma* (S v 420). In China and elsewhere, it consisted of skimming through the text without necessarily attending to the meaning, either whole or partially, individually or communally, in a ‘scripture perusal chamber’ (Welch, 1967, p. 103). Monarchs<sup>204</sup> could order the reading of *Dharma*-texts or the canon<sup>205</sup> to be performed for specific ceremonies or consecration rituals (Tambiah, 1984, p. 250). Monastics could also commit to reading the canon in solitary confinement over several years (Wu, 2016b, p. 62). In Ch’an/Zen, daily reading was embedded in daily monastic observances and reading was stipulated in monastics regulations (Welter, 2008, p. 126). Reading the *Kangyur* is a practice to commemorate eminent individuals (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 19). Ritually reading the canon also happened in China as an expression of filial piety towards parents (Wu, 2016b, p. 60).

## **Reading for protection and magic**

Buddhist texts serve a magic function independent of their reading (Van Schaik, 2020, p. 80). Some Mahāyāna sutras indicate that merely holding or being close to *Dharma*-books suffices to benefit from their prophylactic and protective properties (Apple, 2014, 28-29). Blessings can be dispensed by

monastics and ritual specialists through the imposition of *Dharma*-volumes (Elliot, Diemberger and Clemente, 2014b, p. 10).

*Dharma*-texts, often of the *parittā* and *rakṣa* genres, are worn as talismans or amulets for protection (Skilling, 1992, p. 164; Sivasundaram, 2014, p. 35). They are carried around the neck or on top of one's head, thus substituting a bodhisattva image, and activated by continuous chanting (Campany, 1999, p. 37-38; Elliot, Diemberger and Clement, 2014a, p. 70-71).

Reading scripture and magic formulae could also participate in magic ritual, notably for rainmaking (Van Schaik, 2020, p. 73-74). Spells were also employed to guarantee the efficient reading and memorising of texts (Van Schaik, 2020, p. 164).

Ritually reading/reciting Buddhist texts aids recovery from illness<sup>206</sup> (Anālayo, 2007, p. 16). *Prajñāpāramitā* texts are read for their healing properties (Lopez, 1996, p. 14; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 130). *Parittā* texts are possibly among the most popular texts read/recited for protection and to guard off evil (Winternitz, 1972, p. 80). For monastics in Sri Lanka, learning to read/recite *parittā* supposes a gradual introduction to monastic socialisation and the training required for meditation and wisdom (Blackburn, 1999a, p. 370-371). Of similar protective function are *rakṣā* texts (Skilling, 1992, p. 113, 167). Textual precedent for the healing properties of hearing/reading texts is found already in the Pāli canon.<sup>207</sup>

### **Cultic reading**

Possibly established by the sixth century, the first evidence for manuscript cultic reading comes from seventh-century Ellorā (Hartmann, 2009, p. 102; Kim, 2013, p. 25-26). Reciting the *Prajñāpāramitā*, the *Pañcarakṣā*, and other Mahāyāna texts imply invoking the presence of the protective and tutelary deities which personify these scriptures (Lewis, 2000, p. 154; Kim, 2013, p. 23, 28). By metonymy, sometimes a book substitutes the deity invoked<sup>208</sup> (Campany, 1991, p. 47). Reading as performance is preeminent when ritually reading. Thus, although the Nepali Vajrācāryas require specialised training, textual understanding is not expected (Hartmann, 2009, p. 102; Kim, 2013, p. 273-275). Additionally,

cultic readers require consecrations and permissions to officiate (Emmrich, 2009, p. 141). Participants are also expected to acquire certain requirements and follow some rules, like fasting before rituals (Gellner, 1996, p. 225). The ritual is conducted by dividing the scripture among individuals reading different portions of the text simultaneously (Gellner, 1996, p. 227). Ritual manuscripts often have conservation work done to ensure their accuracy and integrity (Emmrich, 2009, p. 146).

Cultic reading can also refer to meditating upon a manuscript in order to embody its content. This meditation can later be recalled without the manuscript (Kim, 2013, p. 120, 137). The physical handling of a manuscript, its iconographic programme, and its cultic potency make some Nepalese manuscripts like portable shrines (Kim, 2013, p. 132-133).

Cultic readings serve a number of purposes. The *Pañcarakṣā* and similar texts are read on births,<sup>209</sup> birthdays, weddings, to recover from illness,<sup>210</sup> when dying, before travelling, or against bad omens (Gellner, 1996, p. 231-232; Lewis, 2000, p. 155, 159, 160; Rigyal and Prude, 2017, p. 67). The practice of recollection and *parittā* chanting serve similar purposes in Theravāda societies (Harrison, 1992b, p. 219). Japanese literature contains examples of individuals who became immortals as a result of fasting and reading scripture (Fauré, 1998, p. 262). In Tibet and Bhutan, apotropaic readings could be performed by lay professionals unaffiliated to a monastery (Bechert and Gombrich, 1984, p. 246; Rigyal and Prude, 2017, p. 65-66).

In Tibetan Buddhism, the complete *Kangyur* is read as part of the festival of Saka Dawa, which celebrates the Buddha's Birth, Enlightenment, and *Parinirvāṇa*. The *Kangyur* is read mainly in Tibetan but also in translation, usually by several individuals communally concurrently.<sup>211</sup>

## **Reading in part**

### **Reading titles**

In ritual readings, the title of a *sūtra* represents the whole sutra. Reading/reciting scripture is then conducted by uttering the title or part of the title of a *sūtra*, or by reading/reciting the mantra



contained in that *sūtra*<sup>212</sup> (Smith, 1993, p. 172; Lopez, 1996, p. 185-186; Veidlinger, 2007, p. 120). Book cults allow for the hearing/reading of a *sūtra*'s title<sup>213</sup> as devotion. In Tibet, only the *Kangyur* is treated in this manner (Kapstein, 2000, p. 237n74). For Nichiren, metonymically reading/reciting the title of the *Lotus Sūtra* amounts to reading/reciting all of the teaching. It implies embodying the *Dharma*<sup>214</sup> and being in the Buddha's presence. Thus, chanting the title of the *Lotus Sūtra* constitutes Buddha-recollection (Anesaki, 1916, p. 16; Habito, 1999, p. 291, 293; Harvey, 2013, p. 216). A derivation of this practice is found in an apocryphal Chinese catalogue of sutra titles promoting its reading and copying as spiritual practice, the catalogue being a metaphor for the whole canon (Wu, 2016b, p. 64-65).

### Reading formulae

*Dhāraṇī* are formulaic summaries of scripture used to satisfy worldly concerns, like preventing snake bites or avoiding robbers (Martin, 2007, p. 210). *Dhāraṇī* were sometimes inscribed in paintings and *Dharma*-volumes to ensure protection (Martin, 2007, p. 221). *Dhāraṇī* need to be read/recited aloud as their efficacy depend on its sound (Kim, 2013, p. 28, 121). *Dhāraṇī* participate in a larger devotional dimension relaying on the magical power of letters (Martin, 2007, p. 224-225). *Mātikā* lists, *parittā* chants, *dhāraṇī* formulas, *mantra*, and seed-syllables participate in this form of partial or summarised reading (Gyatso, 1992b, p. 173-174). *Dhāraṇī* in particular are related to the holding and remembering of the teachings (Gyatso, 1992b, p. 177). Thus, remembering the Buddha's name, titles of *sūtras*, or summaries of teachings all participate in recollection as meditation (Harrison, 1992b, p. 227).

### Reading illustrated manuscripts

The physicality of *Dharma*-volumes affects the reading experience (Berkwitz, 2009, p. 36). Illustrations appear on the covers, frontispice, and/or narrative portions of *Dharma*-texts. Reading illustrated manuscripts produces an aesthetic and sensorial, predominantly visual, experience (Kim, 2013, p. 35). Illustrations support visualisation practices, and function as visual indexes and iconic representations of the text (Kim, 2013, p. 59-60, 116). More generally, finely produced *Dharma*-volumes become visual aids and support to meditation practices (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 29).

## **Pictorial reading**

Pictorial *sūtras*, developed in seventeenth-century Japan, use pictograms to represent the Japanese transliteration of the Chinese pronunciation of a *Dharma*-text. Thus, pictorial *sūtras* made texts like the *Heart Sūtra* available to a much wider audience. Reading pictorial *sūtras* precluded understanding and served only apotropaic, ritual functions (Eubanks, 2013).

## **Scripture not to be read**

The following examples describe symbolic uses of texts where reading is absent:

### **Relic deposits**

Scriptural fragments are installed as relics in full-sized and miniature *stūpas*<sup>215</sup> and images.<sup>216</sup> They sometimes accompany bodily relics (Pal and Meech-Pekarik, 1988, fig. 109; Berkwitz, Schober and Brown, 2009, p. 5; Crosby, 2014, p. 79; Galamboś, 2014, p. 39). These texts, sometimes worn-out manuscripts, are considered both *Dharma*-relics and substitute body organs (Bentor, 1995, p. 251; Zhiru, 2010, p. 98). As the epitome of the Buddha's teachings and a central Buddhist doctrine the Dependent Origination (*paṭiccasamuppāda*) formula is often found interred as a relic and inscribed in a variety of objects (Bourcher, 1991; De Simini, 2016, p. 11). Thus, objects containing that formula are infused with the whole *Dharma*<sup>217</sup> (Boucher, 1991, p. 1).

### **Burials and entombment**

Scriptures are also buried as *Dharma*-relics. Buddhists in Gandhāra, Tibet, East Asia, and possibly India, buried scriptures as though they were body-relics (Salomon, 2009, p. 22, 31; De Simini, 2016, p. 17). Burying scripture ensures its preservation and protects the sanctity of new or used *Dharma*-relics.<sup>218</sup> Archaeological evidence suggests scriptures were sometimes buried alongside human remains. Thus, burials become reliquaries (Salomon, 2006, p. 7; Salomon, 2009, p. 30). However, no extant textual evidence of sanctioned ritual interment for scripture survives to justify this practice (Salomon, 2009, p. 204-205). In Theravāda contexts, scriptures are sometimes kept in caskets resembling coffins (Reynolds, 1977, p. 377-378). In Tibet, tombs and temples containing remains of important teacher

and other individuals are sometimes furnished with scriptures (Watson, 2009, p. 480; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 119).

### **Implausible reading**

Several individuals show incredible reading abilities, like reading in the dark, precociously, speedily,<sup>219</sup> just by glancing over a text,<sup>220</sup> gaining instant understanding, or memorizing texts immediately.<sup>221</sup> Visionary experiences can also produce reading comprehension.<sup>222</sup>

### **Reading while sleeping and dreaming**

Other individuals also claim to be able to read while sleeping<sup>223</sup> or dreaming. Tantra in a genre of Buddhist literature often transmitted in dreams (Gray, 2009, p. 16). The fourth Karmapa slept surrounded by his books and was able to read and understand them in his dreams<sup>224</sup> (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 6). Other scriptures are also said to be transmitted via dreams.<sup>225</sup>

### **Impossible reading**

Sometimes written *Dharma*-texts are not meant to be read. Certain practices involve writing or printing *Dharma*-texts against surfaces, such as the sky<sup>226</sup> or water,<sup>227</sup> unable to support writing (Ekvall, 1964, p. 114; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 146). Secrecy dictated the need for some writing to be kept invisible and only revealed by some contraption.<sup>228</sup> Others urged intended readers to burn secret writings after reading.<sup>229</sup>

### **Ingesting as reading**

Bibliophagia, the ingesting of books, has the power to make whoever eats them to understand their contents. This is another form of embodiment of the *Dharma*. Tibetan examples present women placing small volumes in an adept's mouth, after which they would understand all doctrines contained in all scriptures (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 130). Ingesting operates as a metaphor for memorization, by which a reader embodies a text (Griffiths, 1999, p. 46). Drinking water which has been in contact with *Dharma*-texts also produces great benefits.<sup>230</sup>

## **Mechanically activated reading**

Related to the revolving libraries described above, other mechanically activated instances of reading aim at producing merit (Abé, 2005, p. 292).

### **Prayer wheels**

Prayer wheels are a very common form of verbalized religion (Ekvall, 1964, p. 122). Prayer wheels are cylindrical devices upon an axle, mostly handheld, which rotate by manual action. The cylinder contains *Dharma*-texts and has mantras inscribed on its surface. These are activated by rotating the cylinder, each turn equivalent to a reading/recitation of the *Dharma*-texts contained. Prayer wheels allow everyone, including illiterates and those unable to memorize texts, access to merit-making activities (Zhuru, 2010, p. 99; Shaw, 2009, p. 182; Harvey, 2013, p. 254). Large prayer wheels are placed on the perimeter of temples in Tibet and elsewhere. Solar-powered prayer-wheels also exist (Elliot, Diemberger and Clement, 2014a, p. 79). Digital and online prayer-wheels are also available.<sup>231</sup>

### **Prayer flags**

Prayer flags are colourful rectangular pieces of cloth containing woodblock-printed prayers, mantras, and images, which are activated by the wind. Often attached to mountain peaks, flagpoles, trees, or houses, prayer flags confer blessings to their surroundings and spread wholesome qualities, like compassion or wisdom (Ekvall, 1964, p. 41).

### **Circumambulation and walking**

Circumambulation, a merit-making activity listed in some Mahāyāna *sūtras*, consists in walking around a sacred object, in this case a *Dharma*-volume or collection, or carrying *Dharma*-volumes over one's head (Kapstein, 2000, p. 237n.74; Von Voorst, 2008, p. 9; Eubanks, 2011, p. 178; Harvey, 2013, p. 233). 'Turning' the scripture is activated by walking around it.

*Dharma*-texts are also activated by walking past or through them, as when *dhāraṇī* are affixed above doors for protection<sup>232</sup> (Martin, 2007, p. 211).

*Dharma*-volumes are taken on parade to confer blessings<sup>233</sup> or to enact some magic power.<sup>234</sup> This practice is attested in Tibet, Bhutan, and elsewhere (Goody, 1986, p. 16; Watson, 2009, p. 480).

### **Turning-reading**

Turning-reading (Japanese ‘*tendoku*’) is a way of reading scripture, usually the *Prajñāpāramitā*, by cascading a fan-fold book between the hands while reciting the *sūtra*’s title (Kennett, 2005, p. 203; Strong, 2015, p. 600). Scripture is activated mechanically and by reading the title only. *Tendoku* also includes ritual reading of selected portions of scripture at specific times of the year, for instance New Year’s Eve (Baroni, 2002, p. 339).

### **Reading to the other**

#### **The dying, the dead, funeral readings, and ghosts**

Reading *Dharma*-texts to the dying and the dead is a customary practice in Buddhism.<sup>235</sup>

The *Tibetan Book of the Dead* (*Bardo Thödöl*),<sup>236</sup> a Nyingma *terma*, is traditionally read aloud, next to the corpse, by a friend or teacher, to help the deceased through the interval (*bardo*) between death and rebirth (Lopez, 1998, p. 49; Ray, 2002, p. 354-355; Flores, 2008, p. 165). Those attending the reading also benefit from it as they learn about the dying process (Flores, 2008, p. 168, 181). The *Bardo Thödöl* became popular in the West<sup>237</sup> for its association in the 1960s with LSD-taking and by emphasizing its psychological aspects<sup>238</sup> (Lopez, 1995b, p. 265; McMahan, 2008, p. 53). In Amdo, excerpts from Shabkar’s autobiography were also popular as funeral reading (Ricard, 2001, xiii).

Newar Buddhists read the *Pañcarakṣā* during funerals and memorial services out of compassion for those who died inauspiciously (Lewis, 2000, p. 159). Pure Land Buddhists read *Dharma*-texts to the dying, and encourage confession and chanting of the *nianfo* to obtain a good rebirth (Stevenson, 2007b, p. 448).

In Sri Lanka, some devout laity wrote merit-books (*punyapustaka/puññapotthaka*) detailing their Buddhist practice. Merit-books were read then to their authors on their deathbed to provide comfort

and to ensure a good rebirth (Mhv 32, 24-75; Rahula, 1966, p. 254; Malalgoda, 1976, p. 16-17; Lamotte, 1988, p. 430-431; Trainor, 1997, p. 169). The *Satipaṭṭhānasutta* or another Pāli sutta is also read after someone's passing as a meditation on impermanence and death (Deegalle, 2007, p. 191n35).

In Japan, selected scriptures were read to women at their funeral, particularly the *Transforming Women into Buddhas*, so they may be reborn as male and eventually become bodhisattvas (Fauré, 2003, p. 101). The precepts can also be read to a dead person to confer ordination posthumously (Powers, 2016, p. 30). Ritual readings were offered to placate ghosts and guide them towards salvation (Fauré, 2003, p. 77).

Some people also chose to read *Dharma*-texts in preparation for dying.<sup>239</sup>

### **Animals**

Popular narratives mention animals benefiting from hearing *Dharma*-texts recited<sup>240</sup> (Smith, 1993, p. 163). Animals also recite texts: the *Abhidharmakośa* was so widely read in a seventh-century hermitage that even parrots recited it (Winternitz, 1972, p. 358).

### **Criminals**

The Pāli poem *Kāla-virati-gāthā* was reportedly read to criminals to encourage them to abandon their evil state (Malalasekera, 2013, p. 234).

### **Gods**

Some *sūtras* contain references to deities listening to the Buddha. Likewise, gods also attend scriptural reading<sup>241</sup> (Fauré, 2003, p. 270). Gods, notably Māra, can also deter readers from reading certain texts (Hureau, 2015, p. 112).

### **Reading by the other**

Buddhas and *Bodhisattvas*<sup>242</sup> only read scripture for the sake of others. Whereas *Dharma*-texts available to humans are few and brief due to their short lifespan and weak memory, *devas*, *ḍākiṇī*,<sup>243</sup> *nāgas*,<sup>244</sup> and Asura kings of long life and strong memories have myriad, much longer texts (Zacchetti,

2016, p. 90-91). Certain *Bodhisattvas* can read in realms other than the human.<sup>245</sup> Spirits who read *Dharma*-texts appear in Japanese secular literature (Fauré, 1998, p. 253).

This appendix has surveyed several reading typologies and transmission settings. This appendix also enriches the variety of examples of reading and shows that Buddhist literature contains numerous references to reading.

## Appendix D: Data analysis

This section introduces the data which forms the basis for the analysis in section 'Reading responses' in Chapter 5.

Given its size, it is impracticable to include all these data within this dissertation.

The accompanying CD and USB drive contains the spreadsheet file 'Appendix D: Data analysis' containing several tabs:

- Facebook posts: Between March and September 2020, several Buddhist-related Facebook groups were monitored for content discussing reading and book recommendations. This tab presents the posts selected with related metadata. The individual recommendation for authors and titles were collated to produce a list of top-ranking titles and authors.
- Ranking of authors: this list has been compiled using the posts published on Facebook. This resulted in 1,217 individual recommendations or discussions for an author or a title. Highlighted in green are the top-ten ranking authors (excluding websites and scripture).
- Ranking of titles: This list has been compiled using the posts published on Facebook. This resulted in 1,217 individual recommendations or discussions for an author or a title. Highlighted in green are the top-ten ranking titles. The final selection has been chosen to reflect a wide representation of authors and Buddhist traditions. The book by Ambedkar has not been included since the Facebook sample showed that all recommendations came from similar sources. When an author has more than one title in this selection, only the highest ranking has been included. Hesse's title has been excluded as it is a novel. Roylance's title has been excluded as all instances of this recommendation came from the author across different Facebook posts. The final selection has been made to reflect popularity ranking school/sect, lay/ordained and gender diversity. Reviews to different editions of the same title can be displayed in a combined view and sorted by review date.



- Goodread posts: between late December 2020 and early January 2021, a combined view of all editions for each of the titles selected for content analysis was identified and sorted by order of the most recent reviews. Of these, only reviews in English (the majority) were considered. Fifty reviews for each title were considered.
- Reviews and keywords: comprising a list of the 500 reviews used for content analysis. Keywords denote salient words, symbols, or themes identified for analysis.
- Content analysis: following a list of keywords of words, symbols, and themes identified in the reviews, this tab represents a visualization of the most often used terms and salient characteristics of the reading experience of these reviewers.

Appendix D is also available from the following link:

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1wmhGPSwgwMaWXbB9ig7ervPfoSLaqKKF/view?usp=sharing>

## Appendix E: Corpus

A database with over 14,500 entries with examples of reading as Buddhist practice and as evidence of the reception of *Dharma*-texts supports this dissertation.

Given the size of this corpus, it is impracticable to include this database within this dissertation.

The accompanying CD and USB drive contains the file 'Appendix E: Corpus' with this document.

Appendix E: Corpus is also available from the following link:

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1tl7qZRZIERrDOBDHhyHxzkDZxPV-i9As/view?usp=sharing>

## Notes

<sup>1</sup> For a literature review of the history of reading, see Finkelstein and McCleery, 2013, p.101-103.

<sup>2</sup> Tweed (2000, p. 46) estimates that between 1893 and 1907 around 2,000-3,000 Euro-Americans would identify as Buddhists, but tens of thousands should be considered Buddhist sympathizers. These were all largely introduced to Buddhist ideas and practices through reading.

<sup>3</sup> For instance, Kasulis (2007) has surveyed the reception of D. T. Suzuki.

<sup>4</sup> For instance, Campany (2018) traces the reception of the *Lotus Sūtra* in China in the early medieval period through the creation of miracle tales.

<sup>5</sup> Kornicki (1998, p. 256) observes that Japanese learned monks' and courtiers' diaries often record little more than titles of books read. This could be taken as the basis to analyse reading habits and literary reception. A modern expression of this is found, for instance, in Watts' autobiography (1973) or Ñāṇavīra's diaries (1988).

<sup>6</sup> Baldanza (2018, p. 18) has studied marginalia in books held in Vietnamese monastic collection as indication for readership.

<sup>7</sup> 'He [gTsañ-pa Rinpoche] also read the text on the Mahāmāyā. He understood the meaning of the terms, but thought that he was not clear about one *śloka*. (...) He went over the commentary on the first half of the *Tattvasaṃgraha* and believed in the profound meaning of the book. For several days he was filled by the notion of a clear sky, without having previously meditated on it' (BA p. 293-294).

<sup>8</sup> Rinchen Tashi Lodrö reports that his master wept on reading of Butön's death (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 28). Myōe writes: 'Everytime I read them [some verses in *Avatamsaka Sutra*], these passages move me profoundly, and I have no means to stop my tears from falling down' (in Abé, 2006, p. 157).

<sup>9</sup> Gyatso (2018, p. 32) suggests that traditions such as the Tibetan are better placed to understand texts in context since it combines study and practice.

<sup>10</sup> The teaching is said to be 'beautiful in the beginning, the middle and the ending, which in spirit and the letter proclaim the absolutely perfected and purified holy life' so that one that is learned 'remembers them, recites them, reflects on them and penetrates them with vision' (D iii 267).

<sup>11</sup> For instance, scriptural studies, i.e., scriptural reading, is the third of the five regulation of Sōn Master Hanam (Uhlmann, 2010, p. 180). The Order of Interbeing includes extensive references to reading activity and to possessing texts (Nhất Hạnh, 2004).

<sup>12</sup> '(The Blessed One said: O Son of good family, it is good, it is good.) Just so, many indeed, O Sons of the Jina, are the skill in means and the maturing of beings of the Tathāgatas. Having known the course of conduct of beings having various inclinations in accordance with [their] mental disposition, (as is [their] training, in accordance with [their] roots of merit), he teaches *Dharma*: (...) bhikṣus, some are to be trained by seeking after (the copying and having copied) and reading and worshipping (of [this] sūtra), some are [to be trained] by seeking after the adorning [of it] with lamps and flowers and incense and perfumes and garlands and necklaces, (being not possessed of the *Dharma* which is skilled in the highest meaning and the dharma of Nirvāṇa' (*Buddhabalādājānaprāti-Hāryavikurvāṇanirdeśa-Sūtra* 1290, in Schopen, 1978, p. 325-326).

<sup>13</sup> See Appendix A 'Reading biographies.'

<sup>14</sup> Padmasambhava said about faith: 'Again Master Padma said: Tsogyal, to escape samsaric existence you must have faith in the path of liberation (...) Faith arises when reading the profound sūtras and tantras. Faith arises when associating with faithful companions. (...) when following a master and spiritual teacher (...) when being in painful difficulties (...) when reading the sacred teachings of your inclination.' (Padmasambhava, in Kungsang, 1994, p. 136).

<sup>15</sup> For Sakyong Miphan (2003, p. 96) 'We take trust from clarity and confidence. Perhaps a moment of clarity is what inspired us to practice in the first place. We saw a statue of the Buddha, read a book, or even saw a friend meditating, and we had an immediate sense of clarity about wanting to do this.'

<sup>16</sup> Pema Chödrön (1997, p. 118) reports she reads and rereads Milarepa for advice.

<sup>17</sup> Sumedho (in Walshe, 2012, p. 12) writes, 'Only then can one insightfully know the Truth beyond words.'

<sup>18</sup> Pai-chang (in Cleary, 2012, p. 86) writes, 'In reading the scriptures and studying the doctrines, you should turn all words right around and apply them to yourself. All the verbal teachings point to the inherent nature of the immediate mirroring awareness.'

<sup>19</sup> Hakuin (in Waddell, 1994, p. 59) writes, 'When from time to time they read the scriptures that contain the words and teachings of the buddha-patriarchs, they will illuminate those ancient teachings with their own minds.'

---

<sup>20</sup> The translators of Longchenpa's *Trilogy of rest* suggest that its profundity 'emerges only with slow, attentive, and repeated reading' (Longchenpa, 2018, xv).

<sup>21</sup> Atiśa's *Lamp of Enlightenment* (Verse 13) reads: 'Having learned about the infinite benefits / Of the intention to gain full enlightenment / By reading this sutra or listening to a teacher, / Arouse it repeatedly to make it steadfast' (in Gyatso, 2004).

<sup>22</sup> For instance, Aśvaghoṣa's *Buddhacarita* is intended for an aristocratic audience, the *Apaṇṇaka Sutta* (M 60) implies an audience of laypeople less versed in the *Dharma* than monastics, and Śāntideva's *Bodhicaryāvatāra* (Bca) addresses a monastic audience (Flores, 2008, p. 22, 73, 147). Śāntideva's *Śikṣāsamuccaya* (Śs) comprises an audience of monks at early stages of their training (Griffiths, 1999, p. 137). The *Vimalakīrti Sūtra* was virtually required reading for the aristocracy during Tang China (Campany, 1991, p. 36). Fronsdal (2005, xxvii) presumes a monastic audience for the *Dhammapada* (Dhp) while acknowledging its wider appeal. Roebuck (2010, xvi) distinguishes *Dhammapada* verses geared either towards monastics or laity, while acknowledging many are generally applicable to all. The *Sūtra of Upāsaka Precepts* (Uś) is destined for a lay readership (Shih, 1994, p. 1). Wedemeyer (2014, p. 179) argues that Tantric literature presupposes a monastic readership.

<sup>23</sup> Ajahn Chah writes: 'Studying the Vinaya with Venerable Ajahn Mun I learned many things. As I sat and listened, understanding arose. (...) I just put my attention into my own mind and gradually did away with the texts' (Chah, 2011, p. 535). Ajahn Chah clarifies: 'Actually the scriptures are pointers along the path of practice. If we really understand the practice, then reading or studying are both further aspects of meditation. But if we study and then forget ourselves, it gives rise to a lot of talking and fruitless activity' (Chah, 2011, p. 547).

<sup>24</sup> For Myōe, both *sūtra* reading and relic worship were means to bring the past into the present (Unno, 2006, p. 141).

<sup>25</sup> One instance of conversion which also illustrates this point: 'My own spiritual life was triggered at age fourteen by the gift of T. Lobsang Rampa's book *The Third Eye*, a semifictional account of mystical adventures in Tibet. It was exciting and thought-provoking and offered a world to escape to what seemed far better than the one I inhabited' (Kornfield, 1993, p. 4).

<sup>26</sup> This dictum is occasionally repeated by others: 'At the time of his [Brom's] passing away, he said to Po-to-ba: "I did not discover anyone else who could be your teacher. Look upon the sūtras as (your) teacher"' (BA p. 264). Also, 'Then sKam asked him: "Whom should I ask, then feeling uncertain, after you had gone?" Dam-pa replied: "The best kalyāṇa-mitra is your own Mind! A Teacher, able to remove doubts, will emerge from within your own Mind. The second kalyāṇa-mitra is an Ārya (the scriptures of the Buddha), therefore you should read the Prajñāpāramitā. Verily the lowest king of kalyāṇa-mira is the individual. But you will not meet me again. You can discuss with the brothers who had experienced meditation"' (BA p. 898-899).

<sup>27</sup> Shaw (2006, p. 54n4) adduces one of the attributes or emblems used to represent the *Dharma* as weapon could be a manuscript.

<sup>28</sup> 'Not from mere speech nor solely by listening / can one advance on this firm path of practice / by which the wise ones, the meditators, are realised from the bondage of Māra' (S i 24).

<sup>29</sup> 'One should keep oneself occupied all the time with wholesome deeds such as: learning, teaching, memorizing, reading, scrutinizing, and chanting the Buddhist scriptures; (...) When one does so, mental defilements do not have much opportunity to arise, and most of the time wholesome mental states will arise at the six sense doors instead' (Sayadaw, 2016, p.18). Taixu (in Pittman, 2001, p. 213-214) is said to experience the abandonment of the defilements while reading.

<sup>30</sup> For instance, reading is included in the second power used as method in Mahāmudrā to purify negative emotions (Tashi Namgyal, 2019, p. 160). 'Meanwhile, I lived as a priest of a small temple. I reached forty, the age when one is not supposed to be bothered any longer by doubts. One night, I decided to take another look at the Lotus Sutra. I got out my only lamp, turned up the wick, and began to read it once again. I read as far as the third chapter, the one on parables. Then, just like that, all the lingering doubts and uncertainties vanished from my mind. They suddenly ceased to exist. (...) Teardrops began cascading down my face (...) A loud involuntary cry burst from the depths of my being and I began sobbing uncontrollably (...) ' (Hakuin, in Waddell, 1994, p. 33). Likewise, Milarepa writes: 'If sometimes doubts arise, and skepticism, / One should read the holy sayings of the Buddha. / With conviction in the true words of the *Dharma*, / Confidence and faith in one's heart will grow!' (Chang, 1962, p. 152). Kornfield repeats, 'Doubt can also be dissolved by developing faith. We can ask questions of read great books' (Kornfield, 1993, p. 98).

<sup>31</sup> 'Abandon defiled thoughts concerning the woman and substitute wholesome thoughts for them by discussing or teaching the Dhamma, reading books or scriptures, chanting, doing volunteer work, and so on' (Sayadaw, 2016, p. 18).

<sup>32</sup> Ajahn Thiradhammo (2014, p. 135-136) relates how, when lacking energy and inspiration for practice, he would read: 'The book I kept aside for my monastic emergency was the poems of the enlightened monks and

nuns, the *Theragatha* and *Therigatha* (...). So when I lost my own inspiration I opened these texts and read these profound stories of different people and the dedicated ways in which they practised. And they all succeeded, they all realized enlightenment (...). Another valuable lesson from reading these accounts was learning the diverse ways in which people practised.'

<sup>33</sup> However, Jingpa (2016, p. 38, 89) suggests that hearing/reading/seeing hells depicted, for instance, should be enough to inspire someone in the path.

<sup>34</sup> 'But at this point he does not add, 'It is by reading alone that I myself am teaching you all these profound principles, and not by personal perception.' He sells himself for gain and aggrandisement' (From the *Ākaśa-garbha Sūtra*, in Ss 62).

<sup>35</sup> 'To read and chant the Sutras is the second preliminary grade' in the Tendai system (Tendai H. p. 39).

<sup>36</sup> It is recommended practice to read a few verses by Longchenpa before settling in meditation (Longchenpa, 2017, xxiii).

<sup>37</sup> Preaching texts (*baṇa*) are read aloud to meditators wishing to develop wisdom in Sri Lanka (Deegalle, 2007, p. 76).

<sup>38</sup> Zhu Xi (in Kornicki, 1998, p. 259-260) recommends reading less but more intensely: 'The ideal reader should be able to know the core texts so well that he is free of the written word.' This is also exemplified by the following case: 'When master Ngaripa was a child, his father said, "Since you are the son of a monk, you need good qualities. And for that you must know how to read, so read this," and gave him the volume of the Compendium of Lessons and left to recite the *Dharma*. When he came back, the boy was playing among the children. His father scolded him, "Are you like other children? Not studying how to read, and acting like this!" "I have nothing to read," Ngaripa replied. "Where did the volume of the Compendium of Lessons go?" "I memorized it, down to the small notes"' (Stearn, 2006, p. 187).

<sup>39</sup> Mhv XXXVIII 16-8 has a monk reciting from a book under a tree, supposedly to memorize the text (Collins, 1992, p. 122).

<sup>40</sup> Chu-hung establishes the following link: 'If people read the sutras, the sutras which are the words of the Buddha, they should practice buddha-remembrance.' (in Cleary, 1994, p. 22).

<sup>41</sup> Miln 78 cites ways by which mindfulness arises, one of which is 'from reference to books.' Miln 80 suggests using books as reminders for recollection.

<sup>42</sup> 'After reading the Ratnakūṭa-sūtra the Venerable gLiñ understood himself to have been the Bodhisattva Vīryaprabha, one of the sixty monks' (BA p. 660).

<sup>43</sup> '[Abbot Rinpoche gLañ-luñ-pa] On one occasion he read through the large commentary of the rTsa-ltuñ and by the power of his faith (in that book) he saw for six days his own body as a cakra-maṇḍala (...). He also read through the *Mādhyamakāvatāra*, composed by the ācārya Candrakīrti. He perceived all visual objects to be similar to rainbows. Again during five or six days this vision of all internal and external objects vanished amidst his daily work, and then became similar to the Sky' (BA p. 298).

<sup>44</sup> 'At the age of 8, the faculty of prescience was born in him [*Dharmasvāmin* Nam-mkha' dpal-bzañ-po]. At the age of 10, he studied the notes and commentary on the Hevajra-Tantra and other texts. Signs peculiar to the Sadaṅga (yoga) were observed in him without practicing meditation. At the age of 11, he felt boundless commiseration and sadness. He perceived the meaning of profound scriptures' (BA p. 635).

<sup>45</sup> For Ōmori (2001, p. 75) 'Ten minutes of zazen before reading and the momentary immersion in samadhi before work—how well they help us enjoy our work and reading, and to what a great extent they enhance our efficiency!'

<sup>46</sup> The Sinhalese monk Ratanapāla has: 'As my faith and discipline grew, and I read more and more in the scriptures, my knowledge of Dhamma grew so that I associated with sinful monks less and less' (in Carrithers, 1983, p. 152). Tenzin Gyatso says: 'Learning is gained by listening to teachings, reading *Dharma* books, reflecting on their meaning, and discussing the *Dharma* with others' (Gyatso and Chodron, 2018, p. 219).

<sup>47</sup> In order: *sutamaya-ñāṇa*, *cintāmaya-ñāṇa*, and *bhāvanāmaya-ñāṇa*.

<sup>48</sup> 'Wisdom is obtained from studying the twelve divisions of the Tathāgata's scriptures, which disperse doubts, and from reading the secular treatises, which distinguish good from bad. Wisdom is to discern well the twelve divisions of the scriptures; (...)' (Uś Chap. xxviii, 1075c).

<sup>49</sup> In true Zen parlance, Maezumi Rōshi (2002, p. 69) expresses it as 'Reading books is not the way to solve the problem. Not reading books is not the way to solve the problem.'

<sup>50</sup> For instance, Shuchen Tsültrim Rinchen, Degé monastery great editor, lamented that his efforts around books might have been wasted as books lack much potential for spiritual development (Schaeffer, 1994, p. 4).

<sup>51</sup> This second predicament encapsules Shinran's attitude towards reading: 'I am pointing to the moon with my finger in order to show it to you. Why do you look at my finger and not the moon?' (Shinran, in Nasu, 2006, p. 253).

---

<sup>52</sup> Given the availability of texts and books in Buddhism and the presence of Buddhist publishing activities, Díez de Velasco (2018, p. 96) calls Buddhism a religion of the library.

<sup>53</sup> For instance, Hua-yen/Kegon favour the *Avatamsaka Sūtra*; T'ien T'ai/Tendai favour the *Lotus Sūtra*.

<sup>54</sup> 'Previously, intelligent monks (had) preserved the text of the three piṭakas and its commentary orally; but (now) when the monks saw the hāni [loss, decay, diminution, abandonment] of beings they came together and had them written in books, in order that the Teaching should endure for a long time.' (Dīpavaṃsa XX 20-1; Mahāvamsa XXXIII 100-1; Collins, 1994, p. 97).

<sup>55</sup> Rahula (1966, p. 288) points out that today's equivalent for a learned person could be 'well-read'.

<sup>56</sup> For a list of types of *Dharma*-reciters, see Adikaram (1946, p. 24-32). For *Dharma*-reciters in the Mahāyāna, see Drewers (2011, p. 334, 336, 334n11).

<sup>57</sup> Bowden (2009, p. 117-119) surveys all theories argued for the writing down of the *Tipiṭaka* in Sri Lanka.

<sup>58</sup> One of the legends has a group of women reading scripture by lamplight having completed their household chores (Dutt, 1962, p. 236).

<sup>59</sup> For example, Vin I 42.2, 48.2; Vin IVb 128, 304. Horner (2012a, xxxvi, p. 177n1; 2014b, xii) discusses occurrences and meanings of writing in Pāli literature.

<sup>60</sup> For instance, Jāt 181, 214, 377, 388.

<sup>61</sup> Writing appears among a list of several other crafts, including accountancy, mathematics, poetry, and debate (Ud 3.9). These also appear in Miln. 59 and 178. Writing is one of the high crafts (Vin iv 7) and one of the mundane actions (ABK iv 254).

<sup>62</sup> For example, Miln 42 has letter writing and Miln 71 has an elder who is a teacher of writing, and another teacher of writing at Miln 349.

<sup>63</sup> E.g. Nāgārjuna's *Sūtrasamuccaya* (second century) or Śāntideva's *Śokāśamuccaya* (eight century).

<sup>64</sup> See appendix A 'Pedagogical reading' for a description of reading material in some Theravāda settings.

<sup>65</sup> See appendix A 'Cult of the book.'

<sup>66</sup> The Buddha appears to have preached a text to a selected few who, forty years after the Buddha's passing, hid it in rock formations, caves, *stūpas*, or trusted it to supernatural beings, while waiting for it to reappear in the world half a millennium later (Harrison, 2003, p. 124).

<sup>67</sup> The *Hevajra Tantra* (Hvt, Chap. 7) stipulates the text should be kept hidden while travelling.

<sup>68</sup> Teacher-student relationships in all Buddhist traditions require students relinquishing to teachers for teacher to transmit the content of scripture (Vism iii 126).

<sup>69</sup> Sakyong Mipham (2003, p. 81) illustrates this scenario: 'I remember once participating in a ritual that lasted several weeks with His Holiness Dilgo Khyentse Rinpoche. We were sitting (...), listening to him read from a text for about eleven hours a day. This is called "oral transmission," (...). We sat cross-legged on mats while volume after volume was read aloud in such rapid-fire Tibetan that it was nearly impossible to follow. People fidgeted and whispered, and some of the young monks in the back got into rice-throwing wars. We didn't know how long it would take to read through this text, but each day we hoped the next day would be the last.'

<sup>70</sup> 'When he was listening to the exposition of the Saṃvara-Tantra, a dākiṇī gave him the permission (to read the text)' (BA p. 447).

<sup>71</sup> Shabkar offers an example of a *lung*: after producing a series of visualizations, 'I gave the transmission, reading with a clear, loud voice; at the end I placed the volumes in Kunzang's head, praying that these teachings might benefit all those who would see, hear, remember, or touch them' (Shabkar p. 249).

<sup>72</sup> Shabkar (2018, p. 176) offers an example: 'I gave these instructions to benefit my disciples at various times during my stay at Kailash, and whatever of the profound and vast *Dharma* teachings were found useful were written down. These notes were subsequently gathered and laid out in this book—a veritable banquet of instruction. I gave everyone the reading transmission along with an explanation of the entire volume. At the conclusion, my disciples presented me with many gifts and arranged a ganachakra feast.'

<sup>73</sup> An example is the foundational story of a text (*sūtra* or *mantra*) falling from the sky into a Tibetan palace. The king, not knowing what to do, resorted to worshipping it (Butön, p. 279). The later emperor Songtsen Gampo (d. 649) learnt its content and encouraged the creation of the Tibetan alphabet and the translation of scriptures from India (Elliot, Diemberger and Clemente, 2014b, p. 7).

<sup>74</sup> When a Bön king regain power in Tibet, 'The temple doors of Samyé and Ramoché were sealed with clay, and most Buddhist texts hidden among the cliffs of Lhasa' (Butön, 2013, p. 290). 'A dākiṇī known as the "Mad-One of Lha-sa" uttered a prediction, following which the Master was able to extract the history of Lha-sa from inside a beam (in the Jo-khañ), but she did not allow him to keep it for more than one day. All his disciples shared the manuscript and prepared copies of it. In the evening of the same day, the manuscript was again hidden inside the beam' (BA p. 285).

---

<sup>75</sup> According to Eisai's regulations, 'every day, one fascicle from the scriptures is read by each monk daily', or the equivalent of reading the canon six times over within one year in a temple comprising one hundred monastics (Welter, 2008, p. 126).

<sup>76</sup> The Sixth Patriarch of Ch'an, Hui-neng, allegedly could not read (Wright, 1998, p. 20).

<sup>77</sup> 'A special transmission outside the scriptures, that does not rely on words and letters' (Attributed to Bodhidharma, in Heine and Wright, 2004, p. 4). However, Bodhidharma is also said to have read of the scriptures available to him in translation (Riggs, 2008, p. 257).

<sup>78</sup> Te-shan Hsüan-chien (780/82-865) burned his collection of commentaries on the *Diamond Sūtra* (Seizan and Sasaki, 1972, p. 73).

<sup>79</sup> 'But later, when I realized that they were only medicines for salvation and displays of opinion, I threw them [the scriptures] all away. Then in my search for Tao, I turned to Ch'an.' (Lin-chi, in Seizan and Sasaki, 1972, p. 73). Likewise, Hsiang-yen Chih-hsien (ninth century) threw away his collection of *sūtra* exegetical material (Seizan and Sasaki, 1972, p. 73).

<sup>80</sup> 'If the sūtras were to be discarded, Rinzai and Unmon might also need to be discarded. If we cannot rely upon the Buddhist sūtras, we are without water to drink, and without a dipper to scoop water' (Sbgz. 3 Bukkyo 39).

<sup>81</sup> Yamada Mumon said: 'First, we must study the sutras and read reverently the records left by the teachers of the past in order to determine where our own nature is. Sometimes you hear it said that Zen monks do not have to read books or to study. When did this misleading idea get started? It's ridiculous to think that this could possibly be true. We say Zen is "a separate transmission outside the teachings," but it is only because there are teachings that there is something transmitted separate from it. If there were no teaching necessary in the first place, you could not speak of a transmission separate from it. If we do not first study the sūtras and ponder the records of the ancients, we will end up going off in the wrong direction altogether. The ancient teachers engaged in all branches of scholarship and studied all there was to study; but just through scholarship alone, they were not able to settle what was bothering them. It was then that they turned to Zen. That is why their Zen has real power and dynamism. If you have no understanding of Buddhism, no knowledge of the words of the *Dharma*, it does not matter how many years you sit, your zazen will all be futile' (Yamada, in Mohr, 2000, p. 297). The Tendai school resolved this paradox by suggesting a path where enlightenment is impossible outside reading/hearing scripture (Stone, 2006, p. 162).

<sup>82</sup> See Goldberg (1987) for a study of 'recorded sayings' as a literary genre.

<sup>83</sup> Cleary (2005h, p. 237-239) offers advice on how to best approach the study of koan through reading.

<sup>84</sup> Fa-yuan writes, 'Have you not seen the tens of thousands of verses of the Flower Ornament Scripture and the thousands of poems of the Zen masters? Both are profuse and vivid, with elegant language, all of them are refined and pure, without padding. They are hardly the same as imitation of worldly customs with all their fripperies' (in Cleary, 1997, p. 142).

<sup>85</sup> Kasulis (1985a, p. 83) reflects on his own experiences of reading *Shōbōgenzō*: 'to read *Shōbōgenzō* is to be ensnared in the vines of words (kattō), yet at the same time, its very complexity reveals Dōgen's own personal presence and gives us the opportunity to entangle our own entanglements with his.'

<sup>86</sup> Fa-yen advises, 'For writing to be a pathway in later times and true in the mouths of the multitudes it is still necessary to study precedents, and then it is essential to suit it to the occasion' (in Cleary, 1997, p. 142).

<sup>87</sup> 'In the past I [Baiyun] was living in seclusion in the library at Guizong monastery and read through scriptures and histories, many hundreds of them crossed my eyes. The books were extremely worn and old, yet as I opened each volume I had a sense of new discovery' (CB Lesson 33).

<sup>88</sup> National Teacher Shōichi of Tōfoku says (in Bielefeldt, 2007, p. 150): 'The sūtras and spells [dhārāṇī] are not words: they are the original mind of all beings. They are speech, intended for those who have lost their original minds, that teaches through various similes in order to bring about awakening to the original mind and put an end to birth and death in delusion. One who awakens to his original mind and returns to the origin reads the true sūtra.'

<sup>89</sup> 'Under a tree I'm reading / Lao-tzu, quietly perusing. / Ten years not returning, / I forgot the way I had come' (Hekiganroku Case 34).

<sup>90</sup> '[In the order of] Great Master Kokaku of Un-go-zan mountain, the story goes, there is a monk who is reading a sūtra in his quarters. The Great Master asks from outside window, "Ācārya, what sūtra is that you are reading?" The monk replies, "The Vimalakīrti Sutra". The Master says, "I am not asking you if it is the Vimalakīrti Sutra. That which you are reading is a What Sutra". At this the monk is able to enter' (Sbgz.1 Kankin 206).

<sup>91</sup> This work was soon translated into Asia languages, e.g., a Burmese translation appeared in 1886 (Foxeus, 2017, p. 232n18).

<sup>92</sup> Bond (1988, p. 110) reports the curious incidence in which monastics tasked with translating the canon into Sinhala for the Jayanti project opted for a Sinhala literary style rather than a popular translation, which rendered

the end result outside of the understanding of the common reader, the laity thus resorting to purchasing these translated volumes as gifts for monastics, rather than for reading themselves. Hansen (2007, p. 143) points that several Cambodian monastic libraries had manuscripts in scripts and languages unintelligible to the population by the beginning of the twentieth century, and how modernizing Buddhist trends advocated the use of Khmer scripts and languages in new printed editions. Buddhādāsa Bhikkhu is a Thai monastic exemplary for his pioneering efforts in translating scripture so that educated Thai could access it directly (Wiles, 2016, p. 645).

<sup>93</sup> Goldberg (1999, p. 345-346) includes Dharmapala, Olcott, Ambedkar, Rhys Davids, Müller, Carus, Soen and Suzuki, among others. These in turn influenced a second generation of Buddhists through reading: Watts, Fromm, Kapleau, Kerouac, Ginsberg, or Snyder, among others (Coleman, 2001, p. 58-59, 62, 63; McMahan, 2008, p. 118-119). In the same vein, Wright (1998, vii) cites Arnold's influence over Blofeld. Bell (1991, p. 30) notes the impact of Victorian publications in a second generation of readers in the UK, particularly through the texts made available by the Pali Text Society. Bluck (2006, p. 179) cites Humphreys and Conze as influential authors in 1950s Britain.

<sup>94</sup> D. S. Wright (1998, viii) offers a pertinent example of his own first reading on Buddhism: 'In 1968, under the influence of the spirit of the age, I received Blofeld's transmission. Purchasing a paperback copy of Huang Po from the "Oriental Wisdom" section of my local bookstore, I too began reading Zen. The activity of reading Zen at that time placed one within a specific cultural tradition, and entailed a particular style of reading. It meant reading "romantically," and thus receiving the transmission of Huang Po through the mediation of a prominent lineage of modern romantics — Blake and Wordsworth, Emerson and Thoreau, all the way up through Kerouac, Watts, . . . and John Blofeld. Romantics in Blofeld's era could be characterized by their openness to cultural and historical ideals quite other than their own. They assumed that through speculative, imaginative excursions beyond the conventions of their own time and place, fundamental forms of wisdom and transformation were possible.'

<sup>95</sup> Psychologists Kristeller (2003) and Taylor (2003) illustrate their discovering Buddhism through reading and also their understanding of psychology through the mediation of psychologizing Buddhist interpretations.

<sup>96</sup> 'This means that the Lamrim should be learned under the tutelage of a qualified teacher and not merely by trying to read English translations of the instruction on one's own' (Engle, 2009, p. 25).

<sup>97</sup> Some of these guidebooks (e.g., Brasington, 2015, p. 145-147) set out this idea while also acknowledging that some individuals (in this example Brasington's teacher, Ayya Khema) learned meditation solely through reading some suttas and the *Visuddhimagga*, being able to access the jhānas, her own teacher only confirming her achievement later.

<sup>98</sup> Hakuin makes explicit reference to the benefit of reading his instructions: 'I have already written of the essentials of introspection in my *Yasen kanna*, a book designed for the use of all Zen monks everywhere. I don't know exactly how many have been cured of their Zen sickness by reading what I have written there, but I do know of eight or nine, seriously ill and near to death, who were cured by following my instructions' (Hakuin, in Yampolski, 1971, p. 50-51).

<sup>99</sup> The following exegetical works are accorded authoritative status as descriptions of the path by different Buddhist traditions: Buddhaghosa's *Visuddhimagga*, Chih-I's *Mo-ho chih-kuan* (The Great Calming and Contemplation), Asanga's *Bodhisattvabhūmi* (Stages of the Bodhisattva's Path), Kamalaśīla's *Bhāvanākrama* (Course of Practice), Tsongkhapa's *Lam rim chen mo* (Great Book on the Stages of the Path) or Maitreya-nātha's *Abisamayālaṃkāra* (Ornament of Realizations), among others.

<sup>100</sup> 'This book has three purposes. First, it serves as a course in Buddhist meditation. Meditators who read the book carefully and carry out its instructions conscientiously will receive a progressive and complete course in meditation, one ultimately based on the traditions and sometimes even the actual words of the Buddha himself. These profound, time-honored teachings are presented here in a manner that is compatible with Western thought' (Brahm, 2006b, p. 4). Another example: 'If you can read this book and follow the instructions, you have more than enough intelligence to learn to meditate. For that matter, even if you don't understand some of what you read here, by just following the basic instructions for each Stage, you will succeed' (Culadasa, Immergut and Graves, 2015, p. 74). Ogyen Trinley Dorje says this of *Moonbeams of Mahāmudrā*: 'Finally, it is important that anyone reading this text bears in mind that it is a highly regarded practice book, through which many people have attained direct realization, and, as such, is not to be treated lightly. It is my aspiration that all who read it will be inspired to follow the mahāmudrā path practiced by these great masters diligently' (in Tashi Namgyal, 2019, xxiii, xxiv).

<sup>101</sup> 'Though you recite much scripture, / if you are unaware and do not act according / you are like a cowherd counting other people's cattle, / not a sharer in the wonderer's life' (Dhp 19). Several metaphors are issued to illustrate this point: 'reading about Buddhism is like if a warrior entered battle according to what they have read' (Chah, 2018, p. 95); 'reading about Enlightenment is like scratching an itchy foot through your shoe' (Kapleau,



2000b, p. 22); 'Reading about enlightenment is like reading about nutrition when you're hungry' (Kapleau, 2000b, p. 22); 'Expecting intellectual understanding of Buddhist texts alone to solve our problems is like a sick person hoping to cure his or her illness through merely reading medical instructions without actually taking the medicine' (Kelsang Gyatso, 2013, x); 'Buddha gave *Dharma* instructions as supreme medicine to cure the inner disease of our delusions, but we cannot cure this disease just by reading or studying *Dharma* books' (Kelsang Gyatso, 2016); 'Painted food does not allay hunger' (Hsiang-yen Chih-hsien, in Seizan and Sasaki, 1972, p. 73n8). Hongren makes the same point when he says that the picture of food does not make a meal, as he portrays scholars as those counting other people's wealth (Van Schaik, 2018, p. 17); 'A rice cake that is painted in a picture cannot stave off hunger' (Kyogen, in Sbgz.1 Keisei-Sanshiki 217, Shin-Fukutoku 80). Khema (1987, p. 22) says, 'The Buddha said that we are all sick and that the Dhamma is the medicine. He was sometimes called the Great Physician. But just as with any medicine, it is of no use just knowing about or merely reading the label'. For Sumedho (2014b, p. 111-112) reading without practicing is 'like reading maps all the time without going anywhere' or 'like reading cookbooks without preparing meals.' For Khyatse (2007, p. 124), 'You might read about these four truths for the sake of entertainment or mental exercise, but if you don't practice them, you are like a sick person reading the label on a medicine bottle but never taking the medicine.' Lama Yeshe (2012, p. 117) says that 'Why we need teachers is because book knowledge is just dry information and if left as such can be as relevant as the wind whistling through the trees.'

<sup>102</sup> 'It is better to search your own Mind devotedly than to read and recite innumerable sūtras and dhāraṇī every day for countless years' (Kapleau, 2000a, p. 180).

<sup>103</sup> 'The day after I called on you I was riding home on the train with my wife. I was reading a book on Zen by Son-o, who, you may recall, was a master of Soto Zen living in Sendai during the Genroku period [1688–1703]. As the train was nearing Ofuna station I ran across this line: "I came to realize clearly that Mind is no other than mountains and rivers and the great wide earth, the sun and the moon and the stars." I had read this before, but this time it impressed itself upon me so vividly that I was startled. I said to myself: "After seven or eight years of zazen I have finally perceived the essence of this statement," and couldn't suppress the tears that began to well up. Somewhat ashamed to find myself crying among the crowd, I averted my face and dabbed at my eyes with my handkerchief' (in Kapleau, 2000a, p. 228).

<sup>104</sup> However, the library at Amaravati Buddhist Monastery (UK) carries poetry and novels as they are quite popular genres among visitors and some staff, whereas Throssel Hole Buddhist Abbey (UK) allows the reading of poetry and novels when monastics feel unwell (Personal communications, February 2015).

<sup>105</sup> Masfield (1986, Table 4) includes a list of all recorded instances of conversion in the Pāli canon by hearing discourses, progressive talks, overhearing talks, exhortations, *Dharma* verses, or just verbs. The *Fa-chū p'i-yü ching* (p. 41) records: 'When King Pukkaṣati received the scriptural text, he read and reflected on it again and again, and quickly became zealously devoted. He sighed deeply and said: "My conversion to the Path is truly wonderful."'

<sup>106</sup> Self-guided books on spirituality often assume readers are in this stage. For instance, Ruthven and Medbh-Mara (2001, p. 4): 'Why are you reading this book? Possibly because you need some help with your quest and probably because you want answers to some very pertinent questions.'

<sup>107</sup> 'Certain inner anxiety is needed in religious life. It is a necessary precursor to make one understand and appreciate religious truth. Without any inner anguish, simply listening to sermons, merely reading religious writings, and trying to get something out of them, is futile. Whatever we get is only a superficial shell' (Suzuki, 1998, Chapter 5).

<sup>108</sup> For instance, many women's conversion to Buddhism have been attributed to the reading of Korean nun Kim Iryōp's books where she narrates her love affairs (Park, 2010, p. 110).

<sup>109</sup> Candamitto (1972) contains several accounts of self-converted Buddhists after having read Buddhist literature.

<sup>110</sup> For instance, British nun Tenzin Palmo, after first learning about Theravāda, came across Tibetan Buddhism and decided to engage in traditional yogic Tibetan practices after having read Evans-Wentz's translation of Milarepa (Ray, 2002, p. 442).

<sup>111</sup> Realizing one is the reincarnation of a bodhisattva, becoming aware of one's dreams, perceiving one's body as a maṇḍala for a length of time, or seeing all objects as rainbows, to name a few (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 7, 44).

<sup>112</sup> Olcott claimed knowledge of Buddhism after having read 10,000 pages of Buddhist books (in English and French translations) (Olcott, *Old Diary Leaves*, Second series p. 299). By the time the 36th edition of his *Buddhist Catechism* was published (1903), he had read 15,000 pages (*Catechism*, xv) (in Trainor, 1997, p. 15n41).

<sup>113</sup> For instance, British scientist Allan Bennet, upon reading Arnold's *The Light of Asia*, travelled to Burma to study Buddhism, opened a Buddhist bookshop next to the British Museum in 1907, and helped organize the first Buddhist mission to the UK (Bell, 1991, p. 36-37; Bell, 2000, p. 6-7). Sangharakshita's interest in Buddhism

developed through reading (Sangharakshita, 1988, Chapter 2; Sangharakshita, 1993, Introduction; Sangharakshita, 1996, Chapter 3), and Sumedho was introduced to Buddhism by reading books by D. T. Suzuki while serving in the Korean War (Bell, 1991, p. 69, 86; Sumedho, 2014d, p. 196).

<sup>114</sup> 'I have never valued or studied the mere sophistry of word-knowledge, set down in books in conventionalized form of questions and answers to be committed to memory (and fired off at one's opponents); these lead but to mental confusion and not to such practice as bringeth actual realization of Truth. Of such word-knowledge I am ignorant; and if ever I did know it, I have forgotten it long ago. I pray that thou wilt give ear to the song which I am about to sing, to show my reasons for forgetting book-learning' (Milarepa, in Heruka, 2000, p. 245).

<sup>115</sup> Vism iii 29 lists books among several impediments to concentration, either because one is too busy with textual roles (Vism iii 51); Tiradhammo expresses one such obstacle: 'The main difficulty, I find, is with people who have read about Buddhism, but who have never meditated. They attach to certain philosophical positions such as soulessness, atheism, pessimism (dukkha) etc., and are unable to accept that these are merely subjects for meditative reflection and not beliefs' (in Bell, 1991, p. 156). Another example: 'Having read many books about Zen prior to enlightenment, I had the illusory notion that if I could attain enlightenment I would acquire supernatural powers, or develop an outstanding personality all at once, or become a great sage, or that all suffering would be annihilated and the world become heavenlike. These false ideas of mine, I now see, hindered the master in guiding me' (Kapleau, 2000a, p. 258). Mahā Boowa (in Tambiah, p. 151-152) also expresses how reading and study can give rise to defilements and attachment.

<sup>116</sup> Ruthven and Medbh-Mara (2001, p. 41) say this about commodified spirituality: 'Much of what we read today (...) oversimplifies the pursuit of spiritual development by trivialising it for the mass-consumer market. If we believe what we read in such publications, we come away with the impression that our hidden spiritual self can be discovered on the shelf at the supermarket and paid for by a credit card!'

<sup>117</sup> Sōn master Daehaeng (in Go, 2010, p. 238) suggests the following: 'I never say to throw away books, but I do suggest not to read books that can cause attachments to outside things. Read those books that focus on the inside, read them while you do not read.'

<sup>118</sup> Huiyuan (d. 416) while on his deathbed refused medicine and died while awaiting having the Vinaya read to him to confirm whether he was allowed to take it (Zürcher, in Brook, 2005, p. 155-156; Adamek, 2007, p. 48).

<sup>119</sup> The monk Tao-ch'in warned a noblewoman of the danger of becoming attached to reading scripture and performing other devotional actions as they can become an obstacle towards liberation (Shūdō, 2004, p. 228).

<sup>120</sup> Doherty (1983); Berling (1987); Allon (1997); Cole (2005); Flores (2008); Chaturvedi (2010); Collins (2010).

<sup>121</sup> 'Busily studying Dhamma in the Tipitaka from the linguistic or literary viewpoint is no way to come to know the true nature of things' (Buddhadasa, 1996, p. 30).

<sup>122</sup> Lopez (1998, Chapter 3) offers an analysis of Rampa's books, their content and reception.

<sup>123</sup> Lopez (1998, p. 12n23) includes some popular fiction works on Tibet.

<sup>124</sup> 'Chatralwa read the biography of Milarepa and for five days he experienced having no reference points in his mind, and since then his mind rested at ease' (Thondup, 2002, p. 261). 'Labs-sgron (...) She was an expert reader, and for a considerable time acted as reader of the *Prajñāpāramitā* for Gra-pa. As a result of reading the *Prajñāpāramitā* a clear vision of the Void (*Śūnyatā*) was produced in her' (BA p. 983).

<sup>125</sup> The nineteenth-century Korean monk Yongsōng intended to produce awakening experiences by means such as dharāṇī recitation and scripture reading. One such experience occurred while reading *The Transmission of the Lamp* (Huh, 2010, p. 22, 24). Sōn master Hanam had several enlightened experiences, including final awakening, by reading without a teacher (Uhlmann, 2010, p. 172). Hakuin's awakening upon hearing a cricket churring occurred while reading the *Lotus Sūtra* (Waddell, 1994, xviii). Tsongkhapa experienced realization of absolute reality and experienced perfect understanding of Madhyamika while reading (Truman, 2006, p. 106).

<sup>126</sup> 'One day when reading scripture, suddenly I lost a sense of the world of physical and mental phenomena. In a state of emptiness, I experienced a spiritual brightness. The innumerable worldly defilements became completely luminous, like pure images floating in the air. Although I sat there with the scriptures for several hours, it seemed to be only an instant. Several days later, my body and mind were still light-hearted and contented. Within the next several days, I read the rest of the *Prajñāpāramitā* scriptures, as well as the *Avataṃsaka Sūtra*, and immediately I had insight into the nature of all things (...) This was for me the sloughing off of all the defilements of the world and achieving the beginning of my new life in Buddhism' (Taixu, in Pittman, 2001, p. 213-214).

<sup>127</sup> '(...) the ācārya being convinced said: "You must recite the *Prajñāpāramitā*". When he read the sentence "the nature of the sphere of Heaven in limitless", an extraordinary trance was produced on him (...) He constantly practiced fasting and recitation (of sacred texts). At that time, he and others saw countless holy visions' (BA p. 1010-1011)

<sup>128</sup> Chinese Ch'an monk Taixu reports in his autobiography having visions of Buddha fields and realizations of emptiness as result of reading the *Perfection of Wisdom* and the *Avatamsaka Sūtra* (in Goodell, 2008, p. 94-95). Sōn master Chinul elaborated the principles of his school following a series of enlightened experiences produced by his scriptural reading (Buswell, 1986).

<sup>129</sup> Age 16, Sot'aesan had an enlightenment experience during absorption. He went on to read the *Diamond Sūtra* after it appeared to him in a dream and realized that was consonant with his experience (Chung, 2010, p. 62, 64; Pacey, 2016, p. 99).

<sup>130</sup> 'Xuance said, "From whom did you attain the Dharma?" [Xuanjue] said, "I heard that there is a succession of teachers for the Mahāyāna sutras and śāstras. Later I became enlightened to the central doctrine of the mind of the Buddha [by reading] the *Vimalakīrti Sūtra*. As yet, no one has verified [my realization].'" (Plat p. 67)

<sup>131</sup> Tiyanich (1997) argues the need to analyse popular magazines features the biographies of Thai mediator forest monks given the popularity enjoyed by these narratives.

<sup>132</sup> Some research has been done on the availability of Buddhist titles in national markets, e.g. Díez-Velasco (2018) on Spain and Borup (2016, p. 48-49) on Denmark. Wuthnow and Cadge (2004, p. 367) suggest that some readers might have been exposed to Buddhist ideas and practices by means of New Age reading material.

<sup>133</sup> For instance, the *Upāyakaśālyā Sūtra* explicitly declares: 'Son of the family: this [explanation of the teaching of skill in means] is to be kept secret. Do not [speak of it, teach it,] explain it [or recite it] in the presence of inferior sentient beings whose store of merit is small' (Up 174).

<sup>134</sup> McMahan (2008, p. 251) gives some examples of how popular books on Buddhism market themselves. Fronsdal (2002) examines the publication activity and content of books by the Insight meditation movement.

<sup>135</sup> <https://fakebuddhaquotes.com/all-fake-buddha-quotes/>

<sup>136</sup> Lopez (1998, Chapter 6) reviews the importance of Tibetan literature publishing enterprises in Europe and America; Díez de Velasco (2018) survey Buddhist publishing activities in Spain. As a comparison to the current availability, Waterhouse (1997, p. 221) reckons that in a town like Bath, UK, in 1996, the largest bookshop stocked about 90 books on Buddhism, only a minority of which were translations of scripture. Odiseos (2020) surveys the effects of publishing activities in the US and the effect of the availability of texts.

<sup>137</sup> Coleman (2001, p. 199) reports that 47% of his informants were introduced to Buddhism via books or lectures.

<sup>138</sup> Gordon-Finlayson (2012, p. 172) includes the case of one informant who had been reading about Zen Buddhism for twenty years but who never fully engaged in any formal practice. In another case (p. 189) another informant narrates that reading about Buddhism confirmed her intuition, so she felt no other involvement with practice was needed. Another (p. 191) presents a self-identifying Zen Buddhist with no formal affiliation or practice whose reading veers more towards Taoism and Confucianism than Buddhism. Kapleau (2000b, p. 227) has one example of an individual engaged in reading for years as his commitment to work and family did not allow for more involvement with the practice.

<sup>139</sup> Tweed (2000, p. 44; 2002, p. 21) would include individuals such as Paul Carus, John Cage, William Wiley, or Andrew Carnegie as Buddhist sympathizers.

<sup>140</sup> Spiritual but not religious and spiritual but not affiliated.

<sup>141</sup> Bond (1988, p. 183) includes the case of a Sri Lankan convert from Catholicism who instructed herself to meditate mainly through reading and for whom reading remain the main source of information on Buddhism.

<sup>142</sup> Modern translations of that sort of material increasingly warn the reader of the benefits and dangers of reading these texts and prompt readers to seek a qualified teacher to follow the practices described in the texts. For instance, Trulshik Rinpoche (2006, p. 9) writes: 'The path of Secret Mantra is one of both great profit and danger. Therefore, anyone who practices these texts should receive the empowerments, reading transmissions, and instructions from an authentic spiritual teacher, doing so in the correct manner.' Another example is Shinran's teachings, once prohibited reading for the uninitiated, now widely published and read (Rambelli, 2006, p. 54). Ray (2002, p. 278) suggests that unsupervised reading on Mahāmudra literature before engaging in the practice can be dangerous as 'Westerners (...) live in a culture where thoughts and concepts are taken as real'.

<sup>143</sup> Apart from older figures like D. T. Suzuki, the following authors could be included: Shunryu Suzuki, Sangharakshita, Watts, Thich Nhat Hanh, Trungpa, and the Dalai Lama (McMahan, 2008, p. 8).

<sup>144</sup> List of Facebook Groups: Buddhism for All (Discussion & Learning); Theravada Buddhism; Secular Buddhism; Buddhism Taught Simply; Buddhism; Western Buddhism; Buddhist philosophy; and Mahayana Buddhism (English) group.

<sup>145</sup> *Dhammapada*; *What the Buddha Taught* by Walpola Rahula; *Zen Mind Beginner's Mind* by Shunryu Suzuki; *The Heart of the Buddha's Teaching* by Thich Nhat Hanh; *Buddhism Plain and Simple* by Steven Hagen; *The Tibetan Book of Living and Dying* by Sogyal Rinpoche; *When Things Fall Apart* by Pema Chödrön; *The Art of Happiness* by Dalai Lama and Howard C. Cutler; *Awakening the Buddha Within* by Surya Das; and *Buddhist Boot Camp* by Timber Hawkeye.

- <sup>146</sup> For all data gathered and analysed, see 'Appendix D: Data analysis'.
- <sup>147</sup> Particularly in the case of Sogyal Rinpoche.
- <sup>148</sup> 'When he was five or six, his father related to him the sufferings of Hell, he reflected over it and being frightened, asked his father: "What would help?" The father replied: "The worship and circumambulation of gods" (meaning prostrations before holy images and circumambulation of holy objects). The boy spent days and nights worshipping in front of the sacred books, which had formerly belonged to his ancestors' (BA, p. 712).
- <sup>149</sup> The *Nandimitrāvādāna* names fifty Mahāyāna sūtras emphasizing these textual tasks (Ray, 1994, p. 184).
- <sup>150</sup> Maitreya's *Madhyāntavibhaṅga* describes the following ten *Dharma* activities: 'To transcribe letters, make offerings / Give generously, listen, read, / Memorize, explain, recite, / Reflect, and meditate' (Mav, p.131).
- <sup>151</sup> The *Hastikakṣya sūtra* mentions twenty such benefits (Apple, 2014, p. 41).
- <sup>152</sup> Sbgz.1 Kankin 209 contains a description of the ceremony of sūtra-reading for a sponsor.
- <sup>153</sup> 'Of the wealth thus received by him, he sent one hundred golden sraṅs to Vikramaśīla in India, to pay for the cost of reciting the Pañcaviṃṣtisāhasrikā-Prajñāpāramitā written in gold and one hundred golden sraṅs as remuneration for the recitation by eight-four paṇḍitas of the four schools or eighty-four copies of the Ārya-Prajñāpāramitāsañcayagāthā as long as the Doctrine exists' (BA p. 377).
- <sup>154</sup> 'If anyone preachers the *Dharma* / in an empty, secluded place, or in a quiet place where no human voice is heard, / and reads and recites this sūtra there, / then I will appear to them with a pure and radiant body' (Sdp Chap. 10, p. 233).
- <sup>155</sup> Ajahn Chah writes: 'Recollect the Buddha and incline your mind to his Dhamma. In it you will see the Buddha himself – where else could he be? Just look at his Dhamma. Read the teachings. Can you find anything faulty? Focus your attention on the Buddha's teaching and you will see him' (Chah, 2001, p. 735).
- <sup>156</sup> Patrul Rinpoche writes: 'For it is the representation of the speech of the Buddha, rather than that of his body or mind, that teaches us what to do and what not to do and also ensures the continuity of the doctrine. The scriptures are therefore no different from the Buddha himself, and are particularly sacred' (Padmakara Translation Group, 1994, p. 187).
- <sup>157</sup> 'So the volumes of the Sūtra are the whole body of the Tathāgata. To do prostrations to volumes of the Sūtra is to do prostrations to the Tathāgata. To have met volumes of the Sūtra is to be meeting the Tathāgata. The volumes of the Sūtra are the bones of the Tathāgata' (Sbgz. 3 Nyorai-zenshin 225).
- <sup>158</sup> Scripture veneration can be assimilated to attending to the Buddha's needs: 'Again, during this life we should produce [copies of] the Sūtra of the Flower of *Dharma*. We should write them, should print them, and should retain them. Constantly we should receive them upon the head in reverence, make prostrations to them, and offer them flowers, incense, lights, food and drink, and clothing. Constantly keeping the head clean, we should humbly receive them upon the head' (Sbgz. 4 Doshin 200).
- <sup>159</sup> The metaphor of embodiment extends so that some monastics are referred as walking libraries (Humphreys, 1962, p. 133) who thesaurize merit (Loveday, 2000).
- <sup>160</sup> Ss 57 includes the possibility of being reborn as an object which a monastic has desecrated.
- <sup>161</sup> 'Then he transformed his Tantric assistant into a book, and having tied the book (to his waist) proceeded to the forest (...)' (BA p. 369).
- <sup>162</sup> *Samādhirājasūtra*.
- <sup>163</sup> See Samuels (2005) and McDaniels (2005) for bibliographies on monastic training and education in Buddhism.
- <sup>164</sup> The New Kadampa Tradition expounds that reading texts other than those by Geshe Kelsang is counterproductive and his students are discouraged to read books by other teachers and traditions (Waterhouse, 1997, p. 153; Kay, 2004, p. 94). Books by Kelsang Gyatso often include study guides and the order in which his book should be read.
- <sup>165</sup> For instance, Pali regained popularity in Sri Lanka in the second half of the eighteenth century and its study was emphasized with the development of Protestant Buddhism (Blackburn, 2001, p. 198-199).
- <sup>166</sup> Trần (2018, p. 107-110) describes thus the content of premodern Vietnamese temple libraries: scriptures, precepts, rituals, Confucian classics, Daoist classics, genealogies, Buddhist literature, medicine, and histories of temples, masters and schools.
- <sup>167</sup> Some of these curricula have been studied: see Blackburn (2001, p. 55-56) and Samuels (2004) on Sri Lanka; Dreyfus (2003); Veidlinger (2007) on Thailand; or McDaniel (2008) on Laos and Thailand.
- <sup>168</sup> Seeger (2014, p. 167-169) references several instances of printed texts praising the benefits of memorizing the text.
- <sup>169</sup> Rather than 'read', the Thai word used to study *Dharma* texts is 'fang' ('to listen') (Seeger, 2014, p. 162).
- <sup>170</sup> Bluck (2006) offers a good overview of attitudes towards learning and reading in relation to authority in several tradition of Buddhism in Britain. For instance, the Triratna Community favours Sangharakshita and Subhuti as interpretative standards (Bell, 1991, p. 368).

<sup>171</sup> An example comes from the translation of *Vinaya in Five Parts of the Mahīśāsakas* (T1421), translated by Buddhajīva, Zhisheng, Daosheng and Huiyan (423-424): 'The translation team worked in Jiankang. Buddhajīva held the text, the Khotanese monk Zhisheng translated it into Chinese, while Daosheng and Huiyan wrote down the translation and revised it. The task of Buddhajīva thus seems to have been to read the basic text aloud. This is in all probability the text that Faxian had obtained in Sri Lanka' (Heirman, 2007, p. 177).

<sup>172</sup> Tsongkhapa (in Truman, 2006, p. 80) recommends: 'Thus we should read, for example, the accounts of how Buddha developed renunciation, compassion and Bodhicitta in his previous lives'.

<sup>173</sup> Milarepa recommends reading biographies of saints before moving onto studying *sūtras* (Chang, 1962, p. 256): 'The first thing one should remember is the transiency of life; / Then he should read the lives of holy Saints. / Next, he should study the simple or comprehensive Sūtras, / Choosing them to meet his own / requirements. Then he should contemplate on the Instructions.'

<sup>174</sup> For instance, Dakpo Tashi Namgyal recommends that 'From time to time, read the vajra songs and biographies of the previous masters of the practice tradition to see how they underwent hardships with fortitude and established their practice' (Tashi Namgyal, 2019, p. 454). The Dalai Lama recommends reading the biographies of the Buddha and his disciples as guides of behaviour (Gyatso and Chodron, 2018, p. 100).

<sup>175</sup> *Brahma's Net; Treatise on the Perfection of Great Wisdom*. Kūkai writes, 'From now on we will observe faithfully your teaching with our whole beings—by writing it on the paper of our skins, with pens of bone, ink of blood, and the inkstone of the skull' (in Hakeda, 1972, p. 139).

<sup>176</sup> The *Hevajara Tantra* can only be copied using human bones as pens (Hvt, Chap. vii).

<sup>177</sup> The merit accrued by printing texts extends to include the materials used during the printing process. For instance, staff at the Derge Printing House in Kham relate how pilgrims would collect the run-off water used to wash the printing blocks carrying *Dharma*-texts from a trough in the entrance courtyard to presumably bathe as a meritorious act in lieu of 'reading' the texts (Swann, personal communication, January 2021).

<sup>178</sup> Ennin argues that shrines containing rich collection of printed scripture were meant to be read not by humans, but by gods (Fischer, 2003, p. 106).

<sup>179</sup> 'Sabbadānaṃ dhammadānaṃ jināti' (The gift of Dhamma surpasses of other gifts) (Chah, 2018, back of title page).

<sup>180</sup> For instance, the colophon of a *Saddharmapuṇḍarika* from Gilgit has a list of forty-four donors, mostly laypeople, a few senior monastics, and one *mahādharmabhāṇaka* (De Simini, 2016, p. 6).

<sup>181</sup> This is the methodology used by Veidlinger (2007) to show that writing was not current in Lan Na for the purpose of transmitting Buddhism until the thirteenth-century, which implies all prior transmission was mainly, if not absolutely, oral in nature. Trăn (2010) analyses the content of premodern Vietnamese temple libraries to suggest possible reading habits.

<sup>182</sup> Tāranātha has it that the first Mahāyāna *sūtra* in the human realm was a text deposited in a private house (Schopen, 2008, p. 54).

<sup>183</sup> 'As for venerating the holy scriptures, one should place the Amida Sutra and the other Pure Land sutras in a covering of the five colors and should read them oneself and teach them to others. One should enshrine these images and sutras in a room and there one should come six times a day and bow to them, repent one's sins before them, and, offering flowers and incense, specially esteem them' (Senchakushū p. 88).

<sup>184</sup> *Buddhabalādhānaprātihāryavikurvāṇanirdeśa*.

<sup>185</sup> For instance, following Geshe Kelsang's discouraging his followers from reading books others than those authorised by him, the Majushri Kadampa Meditation Centre Library purged a comprehensive collection of over 3,000 volumes on a variety of subjects (Kay, 2004, p. 76; Bluck, 2006, p. 138). The collection now only comprises about 100 volumes.

<sup>186</sup> There is a mention to an eleventh-century revolving bookcase in the temple of Holy Khasarpaṇa (Avalokiteśvara) where a *Prajñāpāramitā* revolved continually (Schopen, 2005, p. 5).

<sup>187</sup> For instance, Dōgen writes: 'While we are in the Hall we should not read the words of even Zen texts. In the Hall we should realize the principles and pursue the state of truth. When we are before a bright window, we can enlighten the mind [read] with the teachings of the ancients' (Sbgz.1 Ju-Undo-Shiki 114).

<sup>188</sup> '[Brom] While he was grinding flour, he used to keep his books nearby, and study them. In this manner he pursued his studies with great diligence' (BA p. 252). Sōnam Gyatso read and memorized Nāgārjuna's *Letter to a friend* while on horseback (BA, p. 808; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 129).

<sup>189</sup> Chinese monastic reformer Taixu entered a three-year confinement period in which he mostly read Buddhist scriptures, as well as Chinese classics, modern literature, and western history, philosophy, and science (Pittman, 2001, p. 83).

<sup>190</sup> This is illustrated by Khyantse Rinpoche's (in Ray, 2002, p. 440) description of his own retreat practice: 'I practiced from the early hours before dawn until noon, and from afternoon late into the night. At midday, I read from my books, reciting the texts aloud to learn them by heart.'

<sup>191</sup> In relation to this, Wijayawardhana (1979, p. 68-75) cites some titles popular among the Sinhala laity: *Jātaka Pota*, *SadDharmaratnāvaliya*, *Dhammapada*, *Tun Surāṇe*, *Buddha Ādahilla*.

<sup>192</sup> In Tibet, for instance, The Jonangpa school was suppressed by the fifth Dalai Lama, their monasteries destroyed, monastics forced to convert to the Gelup, and some of their texts burnt (Harvey, 2013, p. 208). The Gelup is also alleged with destroying statues of Padmasambhava and discarding Nyingma texts into rivers (Van Schaik, 2011, p. 202).

<sup>193</sup> In Sri Lanka, Mahāyāna texts were destroyed and the sangha expurgated of corrupting influences (Harvey, 2013, p. 197-198). Ippen, convinced that all the teaching could be summarised in 'Namu-amida-butsu', destroyed all his books: 'Tenth day, morning [a month before death]. Ippen gave a few of the sūtras he possessed to a monk from Mount Shosha. He had always said, "My propagation is for this lifetime only," and now, while chanting the Amida Sutra, he burned the writings he possessed with his own hands' (Hirota, 1997, xiv).

<sup>194</sup> For instance, the Chinese invasion of Tibet in 1950 supposed the subsequent destruction of monasteries, libraries, and their contents (Van Schaik, 2011, p. 244-245; Harvey, 2013, p. 414; Cabezón and Dorjee, 2019, p. 434).

<sup>195</sup> Many non-conforming manuscripts were destroyed in Thailand in the early twentieth century when the National Library in Bangkok was being formed (Crosby, 2020, p. 84-85).

<sup>196</sup> Patrul Rinpoche writes, 'To place books containing scriptures directly on the floor, to step over them, to west your fingers with saliva to turn the pages and similar disrespectful behaviours are serious mistakes as well' (Padmakara Translation Group, 1994, p. 186).

<sup>197</sup> The monk Shi Faxian's personal copy of the *Parinirvāṇa sūtra* was spared in a fire (Bumbacher, 2007, p. 231).

<sup>198</sup> See Wright (2003, p. 266) for some examples.

<sup>199</sup> Huineng allegedly torn up *sūtras* (Harvey, 2013, p. 217). 'Zen Master Chikan of Kyogen [temple], while cultivating the state of truth under Dai-I, tried several times to express the truth in a phrase, but in the end he could not say anything. Out of regret for this, he burnt his books and became the monk who served the gruel and rice.' (Sbgz. 2 Gyoji-I 169). Kyōgen Oshō burnt all his books and papers when unable to find an answer to Isan's question in them, and gave up the study of Buddhism (Mumonkan Case 5). Miaoxi broke up the woodblocks of *The Blue Cliff Record* on finding monastics too dependent on this text (CB Lesson 184).

<sup>200</sup> 'He entrusted the book containing the precepts of the 54 male and female siddhas to (his mother) Śud-mo Śāk-sgron, but she damaged the book, and in this manner (the precepts) of eight Lineages were lost. Other were then discovered giving minute details, probably written down by So-chun-ba himself' (BA, p. 878).

<sup>201</sup> Butōn (p. 212) comments: '*The Vajra Cutter Discourse: A Commentary* states: The complete destruction of the sacred doctrine entails the decline of devotion, reading, recitation of prayers, receiving reading transmission, teaching, study, reflection, and so on'. According to *The Prophecy of Arhat Sanghavardhana* and the *Story of Arhat Nandimitra* (in Butōn, p. 272, 274), scripture will become corrupt at this time of decline and eventually disappear. The *Nirvana Sutra* (Nirvana-S., p. 113) has 'After the true-Dharma has disappeared, during a period of counterfeit Dharma there will be bhikṣus who will imitate upholding the precepts and will read and recite the sutras to some degree'.

<sup>202</sup> This is due not only to literacy levels but also to ideological control. For instance, book learning was thought unsuitable for girls in Thailand until early in the twentieth century (Seeger, 2014, p. 154).

<sup>203</sup> 'Listen to me attentively, as it produces rapture (pīti) and delight (pāmojja), should arouse serene joy (pasādeyya), is beautiful, and is endowed with various forms. Carefully received these faultless and beneficial words and exalted thoughts, being glad, elated, and having minds that are very pleased' (Dīpavaṃsa, in Berkwitz, 2004, p. 243).

<sup>204</sup> Early in the third century, kings in Sri Lanka ordered the public reading of an *Ariyavaṃsa* narrating the life of eminent Buddhist individuals for the edification of the people (Malalasekera, 2013, p. 44-45). Other kings read *Jātaka*, translated them into Sinhala, and had them read throughout (Malalasekera, 2013, p. 191). Public readings by royal command in China were for the protection of the estate (Zürcher, 2013, p. 98).

<sup>205</sup> Kublai Khan ordered monastics in Beijing in 1272 to read/recite nine times the whole canon (Wu, 2016b, p. 62).

<sup>206</sup> When the Taklung leader fell ill, he ordered all books in the library to be dusted and recited. It took two hundred and fifty monks three years to accomplish that task (BA p. 643; Schaeffer, 2014, p. 124).

<sup>207</sup> The Buddha recites or make others recite the seven factors of Enlightenment to aid their recovery from illness (S v 80-81).

<sup>208</sup> Once a Chinese was under siege and its citizens resorted to concentrating on the deity Guanshiyin, after which a copy of the *Guanshiyin Sūtra* came down from the sky and forced the attacking commander to pardon the city (Campany, 1991, p. 47).

<sup>209</sup> Shabkar writes: 'Before my mother was born, my grandparents had sponsored a reading of the Tashi Tseka, a sutra of the Victorious One, in hopes that a boy might be born. Not a boy, but a girl was born, my mother' (Shakbar p. 16).

<sup>210</sup> When Prime Minister Kim Yangdo was a boy, he became dumb and paralysed. His father sent for the Korean monk Milbon to read a Buddhist scripture to the boy to aid recovery. 'Even before Milbon started reading the scripture, the boy's disease was cured' (Broucke, 2007, p. 282-283). 'On one occasion when he felt ill, he ordered the recitation of scriptures after dusting the volumes. It took three years for 250 monks to dust the volumes' (BA p. 643).

<sup>211</sup> The 100 volumes of the *Kangyur* are retrieved, their covers dusted and ironed, then distributed and read (Jamyang Buddhist Centre, 2020).

<sup>212</sup> An expression of this is the repetition of the *Daimoku* by Sokka Gakkai followers (Obadia, 2013, p. 178). The Chinese Tien T'ai monk Miaolo justifies this practice as follows: 'To read and recite the Lotus Sutra refers to one who reads and recites the eight volumes, or one volume, or on letter, or one stanza, or one verse, or its title (*daimoku*), to one in whom arises a single moment of rejoicing (at hearing even on verse of the Sutra) (...) even to read only one letter is by that very act also to include eighty thousand treasure chambers of letters, and to receive the merits of all the Buddhas' (in Habito, 1999, p. 288).

<sup>213</sup> Stein and Zangpo (2013, p. 364) say that 'During our lifetimes, we may never learn or be able to assess the contents of most of those texts, but even reading their titles in clumsy translation can create a meaningful connection between us in our tiny linguistic and conceptual confines and the ineffable mysteries of speech and minds of enlightened beings.'

<sup>214</sup> Having been transformed by the *Lotus Sūtra*, Nichiren considered himself to be its embodiment (Anesaki, 1916, p. 32).

<sup>215</sup> *Pratyutpanna sūtra* (13 vv8-9) (Bentor, 1995, p. 251).

<sup>216</sup> Nichiren Buddhists would activate images not just by placing scriptural fragments inside but also by ritually reading the *Lotus Sūtra* to the image 'so that the image will be invested with the Buddha's six sense faculties and become the living teacher Śākyamuni, master of teachings, whom you may revere' (Nichiren, in Stone, 2006, p. 183).

<sup>217</sup> A text on Dependent Origination found in *Paṭiccasamuppāda sutta* appears commonly inside stūpas and other implements (Benton, 1995, p. 251).

<sup>218</sup> In 1957, 4,000 stone slabs carrying the Chinese canon were excavated in a monastery near Beijing. After they were recorded by scholars, the monastery decided to bury the slabs again (Strong, 2015, p. 174).

<sup>219</sup> Tāranātha (1970, p. 171) says that Vasubhandu was able to read the equivalent of one year's worth of scripture in fifteen days and nights by placing himself in a tub of til-oil, as well as being able to read the whole of the *Prajñā-pāramitā-aṣṭa-sāhasrikā* in one or two hours.

<sup>220</sup> 'Kha-che paṇ-chen (...) of Chos-'dzin (...) at the age of nine or ten, he was able to understand the various scriptures of the Buddha after glancing them over' (BA p. 485).

<sup>221</sup> 'Rinpoche-Grags-ye (...) He became known as a very wise man, because he was able to learn by heart every morning texts of the length of the *Prajñāpāramitā-saṃcayagāthā* after reading them only once' (BA p. 582).

<sup>222</sup> 'On his way to Phag-mo-gru at bSam-yas he had a vision of a blue woman who placed inside his mouth a volume. Then he understood the meaning of the books seen by him, and having obtained the *ḍākiṇī*'s permissions, he wrote several expositions of the Tantra' (BA p. 663). In another instance, 'He used to relate that, while he was residing at Śrī-ri, he saw a red woman placing a book into his mouth, and that after that there did not exist a single doctrine, translated into Tibetan, which he did not understand' (BA, p. 686).

<sup>223</sup> Lama Zopa argues that Lama Yeshe used his subtle body to read the open volumes surrounding him during his sleep (Paine, 2004, 73).

<sup>224</sup> 'He kept many books around himself, and was able to read them in his dream, and grasp their meaning' (BA p. 499).

<sup>225</sup> 'Later You moved to Mount Xian, with the intention of reading through the Avataṃsaka Sutra. Repeatedly he experienced a dream in which someone would come and teach him to recite the verses [of the [Lotus] sutra]. Whenever he reached the point in his recitation [where verses occur], he found that [the verses of the dream] corresponded perfectly with the written text of the scripture' (*Accounts in Dissemination and Praise of the Lotus*, in Stevenson, 2007a, p. 319).

<sup>226</sup> A shepherd boy, having borrowed a copy of the *Diamond Sūtra*, went to a field. There, he wanted to make a copy of it. Not having paper, he decided he could not write it on the ground as this would mean that animals

---

stepping on it would not suffer bad rebirths. He then decided to make his copy against the sky, which no human however would be able to read (Schaeffer, 2014, p. 146).

<sup>227</sup> The Tibetan practice of printing on the surface of the water in rivers and streams consists in slapping woodblocks of 'printing' formulas written for merit-making purposes without intending to create a permanent record of the text (Ekvall, 1964, p. 114).

<sup>228</sup> 'Vairochana wrote down the eighteen tantras of Semde on white cotton with the milk of a white cow in order that people should not see the texts. When he wanted the manuscript to be read, he held it over smoke and the text became visible' (Thondup, 2002, p. 103).

<sup>229</sup> '[Nyoshül Lungtok Tenpe Nyigma] wrote a detailed instruction on Trekcho meditation for Nyakla Rangrik, who was then in Central Tibet, and he asked him to burn it after reading it.'

<sup>230</sup> Drinking the water from the well in which Chandragomi threw in and later drew out a treatise he had written is said to produce great intelligence (Butön, p. 235).

<sup>231</sup> <http://prayerwheel.org/> ; <http://www.theinternetprayerwheel.info/>

<sup>232</sup> 'Just walking under this once can purify a thousand aeons of sins' (Martin, 2007, p. 211).

<sup>233</sup> In Nepal, *Dharma*-volumes are taken out of temples and paraded onto the fields to bless them (Diemberger, 2012, p. 21).

<sup>234</sup> In Korea, 'bearing the canon on the crown of the head' is a ceremony to enact the talismanic power of the canon (Wu and Wilkinson, 2017, Introduction).

<sup>235</sup> *Dharma*-texts were read for the dead at Zen monasteries (Sbgz.1 Kankin 208). Arnold's *The Light of Asia* was read around Australian Buddhist Theosophical societies during the 1890s after Madame Blavatsky's passing (Croucher, 1989, p. 12). This text, among others, was customarily read aloud by Theosophists during their meetings (Tweed, 2000, p. 49).

<sup>236</sup> Lopez (1998, Chapter 2) surveys the publication, content, reception, and critical fortune of this title in several editions in the West.

<sup>237</sup> Flores (2008, p. 164) analyses its reception in the West.

<sup>238</sup> Kornfield read texts in a variety of contexts, 'I have read them [the teachings of *The Tibetan Book of the Dead*] to friends who were dying, to friends in the midst of a divorce, to those on vision quests, and to students in retreat' (Kornfield, 1993, p. 155).

<sup>239</sup> 'At dusk on the second day of the second month of the Fire Bird year (1957), after reading the first three chapters of the Chöying Rinpoche Dzö, [Kyala Khenpo Chechok Thondrup] suddenly merged into the ultimate peace at death' (Thondup, 2002, p. 291).

<sup>240</sup> Sheep knelt and listen to Yen-Shou (China, 10<sup>th</sup> CE) read the Lotus Sutra, which he had memorised by reading seven verses a day for sixty days (Chung-yuan, 1971, p. 250; Welter, 2004, p. 168).

<sup>241</sup> The Japanese tale *Uji shūi monogatari* has a monastic reading the Lotus Sutra. Whenever this occurs, Indra, Brahma, and other superior deities attend to listen to the sutra being read. Once, when the monk did not perform purifications before reading, the gods did not attend, so instead minor deities had an opportunity to listen (Fauré, 2003, p. 270).

<sup>242</sup> 'He retired for meditation to 'Chims-phu of bSam-yas. There, after having prepared a copy of the bKa'-'gyur and bsTan-'gyur, and having performed the rite of consecration, he got a vision of the recital of these Scriptures by many Bodhisattvas' (BA p. 492).

<sup>243</sup> 'A ḍākiṇī known as the "Mad-One of Lha-sa" uttered a prediction, following which the Master was able to extract the history of Lha-sa from inside a beam (in the Jo-khañ), but she did not allow him to keep it for more than one day. All his disciples shared the manuscript and prepared copies of it. In the evening of the same day, the manuscript was again hidden inside the beam' (BA 258). Another example: 'His [Longchenpa's] collected works are famous in that he wrote a teaching manual for each of these traditions; the majority of these works, however, were reclaimed by the dākas and ḍākiṇīs' (Jamyang Dorje, 2005, p. 131-132).

<sup>244</sup> Nāgārjuna is said to have acquired the *Prajñāpāramitā* from a *Nāga* chief who took him to his sea realm, where Nāgārjuna noticed the available scriptures were at least ten times more numerous than those available to him. He was allowed to take some away with him (Tāranātha, 1970, p. 384). *Saṅgharakṣita-avadāna* (Dā 23) has the story of Saṅgharakṣita being taken by the nāgas to establish the *āgamas* in the *Nāga* realm.

<sup>245</sup> 'All these bodhisattvas live in the empty space beneath this world, where they read, recite, gain insight into, ponder over, and analyse various sutras, and remember them correctly' (Sdp Chap. xv, p. 286).



## Bibliography

[NB: This includes references found in this dissertation and in 'Appendix E: Corpus']

Abé, R. (2005) 'Word' in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Critical terms for the study of Buddhism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 291-310.

Abé, R. (2006) 'Swords, words, and deformity: on Myōe's eccentricity', in Payne, R. K. and Leighton, T. D. (eds.) *Discourse and ideology in medieval Japanese Buddhism*. London: Routledge, pp. 148-160.

Access to Insight (2001) *Befriending the suttas: tips on reading the Pali discourses*. Available at: <https://www.accesstoinsight.org/befriending.html> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).

Adamek, W. K. (2007) *The mystique of transmission: on an early Chan history and its contexts*. Chichester: Columbia University Press.

Adikaram, E. W. (1946) *Early history of Buddhism in Ceylon: or state of Buddhism in Ceylon as revealed by the Pāli commentaries of the 5<sup>th</sup> century AD*. Colombo: M. D. Gunasena & Co.

Adler, M. J. and Van Doren, C. (1972) *How to read a book* [Revised and updated edition]. London: Simon & Schuster.

Adoni, H. and Nossek, H. (2011) 'Between the book and the reader: the uses of reading for the gratification of personal and psychosocial needs', in Crone, R. and Towheed, S. (eds.) *The history of reading. Volume 3: methods, strategies, tactics*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 49-65.

Allon, M. (1997) *Style and function: a study of the dominant stylistic features of the prose portions of the Pāli canonical sutta texts and their mnemonic function*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies. Studia Philologica Buddhica. Monograph series, XII.

Almeida, R. (2009) 'Contemporary period', in Watling, G. (ed.) *Cultural history of reading. Volume 1: world literature*. London: Greenwood Press, pp. 485-517.

Almond, P. C. (1988) *The British discovery of Buddhism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Amaravati Buddhist Monastery (2013) *Recollections of Ajahn Chah* [Second edition] [Online]. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Buddhist Monastery. Available at: <https://www.amaravati.org/dhamma-books/recollections-of-ajahn-chah/> (Accessed: 07 November 2020).

Ambedkar, B. R. (1957) *Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar: writings and speeches. Vol. 11: the Buddha and his Dhamma*. New Delhi: Dr. Ambedkar Foundation.

Anacker, S. (1991) 'The meditational therapy of the Madhyāntavibhāgabhāṣya', in Kiyota, M. (ed.) *Mahāyāna Buddhist meditation: theory and practice* [First Indian edition]. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, pp. 83-113.

Anālayo, B. (2007) 'Oral dimensions of Pāli discourses: pericopes, other mnemonic techniques and the oral performance context' *Canadian Journal of Buddhist Studies* 3, pp. 5-34. Available at: <https://journals.sfu.ca/cjbs/index.php/cjbs/article/view/75> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).

Ānanda, B. (1996) 'The Buddhist approach to the scriptures', *Journal of Dharma* 21(4), pp. 364-377. Available at: <http://dvkjournals.in/index.php/jd/article/view/961> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).

Anderson, C. S. (1999) *Pain and its ending: the Four Noble Truths in the Theravāda Buddhist canon*. London: Routledge. Curzon critical studies in Buddhism.

Anesaki, M. (1916) *Nichiren: the Buddhist prophet*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Apple, J. B. (2014) 'The phrase *dharmaparyāyo hastagato* in Mahāyāna Buddhist literature: rethinking the cult of the book in middle period Indian Mahāyāna Buddhism', *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 134(1), pp. 25-50. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7817/jameroriesoci.134.1.0025> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).

Appleton, N. (2014) 'Buddhist scriptures: an overview' *The Expository Times* 125(12), pp. 573-582. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0014524614532209> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).

Arai, T. A. (1980) *How to organize a library in the Buddhist temple*. San Francisco: Bureau of Buddhist Education, Buddhist Churches of America.

Argyle, M. (2000) *Psychology and religion: an introduction*. London: Routledge.

Aronson, H. B. (2004) *Buddhist practice on Western ground: reconciling Eastern ideals and Western psychology*. London: Shambhala.

Augustine, M. J. and Kondō, T. (trans.) (1997) *Senchaku hongan nembutsu shū: a collection of passages on the Nembutsu chosen in the original vow compiled by Genkū (Hōnen) (Taishō Volume 83, Number 2608)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 104-II.

Austin, J. (trans.) (1949) *The Dhammapada from the Khuddaka Nikāya of the Sutta Piṭaka* [Sixth edition]. London: The Buddhist Society.

Baldanza, K. (2018) 'Publishing, book culture, and reading practices in Vietnam: the view from Thảng Nghiêm and Phổ Nhân Temples', *Journal of Vietnamese Studies* 13(1), pp. 9-28. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1525/vs.2018.13.3.9> (Accessed: 01 November 2020).

Barnes, M. (2011) 'Reading other religious texts: intratextuality and the logic of scripture', *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 46(3), pp. 389-410. Available at <http://publications.heythrop.ac.uk/1391/> (Accessed: 14 October 2020).

Baroni, H. J. (2002) *The illustrated encyclopedia of Zen Buddhism*. New York: The Rosen Publishing Group.

Batchelor, S. (1994) *Awakening of the West: the encounter of Buddhism and Western culture: 543 BCE – 1992*. London: Aquarian.

Baumann, M. (1994) 'The transplantation of Buddhism to Germany: progressive modes and strategies of adaptation', *Method & Theory in the Study of Religion* 6(1), pp. 35-61. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23549581> (Accessed: 29 October 2020).

Baumann, M. (1995) 'Creating a European path to Nirvāṇa: historical and contemporary developments of Buddhism in Europe', *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 10(1), pp. 55-70. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13537909508580726> (Accessed: 28 October 2020).

Baumann, M. (2002) 'Buddhism in Europe: past, present, prospects', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 85-105.

- Baumann, M. and Prebish, C. S. (2002) 'Introduction: paying homage to the Buddha in the West', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 1-13.
- Bechert, H. (1992) 'Writing down the Tipitaka in Pāli', *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens / Vienna Journal of South Asian Studies* 36, pp. 45-53. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24007915> (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Beckfort, J. A. (2003) *Social theory and religion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bell, S. (1991) *Buddhism in Britain: development and adaptation*. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of Durham. Available at: <http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/1507/> (Accessed: 29 October 2020).
- Bell, S. (2000) 'Being creative with tradition: rooting Theravāda Buddhism in Britain', *Journal of Global Buddhism* 1, pp. 1-23. Available at: <http://www.globalbuddhism.org/jgb/index.php/jgb/issue/view/1> (Accessed: 29 October 2020).
- Bell, S. (2002) 'Scandals in emerging Western Buddhism', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 230-242.
- Bendall, C. and Rouse, W. H. D. (trans.) (1971) *Śikṣā Samuccaya: a compendium of Buddhist doctrine compiled by Śāntideva, chiefly from earlier Mahāyāna Sūtras*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.
- Bentor, Y. (1995) 'On the Indian origins of the Tibetan practice of depositing relics and dhārāṇīs in stūpas and images', *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 115(2), pp. 248-261. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/604668> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Berkwitz, S. C. (2004) *Buddhist history in the vernacular: the power of the past in late medieval Sri Lanka*. Leiden: Brill. Brill's Indological library, 23.
- Berkwitz, S. C. (2009) 'Materiality and merit in Sri Lankan Buddhist manuscripts', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 35-49.
- Berkwitz, S. C. (2010) *South Asian Buddhism: a survey*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (2009) 'Introduction: rethinking Buddhist manuscript cultures', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 1-16.
- Berling, J. A. (1987) 'Bringing the Buddha down to Earth: notes on the emergence of "Yü-lu" as a Buddhist genre' *History of Religions* 27(1), pp. 566-588. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1062533> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).
- Bielefeldt, C. (1988) *Dōgen's manuals of Zen meditation*. Berkeley: University of California.
- Bielefeldt, C. (1992) 'No-mind and sudden awakening: thought on the soteriology of a Kamakura Zen text' in Buswell, R. E., Jr. and Gimello, R. M. (eds.) *Paths to liberation: the mārga and its transformations in Buddhist thought*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in East Asian Buddhism, 7, pp. 475-505.
- Bielefeldt, C. (2005) 'Practice' in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Critical terms for the study of Buddhism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 229-244.

- Bielefeldt, C. (2007) 'A discussion of seated Zen' in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Buddhism in practice* [Abridged edition]. Woodstock: Princeton University Press. Princeton readings in religion, pp. 147-156.
- Blackburn, A. M. (1999a) 'Magic in the monastery: textual practice and monastic identity in Sri Lanka', *History of Religions* 38(4), pp. 354-372. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3176323> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Blackburn, A. M. (1999b) 'Looking for the Vinaya: monastic discipline in the practical canons of the Theravāda', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 22(2), pp. 281-309. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8890> (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Blackburn, A. M. (2001) *Buddhist learning and textual practice in eighteenth-century Lankan monastic culture*. Oxford: Princeton University Press. Buddhisms.
- Blackburn, A. M. (2002) 'Notes on Sri Lankan temple manuscript collections', *Journal of the Pali Text Society* 27, pp. 1-59. Available at: [http://www.palitext.com/palitext/JPTS\\_PDF.htm](http://www.palitext.com/palitext/JPTS_PDF.htm) (Accessed: 22 October 2020).
- Bloch, J. (1950) *Les inscriptions d'Aśoka*. Paris: Société d'Édition Les belles lettres.
- Bloom, H. (1994) *The Western canon: the books and the schools of the ages*. London: Harcourt Brace & Company.
- Bloom, H. (2000) *How to read and why*. London: Fourth Estate.
- Bluck, R. (2006) *Buddhism in Britain: teaching, practice and development*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism.
- Blum, M. K. (trans.) (2013) *The Nirvana Sūtra (Mahāparinirvāṇa-Sūtra). Volume 1 (Taishō Volume 12, Number 374): translated from the Chinese*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Bode, K. and Osborne, R. (2015) 'Book history from the archival record', in Howsam, L. (ed.) *The Cambridge companion to the history of the book*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge companions to literature, pp. 219-236.
- Bodhi, B. (ed., trans.) (2000) *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Bodhi, B. (ed., trans.) (2012) *The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Aṅguttara Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Bodhi, B. (ed., trans.) (2017) *The Suttanipāta: an ancient collection of the Buddha's discourses together with its commentaries; Paramatthajotikā II and excerpts from the Niddesa*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Bodhipaksa (2017) *I can't believe it's not Buddha!* Available at: <https://www.lionsroar.com/i-cant-believe-its-not-buddha/> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).
- Bond, G. D. (1988) *The Buddhist revival in Sri Lanka: religious tradition, reinterpretation and response*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press. Studies in comparative religion.
- Bond, G. D. (1992) 'The gradual path as a hermeneutical approach to the Dhamma', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Buddhist hermeneutics* [Paperback edition]. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in Asian Buddhism, 6, pp. 29-45.

- Borup, J. (2016) 'Branding Buddha: mediatized and commodified Buddhism as cultural narrative', *Journal of Global Buddhism* 17, pp. 41-55. Available at: <http://www.globalbuddhism.org/jgb/index.php/jgb/article/view/178> (Accessed: 24 October 2020).
- Boucher, D. (1991) 'The Pratīyasamutpādagāthā and its role in the medieval cult of the relics', *The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 14(1), pp. 1-27. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8778> (Accessed: 31 October 2020).
- Bourdieu, P. (1993) *The field of cultural production: essays on art and literature*. London: Blackwell. European perspectives.
- Bowden, R. (2009) 'Writing down the Pali Tripitaka at Aloka Vihara in Sri Lanka', *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Sri Lanka* 55, pp. 115-167. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23731098> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).
- Bowman, M. (2000) 'More of the same? Christianity, vernacular religion and alternative spirituality in Glastonbury', in Sutcliffe, S. and Bowman, M. (eds.) *Beyond New Age: exploring alternative spirituality*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, pp. 83-104.
- Boyarin, J. (1993) 'Introduction', in Boyarin, J. (ed.) *The ethnography of reading*. Oxford: University of California Press, pp. 1-9.
- Brahm, A. (2006a) *Opening the door of your heart and other Buddhist tales of happiness* [BPS edition]. Kandy: Buddhist Publications Society.
- Brahm, A. (2006b) *Mindfulness, bliss, and beyond: a meditator's handbook*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.
- Brasington, L. (2015) *Right concentration: a practical guide to the jhānas*. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- Brehm, J. (ed.) (2017) *The poetry of impermanence, mindfulness, and joy*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.
- Brehm, J. (2021) *The Dharma of poetry: how poems can deepen your spiritual practice and open you to joy*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.
- Bretfeld, S. (2007) 'The later spread of Buddhism in Tibet' in Heirman, A. and Bumbacher, S. P. (eds.) *The spread of Buddhism*. Leiden: Brill. Handbook of Oriental Studies = Handbuck der Orientalistik. Section eight. Central Asia 16, pp. 341-377.
- Brock, M. L. (2009) 'Post-Modernism', in Watling, G. (ed.) *Cultural history of reading. Volume 1: world literature*. London: Greenwood Press, pp. 251-273.
- Bronkhorst, J. (2002) 'Literacy and rationality in ancient India', *Asiatische Studien/Études Asiatiques* 54(4), pp. 797-831 [1-33]. Available at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263846721> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).
- Brook, T. (2005) 'Institution' in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed) *Critical terms for the study of Buddhism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 143-161.

Broucke, P. v. (2007) 'The accounts of Milbon, Hyet'ong and Myöngnang in the Samguk Yusa' in Heirman, A. and Bumbacher, S. P. (eds.) *The spread of Buddhism*. Leiden: Brill. Handbook of Oriental Studies = Handbuck der Orientalistik. Section eight. Central Asia 16, pp. 277-302.

Brunnhölzl, K. (trans.) (2018) *A compendium of the Mahāyāna: Asaṅga's Mahāyānasamgraha and its Indian and Tibetan commentaries*. Boulder: Snow Lion. The Tsadra Foundation series.

Brussat, F. and Brussat, M. A. (2021) *Making reading sacred: ways to make reading into a spiritual practice through enthusiasm, gratitude, hospitality, meaning, and openness*. Available at: <https://www.spiritualityandpractice.com/books/features/view/10900/making-reading-sacred> (Accessed: 14 January 2020).

Buddhadasa, B. (1996) *Handbook for mankind*. Translated by Roderick S. Bucknell [First electronic edition] [Online]. Thani: Dhammadana Foundation. Available at: <http://www.buddhanet.net/budasa.htm> (Accessed: 03 November 2020).

Bumbacher, S. P. (2007) 'Early Buddhism in China: Daoist reactions' in Heirman, A. and Bumbacher, S. P. (eds.) *The spread of Buddhism*. Leiden: Brill. Handbook of Oriental Studies = Handbuck der Orientalistik Section eight. Central Asia 16, pp. 203-246.

Buswell, R. E., Jr. (1986) 'Chinul's systematization of Chinese meditative techniques in Korean Sōn Buddhism', in Gregory, P. N. (ed.) *Traditions of meditation in Chinese Buddhism*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in east Asian Buddhism 4, pp. 198-242.

Buswell, R. E., Jr. and Gimello, R. M. (1992) 'Introduction' in Buswell, R. E., Jr. and Gimello, R. M. (eds.) *Paths to liberation: the mārga and its transformations in Buddhist thought*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in East Asian Buddhism, 7, pp. 1-36.

Butler, C. (2002) *Postmodernism: a very short introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Very short introductions.

Byrom, T. (trans.) (1993) *Dhammapada: the sayings of the Buddha*. London: Shambhala Publications.

Cabanas, E. and Illouz, E. (2018) *Happycratie: comment l'industrie du bonheur a pris le contrôle de nos vies*. Translated by Frédéric Joly. Paris: Premier Parallèle.

Cabezón, J. I. and Dorjee, P. (2019) *Sera Monastery*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.

Campany, R. F. (1991) 'Notes on the devotional uses and symbolic functions of sūtra texts as depicted in early Chinese Buddhist miracle tales and hagiographies', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 14(1), pp. 28-72. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8779> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).

Campany, R. F. (2018) 'Miracle tales as scripture reception: a case study involving the Lotus Sūtra in China, 370-750 CE', *Early Medieval China* 24, pp. 24-52. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/15299104.2018.1493826> (Accessed: 31 October 2020).

Campergue, C. (2015) 'Gifts and the selfless work ethic in Tibetan Buddhist centres in France', *Religion Compass* 9(11), pp. 443-461. Available at: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/rec3.12183> (Accessed: 25 October 2020).

Candamitto, V. (1972) *Buddhist organizations in Great Britain*. Unpublished MA dissertation. Durham University. Available at: <http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/10249/> (Accessed: 29 October 2020).

- Carrette, J. and King, R. (2005) *Selling spirituality: the silent takeover of religion*. London: Routledge.
- Carrithers, M. (1983) *The forest monks of Sri Lanka: an anthropological and historical study*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Causton, R. (1988) *Nichiren Shoshu Buddhism: an introduction*. London: Rider.
- Certeau, M. de (1988) *The practice of everyday life*. Translated by Steven Rendall. London: University of California Press.
- Chah, A. (2007) *Living Dhamma* [Online]. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Publications. Available at: <https://forestsangha.org/teachings/books/living-dhamma?language=English> (Accessed: 31 October 2020).
- Chah, A. (2011) *The collected teachings of Ajahn Chah*. Harnham: Aruna Publications.
- Chah, A. (2018) *On meditation* [Online]. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Publications. Available at: <https://forestsangha.org/teachings/books/authors/ajahn-chah?language=English> (Accessed: 03 November 2020).
- Chang, G. C. C. (trans.) (1962) *The hundred songs of Milarepa*. Boulder: Shambhala Publications.
- Chanthaphavong, S. L. S. (2009) 'Japan', in Watling, G. (ed.) *Cultural history of reading. Volume 1: world literature*. London: Greenwood Press, pp. 325-339.
- Chappell, D. W. (1986) 'From dispute to dual cultivation: Pure Land responses to Ch'an critics', in Gregory, P. N. (ed.) *Traditions of meditation in Chinese Buddhism*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. *Studies in east Asian Buddhism* 4, pp. 163-197.
- Chartier, R. (1994) *The order of books: readers, authors, and libraries in Europe between the fourteenth and eighteenth centuries*. Translated by Lydia G. Cochrane. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Chartier, R. (2002a) 'Labourers and voyagers: from the text to the reader', in Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (eds.) *Book history reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 47-58.
- Chartier, R. (2002b) 'The practical impact of writing', in Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (eds.) *Book history reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 118-142.
- Chaturvedi, N. (2010) 'The literary characteristics of the Sutta Nipāta', *Proceedings of the Indian History Congress* 70, pp. 73-77.
- Cheah, J. (2017) 'US Buddhist traditions', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 316-331.
- Chödrön, P. (1997) *When things fall apart: heart advice for difficult times*. Boston: Shambhala.
- Chung, B. (2010) 'Sot'aesan's creation of Won Buddhism through the reformation of Korean Buddhism', in Park, J. Y. (ed.) *Makers of modern Korean Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Korean studies, pp. 61-90.
- Chung-yuan, C. (trans.) (1971) *Teachings of Buddhism selected from The Transmission of the Lamp* [First Vintage Books edition]. New York: Vintage Books.
- Cleary, J. C. (trans.) (1994) *Pure land, pure mind: the Buddhism of masters Chu-hung and Tsung-pen*. New York: Sūtra Translation Committee of the United States and Canada. Pure Land series.

Cleary, J. C. (trans.) (1999) *The recorded sayings of Linji*, in Sengaku, M. (ed.) *Three Chan classics: the recorded sayings of Linji; Women's Gate; The Faith-mind Maxim (Taishō Volumes 47 and 48 Numbers 1985, 2005, 2010)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 74-I, II, III.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (1993) *The Flower Ornament Scripture: a translation of the Avataṃsaka Sūtra*. London: Shambhala.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (1995) *Buddhist yoga: a comprehensive course*. London: Shambhala Publications.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (1997) *The Five Houses of Zen*. London: Shambhala Publications. Shambhala dragon editions.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005a) 'Zen Lessons', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume One*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 3-124.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005b) 'Zen essence: the science of freedom', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume One*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 125-244.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005c) 'Minding mind: a course in basic meditation', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume One*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 391-491.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005d) 'Teachings of Zen', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Two*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 1-77.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005e) 'Zen letters', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Two*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 158-238.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005f) 'The Sūtra of Hui-neng', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Three*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 3-166.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005g) 'Kensho: the heart of Zen', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Three*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 231-346.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005h) 'Unlocking the Zen Koan', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Four*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 227-408.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2005i) 'Record of things heard: from the Treasury of the Eye of the True Teaching: the Shōbōgenzō-Zuimonki, talks of Zen Master Dōgen, as recorded by Zen Master Ejo', in Cleary, T. (trans.) *Classics of Buddhism and Zen: the collected translations of Thomas Cleary. Volume Four*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, pp. 712-850.

Cleary, T. (trans.) (2012) *The Zen reader*. London: Shambhala Publications.

Clemente, M. (2014) 'Padmasambhava's chronicles', in Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (eds.) *Buddha's word: the life of books in Tibet and beyond*. Cambridge: Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge, pp. 57-69.

Cohen, R. S. (2012) *The splendid vision: reading a Buddhist sutra*. New York: Columbia University Press.



- Colclough, S. (2009) 'Readers: books and biography', in Eliot, S. and Rose, J. (eds.) *A companion to the history of the book*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to literature and culture, 48, pp. 50-62.
- Cole, A. (2005) *Text as father: paternal seduction in early Mahāyāna Buddhist literature*. London: University of California Press. Buddhisms.
- Coleman, D. (2009) *In bed with the word: reading, spirituality, and cultural politics*. Edmonton: The University of Alberta Press.
- Coleman, J. W. (1999) 'The new Buddhism: some empirical findings', in Williams, D. R. and Queen, C. S. (eds.) *American Buddhism: methods and findings in recent scholarship*. Richmond: Curzon Press. Curzon critical studies in Buddhism, pp. 91-99.
- Coleman, J. W. (2001) *The new Buddhism: the Western transformation of an ancient tradition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Collins, S. (1990) 'On the very idea of the Pāli canon', *Journal of the Pali Text Society* 15, pp. 89-126. Available at: [http://www.palitext.com/palitext/JPTS\\_PDF.htm](http://www.palitext.com/palitext/JPTS_PDF.htm) (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Collins, S. (1992) 'Notes on some oral aspects of Pali literature', *Indo-Iranian Journal* 35(2/3), pp. 121-135. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24659521> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).
- Collins, S. (1998) *Nirvana and other Buddhist felicities: utopias and the Pali imaginaire*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge studies in religious traditions 12.
- Collins, S. (2010) *Nirvana: concept, imagery, narrative*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Conze, E. (trans.) (1965) 'The Adhyardhaśatikā Prajñāpāramitā', in Nakano, G. (ed.) *Studies of esoteric Buddhism and Tantrism in commemoration of the 1,150<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the founding of Koyasan*. Koyasan: Koyasan University, pp. 101-115.
- Conze, E. (1979) *Memoires of a modern gnostic: part I: life and letters*. Sherborne: Samizdat Publishing Company.
- Conze, E. (trans.) (2001) *Buddhist wisdom: containing the Diamond Sūtra and the Heart Sūtra* [First Vintage edition]. New York: Vintage books. Vintage spiritual classics.
- Cook, J. (2010) *Meditation in modern Buddhism: renunciation and change in Thai monastic life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Copson, A. (2019) *Secularism: a very short introduction* [First paperback edition]. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Very short introductions.
- Cousins, L. S. (2005) 'Pali oral literature', in Williams, P. (ed.) *Buddhism: critical concepts in religious studies. Volume I: Buddhist origins and the early history of Buddhism in South and Southeast Asia*. London: Routledge, pp. 96-104.
- Cousins, L. S. (2009) 'Scholar monks and meditator monks revisited', in Powers, J. and Prebish, C. S. (eds.) *Destroying Māra forever: Buddhist ethics essays in honour of Damien Keown*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 31-46.
- Coward, H. (1986) 'Oral and written texts in Buddhism', *The Adyar Library Bulletin* 50, pp. 299-313.

Coward, H. (1988) *Sacred word and sacred scripture: scripture in world religions*. New York: Orbis Books.

Coward, H. (1992) 'The role of scripture in the self-definition of Hinduism and Buddhism in India', *Studies in Religion/Sciences Religieuses* 21(2), pp. 129-144. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/000842989202100201> (Accessed: 04 August 2020).

Cowell, E. B. (ed.) (2005-2016) *The Jātaka or stories of the Buddha's former lives*. Bristol: Pali Text Society.

Cox, L. (2014) 'Buddhism in Ireland: the inner life of world-systems', *Études irlandaises* 39(2), pp. 161-172. Available at: <https://journals.openedition.org/etudesirlandaises/3948> (Accessed: 29 October 2020).

Cox, L. (2017) 'European Buddhist traditions', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 332-345.

Crosby, K. (2014) *Theravada Buddhism: continuity, diversity, and identity*. Chichester: Wiley Blackwell. Wiley Blackwell guides to Buddhism.

Crosby, K. (2020) *Esoteric Theravada: the story of the forgotten meditation tradition of Southeast Asia*. Boulder: Shambhala.

Crosby, K. and Skilton, A. (trans.) (1995) *The Bodhicaryāvatāra [by] Śāntideva*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Oxford world's classics.

Croucher, P. (1989) *Buddhism in Australia 1848-1988*. Kensington: New South Wales University Press.

Culadasa, Immergut, M. and Graves, J. (2015) *The mind illuminated: a complete meditation guide integrating Buddhist wisdom and brain science*. Pearce: Dharma Treasure Press.

Culler, J. (1997) *Literary theory: a very short introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Very Short Introductions.

Cummings, B. (2013) 'The book as symbol', in Suarez, M. F. and Woudhuysen, H. R. (eds.) *The book: a global history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 93-96.

Dagpa, L. and Goldberg, J. (trans.) (2002) *The three visions: fundamental teachings of the Sakya lineage of Tibetan Buddhism: a translation of the Tibetan text 'The beautiful ornament of the three visions': an exposition of the preliminary practices of the path which extensively explain the instructions of the Path Including its Result in accordance with the root treatise of the Vajra verses of Virūpa by Ngorchon Konchog Lhundrub* [Second edition]. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications

Dalia, A. A. (trans.) (2014) 'Biography of Dharma Master Vasubandhu: translated from the Chinese of Paramārtha (Taishō Volume 50, Number 2049), in Bukkyō Dendō Kyūkai (ed.) *Lives of great monks and nuns* [dBET pdf version]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, pp. 29-53. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/lives-of-great-monks-and-nuns/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).

Darnton, R. (1982) 'What is the history of books?' *Daedalus* 111(3), pp. 65-83. Available at <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20024803> (Accessed: 24 October 2020).

Darnton, R. (2007) "'What is the history of books?' revisited', *Modern Intellectual History* 4(3), pp. 495-508. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479244307001370> (Accessed: 24 October 2020).

- Darnton, R. (2009) *The case for books: past, present and future*. New York: Public Affairs.
- Darnton, R. (2014) 'First steps toward a history of reading', *Australian Journal of French Studies* 51(2-3), pp. 152-177. Available at: <https://search.informit.com.au/documentSummary;dn=376489000877796;res=IELHSS> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).
- Davidson, R. M. (2002) *Indian esoteric Buddhism: a social history of the Tantric movement*. Chichester: Columbia University Press.
- Davie, G. (1990) 'Believing without belonging: is this the future of religion in Britain?', *Social Compass* 37(4), pp. 455-469. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/003776890037004004> (Accessed: 24 October 2020).
- Datta, B. K. (1960) *Libraries and librarianship of ancient and medieval India*. Delhi: Atma Ram & Sons.
- Davis, T. F. and Womack, K. (2002) *Formalist criticism and reader-response theory*. Basingstoke: Palgrave. Transitions.
- Dawa, L. (trans.) (2007) *The King of Glorious Sūtras called the Exalted Sublime Golden Light: a Mahāyāna Sūtra* [Online]. Portland: Foundation for the Preservation of the Mahāyāna Tradition. Available at: [https://shop.fpmt.org/The-King-of-Glorious-Sutras-called-the-Exalted-Sublime-Golden-Light-eBook-PDF\\_p\\_2348.html](https://shop.fpmt.org/The-King-of-Glorious-Sutras-called-the-Exalted-Sublime-Golden-Light-eBook-PDF_p_2348.html) (Accessed: 09 November 2020).
- Dawei, B. (2012) 'Conversion to Tibetan Buddhism: some reflections', in Ura, D. K. and Chopel, D. (eds.) *Buddhism without borders: proceedings of the international conference on globalised Buddhism, Bumthang, Butan May 21-23, 2012*. Thimphu: The Centre for Bhutan Studies, pp. 53-75.
- De Silva, P. (2014) *An introduction to Buddhist psychology and counselling: pathways of mindfulness-based therapies* [Fifth edition]. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- De Simini, F. (2016) *Of gods and books: ritual and knowledge transmission in the manuscript cultures of premodern India*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter. [Online] Available at: <https://www.degruyter.com/view/title/520830> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Deegalle, M. (2007) *Popularizing Buddhism: preaching as performance in Sri Lanka*. Albany: SUNY Press. SUNY series in Buddhist Studies.
- Dhammananda, K. S. (1989) *How to live without fear and worry* [Online]. Kuala Lumpur: Buddhist Missionary Society. Available at: <http://www.budaedu.org/ebooks/6-EN.php> (Accessed: 04 November 2020).
- Dhammananda, K. S. (1993) *What Buddhists believe* [Expanded and revised edition]. Taipei: The Corporate Body of the Buddha Educational Foundation.
- Dharmachakra Translation Committee (trans.) (2006) *Middle beyond extremes: Maitreya's Madhyāntavibhaṅga with commentaries by Khenpo Shenga and Ju Mipham*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.
- Diemberger, H. (2012) 'Quand le livre devient relique: les textes tibétains entre culture bouddhique et transformations technologiques', *Terrain: anthropologie & sciences humaines* 59, pp. 18-39. Available at: <http://journals.openedition.org/terrain/14916> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).

Díez de Velasco, F. (2013) *El Budismo en España: historia, visibilización e implementación*. Madrid: Akal.

Díez de Velasco, F. (2018) 'La relevancia de la producción editorial budista en la visibilización del budismo en España' *Éndoxa* 42, pp. 69-137. Available at: <https://riull.ull.es/xmlui/handle/915/14436> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).

Doherty, G. (1983) 'Form is emptiness: reading the Diamond Sutra' *The Eastern Buddhist* 16(2), pp. 114-123. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44361688> (Accessed: 18 October 2020).

Donath, D. C. (1971) *Buddhism for the West: Theravada, Mahayana and Vajrayana: a comprehensive review of Buddhist history, philosophy, and teachings from the time of the Buddha to the present day*. New York: The Julian Press.

Dorje, G. (trans.); Coleman, G. and Jinpa, T. (eds.) (2006) *The Tibetan Book of the Dead; The Great Liberation by Hearing in the Intermediate States; composed by Padmasambhava; revealed by Tertön Karma Lingpa* [First paperback edition]. London: Penguin Books.

Drègue, J.-P. (1991) 'La lecture et l'écriture en Chine et la xylographie', *Études chinoises* 10(1/2), pp. 77-111. Available at: [https://www.persee.fr/doc/etchi\\_0755-5857\\_1991\\_num\\_10\\_1\\_1144](https://www.persee.fr/doc/etchi_0755-5857_1991_num_10_1_1144) (Accessed: 27 October 2020).

Drewes, D. (2007) 'Revisiting the phrase "sa prthivīpradeśāś caityabhūto bhavet" and the Mahāyāna cult of the book', *Indo-Iranian Journal* 50, pp. 101-143. Available at: [https://brill.com/view/journals/ijj/50/2/article-p101\\_1.xml](https://brill.com/view/journals/ijj/50/2/article-p101_1.xml) (Accessed: 20 October 2020).

Drewes, D. (2011) 'Dharmabhāṇakas in early Mahāyāna', *Indo-Iranian Journal* 54, pp. 351-372. Available at: [https://brill.com/view/journals/ijj/54/4/article-p331\\_3.xml](https://brill.com/view/journals/ijj/54/4/article-p331_3.xml) (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Drewes, D. (2015) 'Oral texts in Indian Mahāyāna', *Indo-Iranian Journal* 58, pp. 117-141. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24665913> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Dreyfus, G. B. J. (2003) *The hand of two hands clapping: the education of a Tibetan Buddhist monk*. London: University of California Press.

DuBois, T. D. (2009) 'Introduction: the transformation of religion in East and Southeast Asia: paradigmatic change in regional perspective', in DuBois, T. D. (ed.) *Casting faiths: imperialism and the transformation of religion in East and Southeast Asia*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 1-19.

Dumoulin, H. (2007) *Zen enlightenment: origins and meaning* [First Shambhala edition]. Translated by John C. Maraldo. London: Shambhala Publications.

Dutt, S. (1962) *Buddhist monks and monasteries in India: their history and their contribution to Indian culture*. London: George Allen and Unwin.

Eagleton, T. (1983) *Literary theory: an introduction*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Eco, U. (1994) *The role of the reader: explorations in the semiotics of texts*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. Advances in semiotics.

Eddy, G. (2012) *Becoming Buddhist: experiences of socialization and self-transformation in two Australian Buddhist centres*. London: Bloomsbury Academic. Continuum advances in religious studies.

- Edgren, J. S. (2009) 'China', in Eliot, S. and Rose, J. (eds.) *A companion to the history of the book*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to literature and culture, 48, pp. 97-110.
- Edgren, J. S. (2013) 'The history of the book in China', in Suarez, M. F. and Woudhuysen, H. R. (eds.) *The book: a global history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 573-592.
- Ekvall, R. B. (1953) 'Five universals of Tibetan religion', *Oriens* 6(2), pp. 334-343. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1579172> (Accessed: 04 November 2020).
- Ekvall, R. B. (1964) *Religious observances in Tibet: patterns and functions*. London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (2014a) (eds.) *Buddha's word: the life of books in Tibet and beyond*. Cambridge: Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge.
- Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (2014b) 'Introduction: text as relic in Tibet', in Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (eds.) *Buddha's word: the life of books in Tibet and beyond*. Cambridge: Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge, pp. 7-12.
- Elster, C. A. (2003) 'Authority, performance, and interpretation in religious reading: critical issues of intercultural communication and multiple literacies', *Journal of Literary Research* 35(1) pp. 663-692. Available at: [https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s15548430jlr3501\\_5](https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s15548430jlr3501_5) (Accessed: 27 October 2020).
- Emmrick, C. (2009) 'Emending perfection: prescript, postscript, and practice in Newar Buddhist manuscript culture', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 140-156.
- Engle, A. B. (trans.) (2009) *The inner science of Buddhist practice: Vasubandhu's Summary of the Five Heaps with commentary by Sthiramati*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications. The Tsadra Foundation series.
- Ennin (1955) *Ennin's diary: the record of a pilgrimage to China in search of the Law*. Translated by Edwin O. Reischauer. New York: Ronald Press Company.
- Eubanks, C. (2010) 'Circumambulatory reading: revolving sūtra libraries and Buddhist scrolls', *Book History* 13, pp. 1-24. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40930526> (Accessed: 23 October 2020).
- Eubanks, C. (2011) *Miracles of book and body: Buddhist textual culture and Medieval Japan*. London: University of California Press. Buddhisms.
- Eubanks, C. (2013) 'Reading by heart: translated Buddhism and the pictorial *Heart Sūtras* of early modern Japan', *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 2013(220), pp. 7-25. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1515/ijsl-2013-0011> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).
- Falk, J. (2011) 'The transmission of Zen as dual discourse: Shaku Soen and Okakura Kakuzo', in Whalen-Bridge, J. and Storhoff, G. (eds.) *Writing as Enlightenment: Buddhist American literature into the Twenty-first century*. Albany: State University of New York. SUNY series in Buddhism and American culture, pp. 19-35.
- Fauré, B. (1986) 'One-practice Samadhi in early Ch'an', in Gregory, P. N. (ed.) *Traditions of meditation in Chinese Buddhism*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in east Asian Buddhism 4, pp. 98-128.

- Fauré, B. (1998) *The read thread: Buddhist approaches to sexuality*. Chichester: Princeton University Press.
- Fauré, B. (2003) *The power of denial: Buddhism, purity, and gender*. Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- Fauré, B. (2009) *Unmasking Buddhism*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (2013) *An introduction to book history* [Second edition]. London: Routledge.
- Fischer, S. R. (2003) *A history of reading*. London: Reaktion Books. Globalities.
- Fish, S. (1980) *Is there a text in this class? The authority of interpretative communities*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Fish, S. (2002) 'Interpreting the *Variorum*', in Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (eds.) *Book history reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 350-358.
- Fish, S. (2004) 'Interpretative communities', in Rivkin, J. and Ryan, M. (eds.) *Literary theory: an anthology* [Second edition]. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, pp. 217-221.
- Fisher, G. (2012) 'Buddhism in China and Taiwan' in McMahan, D. L. (ed.) *Buddhism in the modern world*. London: Routledge, p. 69-88.
- Flores, R. (2008) *Buddhist scriptures as literature: sacred rhetoric and the uses of theory*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Foxeus, N. (2017) 'Contemporary Burmese Buddhism', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 212-235.
- Franklyn, J. J. (2008) *The lotus and the lion: Buddhism and the British Empire*. London: Cornell University Press.
- Frasch, T. (2013) 'Buddhist councils in a time of transition: globalism, modernity and the preservation of textual traditions' *Contemporary Buddhism: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 14(1), pp. 38-51. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/14639947.2013.785245> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).
- Fronsdal, G. (2002) 'Virtues without rules: ethics in the insight meditation movement', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 285-306.
- Fronsdal, G. (trans.) (2005) *The Dhammapada: teachings of the Buddha*. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- Frost, S. R. (2011) 'Commodity readers: an introduction to a frame for reading', in Crone, R. and Towheed, S. (eds.) *The history of reading. Volume 3: methods, strategies, tactics*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 27-45.
- Galamboś, I. (2014) 'Votive manuscripts inside the Guanyin statue', in Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (eds.) *Buddha's word: the life of books in Tibet and beyond*. Cambridge: Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge, pp. 39-41.
- Garfield, J. L. (2016) 'Buddhism and modernity', in Powers, J. (ed.) *The Buddhist world*. London: Routledge, pp. 294-304.

- Geiger, W. (trans.) (1912) *The Mahāvamsa, or the great chronicle of Ceylon*. London: Pali Text Society.
- Gellner, D. N. (1996) "'The Perfection of Wisdom"—a text and its uses in Kwā Bahā, Lalitpur', in Lienhard, S. (ed.) *Change and continuity: studies in the Nepalese culture of the Kathmandu Valley*. Torino: Edizioni dell'Orso. Orientalia: Collana di Studi Orientali del CESMEO VII.
- Germano, D. (2004) 'Living relics of the Buddha(s) in Tibet', in Germano, D. and Trainor, K. (eds.) *Embodying the Dharma: Buddhist relic veneration in Asia*. Albany: State University of New York Press, pp. 51-91.
- Gethin, R. (1992) 'The Mātikās: memorization, mindfulness, and the list', in Gyatso, J. (ed.) *In the mirror of memory: reflections on mindfulness and remembrance in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York, pp. 149-172.
- Gethin, R. (1998) *The foundations of Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. OPUS.
- Gethin, R. (trans.) (2008) *Sayings of the Buddha: a selection of suttas from the Pali Nikāyas*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Oxford World's Classics.
- Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2001) *The Susiddhikara Sūtra*, in Giebel, R. W. *Two esoteric Sūtras: the Adamantine Pinnacle Sūtra; the Susiddhikara Sūtra*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 29-II, 30-II.
- Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2004) *Shingon texts: On the difference between exoteric and esoteric teachings; the meaning of becoming a Buddha in this very body; the meanings of sound, sign, and reality; the meaning of the word Hūṃ; the precious key to the secret treasure, by Kūkai: translated from the Japanese (Taishō Volume 77, Numbers 2427, 2429, 2430, 2426)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 98-I, II, III, IV, V.
- Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2005) *The Vairocanaṅghisambodhi Sūtra: translated from the Chinese (Taishō Volume 118, Number 848)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Giebel, R. W. (trans.) (2015) 'The Mātanga Sūtra (Taishō Volume 21, Number 1300)' in Mayeda, S. (ed.) *Esoteric texts*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Giebel, R. W. and Todaro, D. A. (trans.) (2004) *Shingon texts* [Online]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka series, 98-I, II, III, IV, V, VI, VII. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/shingon-texts/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).
- Go, C. (2010) 'Sŏn master Daehaeng's "Doing without doing"', in Park, J. Y. (ed.) *Makers of modern Korean Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Korean studies, pp. 227-242.
- Goldberg, E. (1999) 'The re-orientation of Buddhism in North America' *Method & Theory in the Study of Religion* 11(4), pp. 340-356. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23555538> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).
- Gombrich, R. (1984) 'The evolution of the Sangha', in Bechert, H. and Gombrich, R. (eds.) *The world of Buddhism: Buddhist monks and nuns in society and culture*. London: Thames and Hudson, pp. 77-89.
- Gombrich, R. (2005) 'How the Mahāyāna began', in Williams, Paul (ed.) *Buddhism: critical concepts in religious studies. Volume III: the origin and nature of Mahāyāna Buddhism; some Mahāyāna religious topic*. London: Routledge, pp. 74-83.

- Gombrich, R. F. (2006a) *Theravāda Buddhism: a social history from ancient Benares to modern Colombo* [Second edition]. London: Routledge.
- Gombrich, R. F. (2006b) *How Buddhism began: the conditioned genesis of the early teachings* [Second edition]. London: Routledge.
- Gombrich, R. F. (2013) *What the Buddha thought* [Corrected edition]. Sheffield: Equinox. Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies monographs.
- Goodell, E. (2008) 'Taixu's youth and years of Romantic idealism, 1890-1914', *Chung-Hwa Buddhist Journal* 21, pp. 77-121. Available at: [http://chinesebuddhiststudies.org/previous\\_issues.html](http://chinesebuddhiststudies.org/previous_issues.html) (Accessed: 04 November 2020).
- Goody, J. (1968) 'Introduction', in Goody, J. (ed.) *Literacy in traditional societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 1-26.
- Goonatilake, S. (2000) 'Buddhist Protestantism: the reverse flow of ideas from Sri Lanka to the West', *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Sri Lanka* 45, pp. 35-69. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23732460> (Accessed: 24 October 2020).
- Gordon-Finlayson, A. (2012) *Becoming Buddhist: a grounded theory of religious change and identity formation in Western Buddhism*. Unpublished PhD thesis. Liverpool John Moores University. Available at: [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/262646777\\_Becoming\\_Buddhist\\_A\\_grounding\\_theory\\_of\\_religious\\_change\\_and\\_identity\\_formation\\_in\\_Western\\_Buddhism](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/262646777_Becoming_Buddhist_A_grounding_theory_of_religious_change_and_identity_formation_in_Western_Buddhism) (Accessed: 22 October 2020).
- Gordon-Finlayson, A. and Daniels, M. (2008) 'Westerners converting to Buddhism: an explanatory grounded theory investigation', *Transpersonal Psychology Review* 12(8), pp. 100-119. Available at: [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/225034510\\_Westerners\\_converting\\_to\\_Buddhism\\_An\\_exploratory\\_grounding\\_theory\\_investigation](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/225034510_Westerners_converting_to_Buddhism_An_exploratory_grounding_theory_investigation) (Accessed: 22 October 2020).
- Graham, W. A. (1987) *Beyond the written word: oral aspects of scripture in the history of religion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gray, D. B. (2009) 'On the very idea of a Tantric canon: myth, politics, and the formation of the Bka' 'gyur', *Journal of the International Association of Tibetan Studies* 5, pp. 1-37. Available at: <http://www.thlib.org/collections/texts/jiats/#!jiats=/05/gray/> (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Greene, E. M. (2017) 'Atonement of Pārājika transgressions in fifth-century Chinese Buddhism', in Andrews, S., Chen, J. and Liu, Cuilan (eds.) *Rules of engagement: medieval traditions of Buddhist monastic regulation*. Hamburg: Projekt Verlag. Hamburg Buddhist studies 9, pp. 369-408.
- Grieve, G. P. and Veidlinger, D. (2017) 'Buddhism and media technologies', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 469-483.
- Griffith Foulk, T. (2004) "'Chanyuan quingui" and other "Rules of Purity" in Chinese Buddhism'. Translated by Albert Welter, in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *The Zen canon: understanding the classic texts*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 275-312.
- Griffith Foulk, T. (2006) "'Rules of purity" in Japanese Zen', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *Zen classics: formative texts in the history of Zen Buddhism*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 139-169.



- Griffith Foulk, T. (2007) 'Daily life in the assembly' in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Buddhism in practice* [Abridged edition]. Woodstock: Princeton University Press. Princeton readings in religion, pp. 339-356.
- Griffiths, P. J. (1999) *Religious reading: the place of reading in the practice of religion*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gu, M. G. (2005) *Chinese theories of reading and writing: a route to hermeneutics and open poetics*. Albany: State University of New York Press. Suny series in Chinese philosophy and culture.
- Guenther, H. V. (trans.) (1971) *Life and teachings of Nāropa* [First paperback edition]. Oxford: Oxford University Press. UNESCO collection of representative works. Tibetan series.
- Gummer, N. D. (2012) 'Listening to the Dharmabhāṇaka: the Buddhist preacher in and of the Sūtra of Utmost Golden Radiance', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 80(1), pp. 137-160. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41348772> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).
- Gupta, A. (2013) 'The history of the book in the Indian subcontinent', in Suarez, M. F. and Woudhuysen, H. R. (eds.) *The book: a global history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 553-572.
- Gyaltse, T. (2007) 'Two songs by Tragba Gyaltzen', in Brunnhölzl, L. (trans.) *Straight from the heart: Buddhist pith instructions*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 241-275.
- Gyatso, J. (1992a) 'Introduction', in Gyatso, J. (ed.) *In the mirror of memory: reflections on mindfulness and remembrance in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York, pp. 1-20.
- Gyatso, J. (1992b) 'Letter magic: a Peircean perspective on the semiotics of Rdo Gru-chen's dhāraṇī memory', in Gyatso, J. (ed.) *In the mirror of memory: reflections on mindfulness and remembrance in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York, pp. 173-213.
- Gyatso, T. (2004) *An introduction to Buddhism: teachings on the Four Noble Truths, the Eight Verses on Training the Mind, and the Lamp for the Path to Enlightenment*. Translated by Thupten Jinpa. Boulder: Shambhala.
- Gyatso, T. (2018) *Perfecting patience: Buddhist techniques to overcome anger*. Translated by Thupten Jinpa. Boulder: Snow Lion.
- Gyatso, T.; McClen Novick, R., Jinpa, T., and Ribush, N. (eds.) (2002) *Illuminating the path to enlightenment: a commentary on Atisha Dipamkara Shrijnana's A Lamp for the Path to Enlightenment and Lama Je Tsong Khapa's Lines of Experience*. Translated by Geshe Thupten Jinpa. Long Beach: Thubten Dhargye Ling.
- Gyatso, T. and Chodron, T. (2018) *The Foundation of Buddhist practice*. Somerville: Wisdom. The library of wisdom and compassion, 2.
- Gyatso, T. and Kamalaśīla (2019) *Stages of meditation: the Buddhist classic on training the mind*. Translated by Geshe Lobsang Jordhen, Losang Choephel Ganchenpa and Jeremy Russell. Boulder: Shambhala Publications.
- Habito, R. L. F. (1986) 'The Trikāya doctrine in Buddhism', *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 6, pp. 52-62. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1390131> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).
- Habito, R. L. F. (1999) 'Bodily reading the Lotus Sūtra: understanding Nichiren's Buddhism', *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 26(3/4), pp. 281-306. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/30233628> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).

- Habito, R. L. F. (2009) 'Bodily reading of the Lotus Sūtra', in Teiser, S. F. and Stone, J. I. (eds.) *Readings of the Lotus Sūtra*. Chichester: Columbia University Press. Columbia readings of Buddhist literature, pp. 186-208.
- Hadot, P. (1995) *Philosophy as a way of life: spiritual exercises from Socrates to Foucault*. Translated by Michael Chase. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Hagen, S. (1999) *Buddhism plain and simple*. London: Penguin Books.
- Hakeda, Y. S. (trans.) (1972) *Kūkai: major works, with an account of his life and a study of his thought*. London: Columbia University Press.
- Hallisey, C. (1995) 'Roads taken and not taken in the study of Theravāda Buddhism', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Curators of the Buddha: the study of Buddhism under colonialism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 31-62.
- Hammond, M. (2015) 'Book history in the reading experience', in Howsam, L. (ed.) *The Cambridge companion to the history of the book*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge companions to literature, pp. 237-252.
- Han, J. (2009) 'Korea', in Watling, G. (ed.) *Cultural history of reading. Volume 1: world literature*. London: Greenwood Press, pp. 341-361.
- Hansen, A. R. (2007) *How to behave: Buddhism and modernity in colonial Cambodia, 1860-1930*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Southeast Asia: politics, meaning, and memory.
- Hansen, A. and Machin, D. (2019) *Media and communication research methods* [Second edition]. London: Red Globe Press.
- Hardy, R. S. (1860) *Eastern monachism: an account of the origins, laws, discipline, sacred writings, mysterious rites, religious ceremonies, and present circumstances of the order of mendicants founded by Gotama Buddha*. London: Williams and Norgate [Online]. Available at: <https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.319510020184738&view=1up&seq=10> (Accessed: 08 November 2020).
- Harrison, P. (trans.) (1990) *The Samādhi of Direct Encounter with the Buddhas of the Present: an annotated English translation of the Tibetan version of the Pratyutpanna-Buddha-Saṃmukhāvasthita-Samādhi-Sūtra with several appendices relating to the history of the text*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies.
- Harrison, P. (1992a) 'Is the Dharma-kāya the "phantom body" of the Buddha?', *The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 15(1), pp. 44-94. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8792> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).
- Harrison, P. (1992b) 'Commemoration and identification in Buddāsnusmṛti', in Gyatso, J. (ed.) *In the mirror of memory: reflections on mindfulness and remembrance in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York, pp. 215-238.
- Harrison, P. (1995) 'Searching for the origins of the Mahāyāna: what are we looking for?', *The Eastern Buddhist* 28(1), pp. 48-69. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44362047> (Accessed: 14 October 2020).

Harrison, P. (2003) 'Mediums and messages: reflections on the production of Mahāyāna Sūtras', *The Eastern Buddhist* 35(1/2), pp. 115-151. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44362366> (Accessed: 05 November 2020).

Hartmann, J.-U. (2009) 'From words to books: Indian Buddhist manuscripts in the first millennium CE', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 95-105.

Harvey, P. (2013) *An introduction to Buddhism: teachings, history and practices* [Second edition]. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hawkeye, T. (2013) *Buddhist boot camp*. London: Harper Collins.

Hayes, R. P. (2000) *A Buddhist's reflections on religious conversion*. Montréal: McGill University. Available at: <http://www.unm.edu/~rhayes/pubs.html> (Accessed: 25 October 2020).

Hazra, K. L. (1983) *Buddhism in India as described by the Chinese pilgrims AD 399-689*. New Delhi: Munshiram Munoharlal Publishers.

Heelas, P. (1996) *The New Age movement: the celebration of the self and the sacralization of modernity*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Heelas, P. (2005) 'Postmodernism', in Hinnels, J. R. (ed.) *The Routledge companion to the study of religion*. London: Routledge, pp. 259-274.

Heine, S. (2008) *Zen skin, Zen marrow: will the real Zen Buddhism please stand up?* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Heine, S. (2016) 'On the value of speaking and not speaking: philosophy of language in Zen Buddhism', in Emmanuel, S. M. (ed.) *A companion to Buddhist philosophy*. Oxford: John Wiley & Sons. Blackwell companions to philosophy, 139, pp. 349-365.

Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (2004). 'Introduction: canon and canonicity in the history of the Zen literary tradition', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *The Zen canon: understanding the classic texts*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 3-9.

Heirman, A. (2007) 'Vinaya: from India to China', in Heirman, A. and Bumbacher, S. P. (eds.) *The spread of Buddhism*. Leiden: Brill. Handbook of Oriental Studies = Handbuck der Orientalistik. Section eight. Central Asia 16, pp. 167-202.

Heller, N. (2009) 'Between Zhongfeng Mingben and Zhao Mengfu: Chan letters in their manuscript context', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 109-123.

Heruka, T. (2010) *The life of Milarepa*. Translated by Andrew Quintman. London: Penguin Books.

Heruka, T.; Evans-Wentz, W. Y. (ed.) (2000) *Tibet's great yogī Milarepa: a biography from the Tibetan being the Jetsün-Khahbum or biographical history of the Jetsün-Milarepa, according to the late Lāma Kazi Dawa-Samdup's English rendering* [New foreword edition]. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hervieu-Léger, D. (2013) 'Individualism, the validation of faith, and the social nature of religion in modernity'. Translated by Michael Davis, in Fenn, R. K. (ed.) *The Blackwell companion to sociology of religion* [First paperback edition]. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to religion, pp. 161-175.

Hirota, D. (trans.) (1997) *No abode: the Record of Ippen* [Revised edition]. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Ryukoku-IBS studies in Buddhist thought and tradition.

Hjarvard, S. (2008) 'The mediation of religion: a theory of the media as agents of religious change', *Nordic Journal of Media Studies* 6, pp. 9-26. Available at: [https://doi.org/10.1386/nl.6.1.9\\_1](https://doi.org/10.1386/nl.6.1.9_1) (Accessed: 24 October 2020).

Hjardvard, S. (2012) 'Three forms of mediatized religion: changing the public face of religion', in Hjardvard, S. and Lövheim, M. (eds.) *Mediatization and religion: Nordic perspectives*. Götteborg: Nordicom, pp. 21-44. Available at: [https://comm.ku.dk/staff/?pure=en%2Fpublications%2Fthree-forms-of-mediatized-religion\(42cc9a14-0b99-4977-a074-85fe696e05be\).html](https://comm.ku.dk/staff/?pure=en%2Fpublications%2Fthree-forms-of-mediatized-religion(42cc9a14-0b99-4977-a074-85fe696e05be).html) (Accessed: 24 October 2020).

Holland, N. N. (1975) 'Unity identity text self', *PMLA* 90(5), pp. 813-822. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/461467> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Hoover, S. M. (2006) *Religion in the media age*. London: Routledge.

Hoover, S. M. (2011) 'Media and the imagination of religion in contemporary global culture', *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 14(6), pp. 610-625. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1367549411419980> (Accessed: 24 October 2020).

Hori, G. V. S. (2006) 'Zen kōan capping phrase books: literary study and the insight "not founded on words and letters"', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *Zen classics: formative texts in the history of Zen Buddhism*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 171-214.

Horner, I. B. (trans.) (1963-1964) *Milinda's questions*. Bristol: Pali Text Society. Sacred books of the Buddhists, 23.

Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2012a) *The book of the discipline (Vinaya-Piṭaka). Volume III (Suttavibhaṅga)*. Bristol: Pali Text Society. Sacred books of the Buddhists, 9.

Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2012b) *The book of the discipline (Vinaya-Piṭaka). Volume III (Suttavibhaṅga)*. Bristol: Pali Text Society. Sacred books of the Buddhists, 13.

Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2014a) *The book of the discipline (Vinaya-Piṭaka). Volume IV*. Bristol: Pali Text Society.

Horner, I. B. (trans.) (2014b) *The book of the discipline (Vinaya-piṭaka). Volume VI (Parivāra)*. Bristol: Pali Text Society.

Howsam, L. (2015a) 'The study of book history', in Howsam, L. (ed.) *The Cambridge companion to the history of the book*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge companions to literature, pp. 1-16.

Howsam, L. (2015b) 'Book history in the classroom', in Howsam, L. (ed.) *The Cambridge companion to the history of the book*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge companions to literature, pp. 253-267.

Huh, W. (2010) 'Individual salvation and compassionate action': the life and thoughts of Paek Yongsŏng', in Park, J. Y. (ed.) *Makers of modern Korean Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Korean studies, pp. 19-40.

Humphreis, J. (1999) *Reading emptiness: Buddhism and literature*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series, the margins of literature.

Humphreys, C. (1962) *Buddhism* [Third edition]. London: Penguin.

Hureau, S. (2010) 'Traduction et offrande rituelle de la parole du Buddha en Chine', *Cahier "Mondes anciens": Histoire et anthropologie des mondes anciens 1*, pp. 1-18. Available at: <http://journals.openedition.org/mondesanciens/97> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).

Hureau, S. (2015) 'Reading Sūtras in biographies of Chinese Buddhist monks', in Otto, B.-C., Rau, S., and Rüpke, J. (eds.) *Narrating a religious past*. Berlin: De Gruyter. History and religion, pp. 109-118.

Ichimura, S. (trans.) (2006) *The Baizhang Zen monastic regulations (Taishō volume 48, Number 2025)* [Online]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka series. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/the-baizhang-zen-monastic-regulations/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).

Igunma, J. (2013) 'The history of the book in Southeast Asia (2): the mainland', in Suarez, M. F. and Woudhuysen, H. R. (eds.) *The book: a global history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 629-634.

Igunma, J. and May, S. S. (ed.) (2019) *Buddhism: origins, traditions and contemporary life*. London: British Library.

Illouz, E. (2008) *Saving the modern soul: therapy, emotions, and the culture of self-help*. London: University of California Press.

Inagaki, H. (trans.) (2003) *Kyōgyōshinshō: on teaching, practice, faith, and enlightenment by Shinran: translated from the Japanese (Taishō Volume 83, Number 2646)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 105-I.

Ireland, J. D. (trans.) (1997) *The Udāna: inspired utterances of the Buddha & The Itivuttaka: the Buddha's sayings*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.

Iser, W. (1980) *The act of reading: a theory of aesthetic response*. London: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Iser, W. (2000) *The range of interpretation*. Chichester: Columbia University Press. The Welleck Library series at the University of California, Irvine.

Iser, W. (2002) 'Interaction between text and reader', in Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (eds.) *Book history reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 291-296.

Jackson, H. J. (2001) *Marginalia: readers writing in books*. London: Yale University Press.

Jamyang Buddhist Centre (2020) 'Day 1 of Pre-Sakadawa', *Facebook*, 23 May. Available at: <https://www.facebook.com/JBCLondon/posts/3007545679310636> (Accessed: 13 January 2021).

Jamyang Buddhist Centre (2020) 'Day 2 – Preparing for the session', *Facebook*, 24 May. Available at: <https://www.facebook.com/JBCLondon/photos/a.3005085846223286/3009954089069795/> (Accessed: 13 January 2021).

Jamyang Dorje, N. K. (2005) *A marvellous garland of rare gens: biographies of masters of awareness in the Dzogchen lineage: a spiritual history of the teachings of natural great perfection*. Translated by Richard Barron. Junction City: Padma Publishing.

- Jantrasrisali, C. (2008) *Early Buddhist Dhammakāya: its philosophical and soteriological significance*. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of Sidney.
- Jayatilleke, K. N. (1963) *Early Buddhist theory of knowledge*. London: George Allen & Unwin.
- Jinpa, T. (trans.) (2013) *Wisdom of the Kadam masters*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Tibetan classics.
- Jones, C. B. (2003) 'Transitions in the practice and defence of Chinese Pure Land Buddhism', in Heine, S. and Prebish, C. (eds.) *Buddhism in the modern world*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 125-142.
- Joskovich, E. (2019) 'Relying on words and letters', *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 46(1), pp. 53-78. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26854500> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Kapleau, R. P. (2000a) *The three pillars of Zen: teaching, practice, and enlightenment* [Revised edition]. New York: Anchor Books.
- Kapleau, R. P. (2000b) *Zen merging of East and West* [Revised edition]. New York: Anchor Books.
- Kapstein, M. T. (2000) *The Tibetan assimilation of Buddhism: conversation, contestation, and memory*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kasulis, T. P. (1985a) 'The Incomparable Philosopher: Dōgen on How to Read the *Shōbōgenzō*', in LaFleur, W. R. (ed.) *Dōgen Studies*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in East Asian Buddhism 2, pp. 83-98.
- Kasulis, T. P. (1985b) *Zen action, Zen person* [First paperback edition]. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Kasulis, T. P. (2007) 'Reading Suzuki today', *The Eastern Buddhist* 38(1/2), pp. 41-57. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26289517> (Accessed: 05 November 2020).
- Kay, D. N. (2004) *Tibetan and Zen Buddhism in Britain: transplantation, development and adaptation*. London: RoutledgeCurzon.
- Keefer, K. (2008) *The New Testament as literature: a very short introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Very Short Introductions.
- Kelsang Gyatso, G. (1997) *Essence of Vajrayana: the highest yoga Tantra practice of Heruka body mandala*. London: Tharpa Publications.
- Kelsang Gyatso, G. (2013) *Modern Buddhism: the path of compassion and wisdom* [Second edition]. Ulverston: Tharpa Publications.
- Kelsang Gyatso, G. (2016) *How to transform your life: a blissful journey* [Second digital edition] [ePub]. Ulverston: Tharpa Publications.
- Kennett, J.; MacPhallamy, D. (ed.) (2000) *Roar of the tigress: the oral teachings of Rev. Master Jiyu-Kennett: Western woman and Zen master. Volume I: an introduction to Zen: religious practice for everyday life*. Mount Shasta: Shasta Abbey Press.
- Kennett, J.; MacPhallamy, D. (ed.) (2005) *Roar of the tigress: the oral teachings of Rev. Master Jiyu-Kennett: Western woman and Zen master. Volume II: Zen for spiritual adults: lectures inspired by the Shōbōgenzō*. Mount Shasta: Shasta Abbey Press.

- Khandro, S. (2020) *Sangye Khandro on why some texts are restricted*. Available at: <https://www.shambhala.com/videos/sangye-khandro-on-why-some-texts-are-restricted/> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).
- Khema, A. (1987) *Being nobody, going nowhere: meditations on the Buddhist path*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Khyentse, D. J. (2007) *What makes you not a Buddhist*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Kieschnick, J. (2000) 'Blood writing in Chinese Buddhism', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 23(2), pp. 177-194. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/9174> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Kim, J. (2013) *Receptacle of the sacred: illustrated manuscripts and the Buddhist book cult in South Asia*. London: University of California Press. South Asia across the disciplines.
- Kim, Jo. (2010) 'Yi Nūnghwa, Buddhism, and the modernization of Korea: a critical review', in Park, J. Y. (ed.) *Makers of modern Korean Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Korean studies, pp. 91-108.
- King, S. (2007) 'Awakening stories of Zen Buddhist women', in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Buddhism in practice* [Abridged edition]. Woodstock: Princeton University Press. Princeton readings in religion, pp. 397-408.
- Kinnard, J. N. (2002) 'On Buddhist "bibliolaters": representing and worshiping the book in medieval Indian Buddhism', *The Eastern Buddhist* 34(2), pp. 94-116. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44362318> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Kirichenko, A. (2009) 'From Thathanadaw to Theravāda Buddhism: constructions of religion and religious identity in nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Myanmar', in DuBois, T. D. (ed.)  *Casting faiths: imperialism and the transformation of religion in East and Southeast Asia*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 23-45.
- Konchog Gyaltsen, K.; Emmerick, D. (ed.) (2009) *A complete guide to the Buddhist path*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.
- Konik, A. (2009) *Buddhism and transgression: the appropriation of Buddhism in the contemporary West*. Leiden: Brill. Numben book series. Studies in the history of religions 125.
- Kornfield, J. (1993) *A path with heart: a guide through the perils and promises of spiritual life*. New York: Bantam Books.
- Kornicki, P. F. (1998) *The book in Japan: a cultural history from the beginnings to the Nineteenth century*. Leiden: Brill. Handbuck der Orientalistick, Abt. 5, Japan, Bd. 7.
- Kornicki, P. F. (2009) 'Japan, Korea, and Vietnam', in Eliot, S. and Rose, J. (eds.) *A companion to the history of the book*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to literature and culture, 48, pp. 110-125.
- Kornicki, P. F. (2013) 'The history of the book in Japan', in Suarez, M. F. and Woudhuysen, H. R. (eds.) *The book: a global history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 605-621.
- Kramer, K. (1986) *World scriptures: an introduction to comparative religions*. New York: Paulist Press.

- Kristeller, K. L. (2003) 'Finding Buddha/finding the self: seeing with the third eye', in Segall, S. R. (ed.) *Encountering Buddhism: Western psychology and Buddhist teachings*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in transpersonal and humanistic psychology, pp. 109-130.
- Kroll, P. (2017) 'The cybersangha', *Lehigh Review* 25, pp. 84-88. Available at: <https://preserve.lehigh.edu/cas-lehighreview-vol-25> (Accessed: 05 November 2020).
- Krug, A. C. (2017) "'I'll see you again in twenty-five years:" Tibetan Buddhism in David Lynch's Twin Peaks and American pop culture in the 90s', in Hackett, P. G. (ed.) *The assimilation of yogic religions through pop culture*. London: Lexington Books. pp. 83-114.
- Kungsang, E. P. (trans.); Schmidt, M. B. (ed.) (1994) *Advice from the Lotus-born: a collection of Padmasambhava's advice to the dakini Yeshe Tsogyal and other close disciples from the terma revelations of Nyang Ral yima Özer, Guru Chöwang, Pema Ledrel Tsal, Sangye Lingpa, Rigdin Gödem, and Chokgyur Lingpa*. Hong Kong: Rangjung Yeshe Publications.
- Kyabgon, T. (2013) *The essence of Buddhism: an introduction to its philosophy and practice* [ePub]. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- La Vallée Poussin, L. d., Lodrö Sangpo (trans.) (2012) *Abhidharmakośa-Bhāṣya of Vasubandhu: the treasury of the Abhidharma and its (auto)commentary*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.
- Lam, R. (2010) *The spirituality of reading*. Available at: <https://www.buddhistdoor.net/features/the-spirituality-of-reading> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).
- Lamb, C. (1999) 'Conversion as a process leading to Enlightenment', in Lamb, C. and Bryant, D. (eds.) *Religious conversion: contemporary practices and controversies*. London: Cassell. Issues in contemporary religion, pp. 75-88.
- Lamotte, É. (1954) 'Sur la formation du Mahāyāna', in Schubert, J. and Schneider, U. (eds.) *Asiatica: Festschrift Friedrich Weller*. Leipzig: Otto Harrossowitz, pp. 377-396.
- Lamotte, É. (1984) 'The assessment of textual authenticity in Buddhism', *Buddhist Studies Review* 1(1), pp. 4-15. Available at: <https://ukabs.org.uk/buddhist-studies-review-vols-1-22/> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).
- Lamotte, É. (1988) *History of Indian Buddhism: from the origins to the Śaka era*. Translated by Sara Webb-Boin, Jean Dantinne. Louvain-la-Neuve: Peeters Press. Publications de l'Institut Orientaliste de Louvain, 36.
- Lamotte, É. (1992) 'The assessment of textual interpretation in Buddhism', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Buddhist hermeneutics* [Paperback edition]. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in Asian Buddhism, 6, pp. 11-27.
- Lampe, E. (2009a) 'Imperial China', in Watling, G. (ed.) *Cultural history of reading. Volume 1: world literature*. London: Greenwood Press, pp. 287-303.
- Lampe, E. (2009b) 'Modern China', in Watling, G. (ed.) *Cultural history of reading. Volume 1: world literature*. London: Greenwood Press, pp. 305-323.
- Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee (trans.); Newland, G. (ed.) (2000) *The great treatise on the stages of the path to Enlightenment by Tsong-Kha-pa. Volume One*. Ithaca. Snow Lion Publications.



- Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee (trans.); Newland, G. (ed.) (2002) *The great treatise on the stages of the path to Enlightenment by Tsong-kha-pa. Volume three*. Ithaca. Snow Lion Publications.
- Lamrim Chenmo Translation Committee (trans.); Newland, G. (ed.) (2004) *The great treatise on the stages of the path to Enlightenment by Tsong-kha-pa. Volume two*. Ithaca. Snow Lion Publications.
- Lancaster, L. (1979) 'Buddhist literature: its canons, scribes, and editors', in Doniger O'Flaherty, W. (ed.) *The critical study of sacred texts*. Berkeley: Graduate Theological Union. Berkeley Religious Studies series, pp. 215-229.
- Lang, K. C. (2016) 'Indian Buddhist narratives about the Buddha, his community, and his teachings', in Powers, J. (ed.) *The Buddhist world*. London: Routledge, pp. 60-75.
- Lau, W. W. (1981) 'The prodocetic "finite Buddhakāya" in the "Lotus Sutra": in search of the illusive Dharmakāya therein', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 49(3), pp. 447-469. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1462383> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).
- Law, B. C. (trans.) (1941) *A manual of Buddhist historical traditions (SadDhamma-saṅgaha)* Calcutta: University of Calcutta.
- Le, P. H. (trans.) (1969) *Lives of eminent Korean monks: the Haedong Kosŭng Chŏn*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. Harvard-Yenching Institute studies, 25.
- Levering, M. (1989a) 'Introduction: rethinking scripture', in Levering, M. (ed.) *Rethinking scripture: essays from a comparative perspective*. Albany: State University of New York Press, pp. 1-17.
- Levering, M. (1989b) 'Scripture and its receptions: a Buddhist case', in Levering, M. (ed.) *Rethinking scripture: essays from a comparative perspective*. Albany: State University of New York Press, pp. 58-101.
- LeVine, S. (2010) 'Learning, living, spreading the dharma: a postmodern journey from Uku Baha, Lalitpur, to His Lai monastery, Hacienda Heights, California: how Ganesh Kumari Shakya became Bhikhunī Dhammawati', in Covill, L., Roesler, U. and Shaw, S. (eds.) *Lives lived, lives imagined: biography in the Buddhist traditions*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, pp. 161-177.
- Lewis, T. T. (1996) 'Sukhavati tradition in Newar Buddhism', *South Asia Research* 16(1), pp. 1-30. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/026272809601600101> (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Lewis, T. T. (2000) *Popular Buddhist texts from Nepal: narratives and rituals of Newar Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Buddhist studies.
- Lingpa, J. (2016) *Steps to the Great Perfection: the mind-training tradition of the Dzogchen masters*. Translated by Cortland Dahl. Boulder: Snow Lion Publications.
- Littau, K. (2006) *Theories of reading: books, bodies and bibliomania*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Littlefair, S. (2018) *How to read and study Buddhist teachings*. Available at: <https://www.lionsroar.com/how-to-read-and-study-buddhist-teachings/> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).
- Lodrö, G. G. (1998) *Calm abiding & special insight: achieving spiritual transformation through meditation*. Translated by Jeffrey Hopkins. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications. Textual studies and translations in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism.

- Lofland, J. and Skonovd, N. (1981) 'Conversion motifs', *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 20(4), pp. 373-385. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1386185> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).
- Long, E. (1993) 'Textual interpretation as collective action', in Boyarin, J. (ed.) *The ethnography of reading*. Oxford: University of California Press, pp. 180-211.
- Longchenpa (2017) *The trilogy of rest. Volume 1: finding rest in the nature of mind*. Translated by Padmakara Translation Group. Boulder: Shambhala Publications.
- Longchenpa (2018) *The trilogy of rest. Volume 3: find rest in illusion*. Translated by Padmakara Translation Group. Boulder: Shambhala Publications.
- Lopez, D. S. Jr. (1992a) 'Introduction', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Buddhist hermeneutics* [Paperback edition]. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in Asian Buddhism, 6, pp. 1-10.
- Lopez, D. S. Jr. (1992b) 'On the interpretation of the Mahāyāna Sūtras', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Buddhist hermeneutics* [Paperback edition]. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in Asian Buddhism, 6, pp. 47-70.
- Lopez, D. S., Jr. (1995a) 'Introduction', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Curators of the Buddha: the study of Buddhism under colonialism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 1-30.
- Lopez, D. S., Jr. (1995b) 'Foreigners at the lama's feet', in Lopez, D. S., Jr. (ed.) *Curators of the Buddha: the study of Buddhism under colonialism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 251-296.
- Lopez, D. S., Jr. (1995c) 'Authority and orality in the Mahāyāna', *Numen* 42, pp. 21-47. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3270278> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).
- Lopez, D. S. Jr. (1996) *Elaborations on emptiness: uses of the Heart Sūtra*. Chichester: Princeton University Press.
- Lopez, D. S., Jr. (1998) *Prisoners of Shangri-La: Tibetan Buddhism and the West*. London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Lopez, D. S., Jr. (2004) *Buddhist scriptures*. London: Penguin Books.
- Loveday, H. (2000) 'La bibliothèque tournante en Chine: quelques remarques sur son rôle et son évolution', *T'oung Pao* 86(4/5), pp. 225-279. Available at: [https://www.jstor.org/stable/4528849?seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/4528849?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents) (Accessed: 24 October 2020).
- Lowenthal, K. M. (2000) *The psychology of religion: an introduction*. Oxford: Oneworld Publications.
- Lynch, G. (2007) *The new spirituality: an introduction to progressive belief in the Twenty-first century*. London: Tauris.
- Maezumi, H. T.; Nakao, W. E. and Marko, E. M. (eds.) (2002) *Appreciate your life: the essence of Zen practice*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Maezumi, H. T. and Glassman, B.; Nakao, W. E. and Buksbazen, J. D. (eds.) (2002) *On Zen practice: body, breath, mind* [First Wisdom edition]. Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Maezumi, H. T. and Glassman, B.; Nakao, W. E. and Buksbazen, J. D. (eds.) (2007) *The hazy moon of enlightenment* [First wisdom edition]. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.

- Malalasekera, G. P. (2013) *The Pali literature of Ceylon* [BPS edition]. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Malalgoda, K. (1976) *Buddhism in Sinhalese society, 1750-1900: a study on religious revival and change*. London: University of California Press.
- Manguel, A. (1996) *A history of reading*. London: Viking.
- Manguel, A. (2008) *The city of words*. London: Continuum.
- Manguel, A. (2010) *A reader on reading*. London: Yale University Press.
- Manguel, A. (2015) *Curiosity*. London: Yale University Press.
- Marguerat, D., and Bourquin, Y. (1999) *How to read Bible stories: an introduction to narrative criticism*. Translated by John Bowden. London: SCM Press.
- Martin, D. (2007) 'Devotional, covenantal and yogic: three episodes in the religious use of alphabet and letters from a millennium of great vehicle Buddhism', in La Porta, S. and Shulman, D. (eds.) *The poetics of grammar and the metaphysics of sound and sign*. London: Brill. Jerusalem studies in religion and culture 6, pp. 201-229.
- Masefield, P. (1986) *Divine revelation in Pali Buddhism*. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Mathé, T. (2010) 'Le développement du bouddhisme en context italien: aspects de la modernisation et du pluralisme religieux en Italie', *Social Compass* 57(4), pp. 521-536. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0037768610383373> (Accessed: 30 October 2020).
- Matthews, B. (2002) 'Buddhism in Canada', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 120-138.
- May, S. S. and Igunma, J. (2018) *Buddhism illuminated: manuscript art from Southeast Asia*. London: British Library.
- McClintock, S. (2017) 'Ethical reading and the ethics of forgetting and remembering', in David, J. H. (ed.) *A mirror is for reflection: understanding Buddhist ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press, p. 185-202.
- McDaniel, J. (2005) 'The art of reading and teaching Dhammapadas: reform, texts, contexts in Thai Buddhist history', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 25(2), pp. 299-337. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8965> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).
- McDaniel, J. (2008) *Gathering leaves & lifting words: histories of Buddhist monastic education in Laos and Thailand*. London: University of Washington Press. Critical dialogues in Southeast Asian studies.
- McDaniel, J. (2009) 'Two Buddhist librarians: the proximate mechanism of Northern Thai Buddhist history', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 124-139.
- McDermott, J. P. (1984) 'Scripture as the word of the Buddha' *Numen* 31(1), pp. 22-39. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3269888> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).

- McHale, S. F. (2004) *Print and power: Confucianism, Communism, and Buddhism in the making of modern Vietnam* [Paperback edition]. Honolulu: University Hawaii Press. Southeast Asia: politics, meaning, and memory.
- McKenzie, D. F. (2004) *Bibliography and the sociology of texts*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- McKenzie, S. L. (2009) *How to read the Bible: history, prophecy, literature—Why modern readers need to know the difference, and what it means for faith today*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- McMahan, D. (1998) 'Orality, writing, and authority in South Asian Buddhism: visionary literature and the struggle for legitimacy in the Mahāyāna', *History of Religions* 37(3), pp. 249-274. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3176607> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).
- McMahan, D. (2002) 'Repacking Zen for the West', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 218-229.
- McMahan, D. L. (2008) *The making of Buddhist modernism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- McQueen, G. (2005) 'Inspired speech in early Mahāyāna Buddhism', in Williams, Paul (ed.) *Buddhism: critical concepts in religious studies. Volume III: the origin and nature of Mahāyāna Buddhism; some Mahāyāna religious topic*. London: Routledge, pp. 74-83.
- McRae, J. R. (trans.) (2000) *The Platform Sūtra of the Sixth Patriarch: translated from the Chinese of Zongbao (Taishō Volume 48, Number 2008)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- McRae, J. R. (trans.) (2004) *The Vimalakīrti Sūtra (Taishō Volume 14, Number 475)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Mears, D. P. and Ellison, C. G. (2000) 'Who buys New Age materials? Exploring sociodemographic, religious, network, and contextual correlates of New Age consumption', *Sociology of Religion* 61(30), pp. 289-313. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3712580> (Accessed: 28 October 2020).
- Merzel, D. G.; Proskauer, S. M. (ed.) (1991) *The eye never sleeps: striking to the heart of Zen*. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- Merzel, D. G.; Wright, W. S. (ed.) (2003) *The path of the human being: Zen teachings of the Bodhisattva way*. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- Mitchell, Scott, A. (2012) 'Buddhism, media and popular culture' in McMahan, D. L. (ed.) *Buddhism in the modern world*. London: Routledge, pp. 305-323.
- Miyata, T. (trans.) (2015) 'The Sūtra of the View of Fulfilling the Great Perpetual Enjoyment and Benefiting All Sentient Beings Without Exception (Taishō Volume 8, Number 243)', in Mayeda, S. (ed.) *Esoteric texts*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Mizuno, K. (1982) *Buddhist sutras: origin, development, transmission*. Tokyo: Kōsei Publishing Co.
- Mohr, M. (2000) 'Emerging from nonduality: Kōan practice in the Rinzai tradition since Hakuin', in Heine, S., and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *The kōan: texts and contexts in Zen Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 244-279.
- Mohr, M. (2006) 'Imagining Indian Zen: Tōrei's commentary on the Ta-mo-to-lo ch'an ching and the rediscovery of early meditation techniques during the Tokugawa era', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S.

(eds.) *Zen classics: formative texts in the history of Zen Buddhism*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 215-246.

Montgomery, M., Durant, A., Furniss, T. and Mills, S. (2013) *Ways of reading: advanced reading skills for students of English literature* [Fourth edition]. London: Routledge

Moore, S. D. (1989) *Literary criticism and the gospels: the theoretical challenge*. London: Yale University Press.

Muller, A. C. and Tanaka, K. K. (trans.) (2017) *The Brahmā's Net Sūtra (Taishō Volume 24, Number 1484)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.

Mullin, G. H. (trans.) (1999) *Gems of wisdom from the seventh Dalai Lama*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.

Mullin, G. H. (trans.) (2005) *The second Dalai Lama: his life and teachings*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.

Mumon, Y. (2004) *Lectures on the Ten Oxherding Pictures*. Translated by Victor Sōgen Hori. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.

Murano, S. (trans.) (2000) *Kaimokushō or liberation from blindness by Nichiren: translated from the Japanese (Taishō Volume 84, Number 2689)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 104-IV.

Myokyo-ni (1990) *Gentling the bull: the ten bull pictures: a spiritual journey* [New edition]. London: Zen Centre.

Nandadeva, B. D. (2009) 'Flowers for the Dhamma: painted Buddhist palm leaf manuscripts covers (Kamba) in Sri Lanka', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 159-171.

Nasu, E. (2006) "'Rely on the meaning, not on the words": Shinran's methodology and strategy for reading scriptures and writing the *Kyōgyōshinshō*', in Payne, R. K. and Leighton, T. D. (eds.) *Discourse and ideology in medieval Japanese Buddhism*. London: Routledge, pp. 240-258.

Nathan, M. A. (2017) 'Contemporary Korean Buddhist traditions', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 100-121.

Nattier, J. (1991) *Once upon a future time: studies in a Buddhist prophecy of decline*. Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press. Nanzan studies in Asian religions, 1.

Nattier, J. (1997) 'Buddhism comes to main street', *The Wilson Quarterly* 21(2), pp. 72-80. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40259451> (Accessed: 30 October 2020).

Nattier, J. (1998) 'Who is Buddhist? Charting the landscape of Buddhist America', in Prebish, C. S. and Tanaka, K. T. (eds.) *The faces of Buddhism in America*. London: University of California Press, pp. 183-195.

Nhất Hạnh, T. (1987) *The miracle of mindfulness: an introduction to the practice of meditation* [New edition]. Translated by Mobi Ho. Boston: Beacon Press.

Nhất Hạnh, T. (1999) *The heart of the Buddha's teachings: transforming suffering into peace, joy and liberation*. ePub format [ebook reader]. London: Rider.

Nhất Hạnh, T. (2004) *Freedom wherever we go: a Buddhist monastic code for the 21st century*. Berkeley: Parallax Press.

Nishijima, G. W. (trans.); Luetchford, M. and Pearson, J. (eds.) (2003) *Master Dōgen's Shinji Shōbōgenzō*. London: Windbell Publications.

Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1994) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 1*. London: Windbell Publications.

Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1996) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 2*. London: Windbell Publications.

Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1997) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 3*. London: Windbell Publications.

Nishijima, G. W. and Cross, C. (trans.) (1999) *Master Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō. Book 4*. London: Windbell Publications.

Nitta, T. (2002) 'The meaning of "Dharmakāya" in Pāli Buddhism', *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 51(1), pp. 45-47. Available at: [https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/ibk1952/51/1/51\\_1\\_480/article/-char/ja/](https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/ibk1952/51/1/51_1_480/article/-char/ja/) (Accessed: 15 October 2020).

Norman, K. R. (1997) *A philological approach to Buddhism: the Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai lectures 1994*. London: School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London. The Buddhist Forum, 5.

Ñāṇamoli, B. (trans.) (1997) *The Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga) by Bhaddantācariya Buddhaghosa*. Singapore: Singapore Buddhist Meditation Centre.

Ñāṇamoli, B. (trans.) (2014) *The Path of Discrimination (Paṭisambhidāmagga)* [Second edition]. Oxford: Pali Text Society. Pali Text Society translation series, 43.

Ñāṇamoli, B. and Bodhi, B. (eds., trans.) (2001) *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Majjhima Nikāya* [Revised]. Oxford: Pali Text Society. Teachings of the Buddha; Pali Text Society Translation series, 49.

Ñāṇavīra, T. (1988) *Clearing the path: writings of Ñāṇavīra Thera (1960-1965)*. Vollezele: Path Press.

Obadia, L. (2013) 'Evam maya srutam? Evam maya pathati! Réception et réinterprétation des textes sacrés du bouddhisme dans le contexte occidental', in Zwilling, A.-L. (ed.) *Lire et interpreter: les religions et leur rapports aux textes fondateurs*. Genève: Labor et Fides. Religions et modernités, pp. 165-184.

Odiseos, N. (2020) *The state of Buddhist publishing*. Available at: <https://www.shambhala.com/buddhist-publishing/> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).

Ogyen Trinley Dorje; Derris, K. and Finnegan, D. D. (eds.) (2017) *Interconnected: embracing life in our global society*. Translated by Damchö Diana Finnegan. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.

Ohnuma, R. (1998) 'The gift of the body and the gift of dharma', *History of Religions* 37(4), pp. 323-359. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3176401>. (Accessed: 15 October 2020).

Olcott, H. S. (1908) *The Buddhist catechism* [42nd edition]. Colombo: Publications Division. Ministry of Cultural Affairs.

- Oldenberg, H. (trans.) (1879) *The Dīpavaṃsa: an ancient Buddhist historical record*. London: Williams and Norgate.
- Olson, C. (2013) 'The sacred book', in Suarez, M. F. and Woudhuysen, H. R. (eds.) *The book: a global history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 19-38.
- Ōmori, S. (2001) *An introduction to Zen training: a translation of Sanzen Nyumon*. Translated by Dōgen Hosokawa and Roy Yoshimoto. Tokyo: Tuttle Publishing.
- Ong, W. (2002) 'Orality and literacy: writing restructures consciousness', in Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (eds.) *Book history reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 105-117.
- Ong, W. (2012) *Orality and literacy: the technologizing of the world* [Third edition]. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Pacey, S. (2016) 'Sinitic Buddhism in China, Korea, and Japan', in Powers, J. (ed.) *The Buddhist world*. London: Routledge, pp. 88-103.
- Padmakara Translation Group (trans.) (1994) *Kunzang Lama-I Shelung: the words of my perfect teacher [by] Patrul Rinpoche*. London: HarperCollins Publishers. Sacred literature series.
- Paine, J. (2004) *Re-enchantment: Tibetan Buddhism comes to the West*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Pal, P. and Meech-Pekarik, J. (1988) *Buddhist book illuminations*. New Delhi: Ravi Kumar Publishers.
- Paloutzian, R. F. (1996) *Invitation to the psychology of religion*. Second edition. London: Allyn and Bacon.
- Pao-ch'ang, S. (comp.) (1994) *Lives of the nuns: biographies of Chinese Buddhist nuns from the fourth to sixth centuries*. Translated by Kathryn Ann Tsai. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Park, J. Y. (2010) 'Gendered response to modernity: Kim Iryōp and Buddhism', in Park, J. Y. (ed.) *Makers of modern Korean Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Korean studies, pp. 109-127.
- Parker, G. (2007) *The conversion of South Africans to Buddhism*. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of South Africa. Available at: <http://uir.unisa.ac.za/handle/10500/1630?show=full> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).
- Patrul, R. (2016) *The nature of mind: the Dzogchen instructions of Aro Yeshe Jungne* [ePub]. Boulder: Snow Lion.
- Paul, D. Y. (trans.) (2004) *The Sūtra of Queen Śrīmālā of the Lion's Roar (Taishō Volume 12, Number 353)*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.
- Pearcy, A. (trans.) (2007). *Sūtra of Boundless Life and Wisdom* [Updated edition] [Online]. [S.I.]: Lotsawa House. Available at: <https://www.lotsawahouse.org/words-of-the-buddha/sutra-boundless-life> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).
- Pittman, D. A. (2001) *Towards a modern Chinese Buddhism: Taixu's reforms*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Poceski, M. (2017) 'Contemporary Chinese Buddhist traditions', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 79-99.

Pollick, M. (2021) *What is a nightstand Buddhist?* Available at: <https://www.wise-geek.com/what-is-a-nightstand-buddhist.htm> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).

Popp-Baler, U. (2010) 'From religion to spirituality: megatrend in contemporary society or methodological artifact? A contribution to the secularization debate from psychology of religion', *Journal of Religion in Europe* 3, pp. 34-67. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1163/187489209X478337> (Accessed: 28 October 2020).

Powell, A. (1989) *Living Buddhism*. London: British Museum Press.

Powers, J. (2016) 'Buddhas and Buddhisms', in Powers, J. (ed.) *The Buddhist world*. London: Routledge, pp. 11-59.

Pruden, L. M. (trans.) (1995) *The essentials of the Vinaya tradition by Gyōnen: translated from the Japanese (Taishō, Volume 74, Number 2348)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 97-I.

Purves, A. C. (1998) *The web of text and the web of god: an essay on the third information transformation*. London: The Guildford Press.

Rahula, W. (1966) *History of Buddhism in Ceylon: the Anurādhapura period 3rd century BC – 10th century AC* [Second edition]. Colombo: M. D. Gunasena & Co.

Rahula, W. (1978) *What the Buddha taught* [Revised edition]. London: Gordon Fraser.

Rāhulabhandra (2007) 'In praise of Prajñāpāramitā; with a commentary by Rongdön Shéja Künrig', in Brunnhölzl, L. (trans.) *Straight form the heart: Buddhist pith instructions*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 1-7.

Rambelli, F. (2006) 'Texts, talismans, and jewels: the Reikiki and the performativity of sacred texts in medieval Japan', in Payne, R. K. and Leighton, T. D. (eds.) *Discourse and ideology in medieval Japanese Buddhism*. London: Routledge, pp. 52-69.

Rambo, L. R. (1993) *Understanding religious conversion*. London: Yale University Press.

Raven, J. (2015) 'The industrial revolution of the book', in Howsam, L. (ed.) *The Cambridge companion to the history of the book*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge companions to literature, pp. 143-161.

Ray, R. A. (1993) 'Buddhism: sacred text written and realized', in Denny, F. M. and Taylor, R. L. (ed.) *The holy book in comparative perspective* [Paperback edition]. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, pp. 148-180.

Ray, R. A. (1994) *Buddhist saints in India: a study in Buddhist values and orientations*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Ray, R. A. (2002) *Secret of the Vajra world: the Tantric Buddhism of Tibet*. London: Shambhala Publications. The world of Tibetan Buddhism, 2.

*Reading Faithfully: building a relationship with the Buddhist scriptures of the Sutta Pitaka* (2018) Available at: <https://readingfaithfully.org/about/> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).

Reeves, G. (trans.) (2008) *The Lotus Sūtra: a contemporary translation of a Buddhist classic*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.



- Regan, S. (1998) 'Reader-response criticism and reception theory', in Eliot, S. and Owens, W. R. (eds.) *A handbook to literary research*. London: Routledge, pp. 139-149.
- Reynolds, F. E. (1977) 'The several bodies of Buddha: reflections on a neglected aspect of Theravāda tradition' *History of Religions* 16(4), pp. 374-389. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1062637> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).
- Rheingans, J. (2010) 'Narratives of reincarnation, politics of power, and the emergence of a scholar: the very early years of Mikyö Dorje', in Covill, L., Roesler, U. and Shaw, S. (eds.) *Lives lived, lives imagined: biography in the Buddhist traditions*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, pp. 241-297.
- Ricard, M. et al. (trans.) (2001) *The life of Shabkar: the autobiography of a Tibetan yogi: the king of wish-granting jewels that fulfils the hopes of all fortunate disciples who seek liberation: the detailed narration of the life and liberation of the great vajra-holder Shabkar Tsogdruk Rangdrol, refuge and protector for all sentient being of this dark age*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications.
- Ricoeur, P. (1990) *Time and narrative. Volume 3*. Translated by Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer [Paperback edition]. London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Riggs, D. E. (2006) 'Meditation for laymen and laywomen: the Buddha Samādhi (Jijuyū Zanmai) of Menzan Zuihō', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *Zen classics: formative texts in the history of Zen Buddhism*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 247-274.
- Riggs, D. E. (2008) 'Meditation in motion: textual exegesis in the creation of ritual', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *Zen ritual: studies in Zen Buddhist theory in practice*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 223-259.
- Rigyal, S. and Prude, A. (2017) 'Buddhism in contemporary Bhutan', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 61-76.
- Roberts, P. A. (2010) 'The evolution of the biographies of Milarepa and Rechungpa', in Covill, L., Roesler, U. and Shaw, S. (eds.) *Lives lived, lives imagined: biography in the Buddhist traditions*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, pp. 181-203.
- Roberts, P. A. (trans.) (2018) *The King of Samādhis Sūtra: SamādhirājaSūtra* [Online]. Fremont: 84000: Translating the Words of the Buddha. Available at: <https://read.84000.co/translation/toh127.html> (Accessed: 10 November 2020).
- Robinson, J. B. (trans.) (1979) *The Buddha's lions: the lives of the eighty-four siddhas: Caturaśīti-siddha-pravṛtti by Abhayadatta, translated into Tibetan as Grub thob brgyad cu rtsa bzhi'i lo rgyus by sMon-grub Shes-rab*. Berkeley: Dharma Publishing. Tibetan translation series, 10.
- Rocha, C. (2012) 'Buddhism and globalization' in McMahan, D. L. (ed.) *Buddhism in the modern world*. London: Routledge, pp. 289-303.
- Rocha, C. (2017) 'Buddhism in Latin America', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 299-315.
- Roebuck, V. J. (ed., trans.) (2010) *The Dhammapada*. London: Penguin Books. Penguin Classics.
- Roerich, G. N. (trans.) (2016) *The Blue Annals* [Third revised edition] Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Roesler, U. (2010) 'Introduction', in Covill, L., Roesler, U. and Shaw, S. (eds.) *Lives lived, lives imagined: biography in the Buddhist traditions*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, pp. 1-11.

Ronald, E. K. (2012) 'More than "Alone with the Bible": reconceptualizing religious reading', *Sociology of Religion* 73(3), pp. 323-344. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41679709> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).

Rongxi, L. (trans.) (1993) *The biographical scripture of King Aśoka: translated from the Chinese of Saṃghapāla (Taishō, Volume 50, Number 2043)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 76-II.

Rongxi, L. (trans.) (1995) *A biography of the Tripiṭaka master of the great Ci'en monastery of the great Tang dynasty: translated for the Chinese of Śramaṇa Huili and Shi Yangcong (Taishō, Volume 50, Number 2053)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 77.

Rongxi, L. (trans.) (1996) *The Great Tang Dynasty Record of the Western Regions (Taishō Volume 51, Number 2087) [by Xuanzang]*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka.

Rongxi, L. (trans.) (2014a) 'The life of Nāgārjuna Bodhisattva: translated from the Chinese of Kumārajīva (Taishō Volume 50, Number 2047)', in Bukkyō Dendō Kyūkai (ed.) *Lives of great monks and nuns* [dBET pdf version]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, pp. 15-27. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/lives-of-great-monks-and-nuns/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).

Ronxi, L. (trans.) (2014b) 'Biographies of Buddhist nuns by Shi Baochang of the Great Zhuang-yan monastery', in Bukkyō Dendō Kyūkai (ed.) *Lives of great monks and nuns* [dBET pdf version]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, pp. 67-154. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/lives-of-great-monks-and-nuns/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).

Ronxi, L. (trans.) (2014c) 'The journey of the eminent monk Faxian: translated from the Chinese of Faxian (Taishō Volume 51, Number 2085)', in Bukkyō Dendō Kyūkai (ed.) *Lives of great monks and nuns* [dBET pdf version]. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, pp. 67-154. Available at: <https://bdkamerica.org/product/lives-of-great-monks-and-nuns/> (Accessed: 09 November 2020).

Rose, J. (2002) 'Rereading the English common reader: a preface to a history of audiences', in Finkelstein, D. and McCleery, A. (eds.) *Book history reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 324-339.

Rosenblatt, L. M. (1969) 'Towards a transactional theory of reading', *Journal of reading behaviour* 1(1), pp. 31-49. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1080/10862969609546838> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Rotman, A. (trans.) (2008) *Divine stories: Divyavādāna. Part 1*. Boston: Wisdom Publication. Classics of Indian Buddhism.

Rotman, A. (trans.) (2017) *Divine stories: Divyavādāna. Part 2*. Boston: Wisdom Publication. Classics of Indian Buddhism.

Ruiz-Falqués, A. (2014b) 'Pali literature: from orality to written text', in Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (eds.) *Buddha's word: the life of books in Tibet and beyond*. Cambridge: Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge, pp. 27-33.

Ruthven, S. and Medbh-Mara, A. (2001) *Exploring spirituality: a step-by-step guide to finding and following your own spiritual path*. Oxford: How to Books.

Sadayaw, M. (2016) *Manual of insight*. Translated by the Vipassanā Mettā Foundation Committee. Somerville: Wisdom Publications.

Sakyong Miphan, R. (2003) *Turning the mind into an ally*. New York: The Berkley Publishing Group.

Salomon, R. (2006) 'Recent discoveries of early Buddhist manuscripts and their implications for the history of Buddhist texts and canons', in Olivelle, P. (ed.) *Between the empires: society in India 300 BCE to 400 CE*. *Oxford Scholarship Online* [Online]. Available at: DOI: [10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195305326.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195305326.001.0001) (Accessed: 21 October 2020).

Salomon, R. (2009) 'Why did the Gandhāran Buddhists bury their manuscripts', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 19-34.

Salomon, R. (2018) *The Buddhist literature of Ancient Gandhāra: an introduction with selected translations*. Classics of Indian Buddhism. ePub format [e-book reader] (Accessed: 19 October 2020).

Salomon, R., Allchin, R., and Barnard, M. (1999) *Ancient Buddhist scrolls from Gandhāra: the British Library Kharoṣṭhī fragments*. London: The British Library.

Samuels, J. (2004) 'Towards and action-oriented pedagogy: Buddhist texts and monastic education in contemporary Sri Lanka', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 72(4), pp. 955-971. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40005935> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Samuels, J. (2005) 'Texts memorized, texts performed: a reconsideration of the role of *paritta* in Sri Lankan monastic education', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 28(2), pp. 339-367. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8966> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).

Sangbo, P. J. (2007) 'Supplications to the Tagbo Kagyü; with a commentary by Thrangu Rinpoché', in Brunnhölzl, L. (trans.) *Straight from the heart: Buddhist pith instructions*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 301-319.

Sangharakshita (1980) *A survey of Buddhism* [Fifth edition]. London: Windhorse Publications.

Sangharakshita (1988) *The history of my going for refuge: reflections on the occasion of the twentieth anniversary of the Western Buddhist Order* [Online]. Cambridge: Windhorse Publications. Available at: <https://www.sangharakshita.org/books/> (Accessed: 08 November 2020).

Sangharakshita (1993) *Forty-three years ago* [Online]. Cambridge: Windhorse Publications. Available at: [https://www.sangharakshita.org/online\\_books.html](https://www.sangharakshita.org/online_books.html) (Accessed: 08 November 2020).

Sangharakshita (1996) *Buddhism for today and tomorrow* [Online]. Cambridge: Windhorse Publications. Available at: [https://www.sangharakshita.org/online\\_books.html](https://www.sangharakshita.org/online_books.html) (Accessed: 30 October 2020).

Sawyer, D. F. (2008) 'Introduction', in Llewellyn, D. and Sawyer, D. F. (eds.) *Reading spiritualities: constructing and representing the sacred*. Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 67-69.

Sawyer, D. F. and Llewellyn, D. (2008) 'Introduction', in Llewellyn, D. and Sawyer, D. F. (eds.) *Reading spiritualities: constructing and representing the sacred*. Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 1-7.

Schaeffer, K. S. (2014) *The culture of the book in Tibet* [Paperback edition]. New York: Columbia University Press.

- Schlütter, M. (2017) 'The transformations of the formless precepts in the Platform Sūtra (Liuzu tanjing)', in Andrews, S., Chen, J. and Liu, Cuilan (eds.) *Rules of engagement: medieval traditions of Buddhist monastic regulation*. Hamburg: Projekt Verlag. Hamburg Buddhist studies 9, pp. 412-449.
- Schober, J. (1997) 'Trajectories in Buddhist sacred biography', in Schober, J. (ed.) *Sacred biography in the Buddhist traditions of South and Southeast Asia*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, pp. 1-15.
- Schopen, G. (1975) 'The phrase 'sa pṛthivīpradeśaś caityabhūto bhavet' in the "Vajracchedikā": notes on the cult of the book in the Mahāyāna', *Indo-Iranian Journal* 17(3/4), pp. 147-181. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24652889> (Accessed: 20 October 2020).
- Schopen, G. (1978) 'The five leaves of the Buddhabalādājānaprāti-Hāryavikurvāṇanirdeśa-Sūtra found at Gilgit', *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 5(4), pp. 319-336. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23440749> (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Schopen, G. (1991) 'Archaeology and Protestant presupposition in the study of Indian Buddhism', *History of Religions* 31(1), pp. 1-23. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1062872> (Accessed: 21 October 2020).
- Schopen, G. (1997) 'If you can't remember, how to make it up: some monastic rules for redacting canonical texts', in Kieffer-Pülz, P. and Hartmann, J.-U. (eds.) *Bauddhavidyāsudhākaraḥ: studies in honour of Heinz Bechert on the occasion of his 65<sup>th</sup> birthday*. Swisttal-Odendorf: Indica et Tibetica Verlag. Indica et Tibetica, 30, pp. 571-582.
- Schopen, G. (2004) *Buddhist monks and business matters: still more papers on monastic Buddhism in India*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in the Buddhist traditions.
- Schopen, G. (2005) *Figments and fragments of Mahāyāna Buddhism in India: more collected papers*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in the Buddhist traditions.
- Schopen, G. (2008) 'The book as a sacred object in private homes in Early or Medieval India', in Robertson, E. and Jahner, J. (eds.) *Medieval and early Modern devotional objects in global perspective*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan. The new Middle Ages, pp. 37-60.
- Schopen, G. (2014) *Buddhist nuns, monks, and other worldly matters: recent papers on monastic Buddhism in India*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Studies in Buddhist traditions.
- Scott, G. A. (2013) *Conversion by the book: Buddhist print culture in early republican China* [Online]. Unpublished PhD thesis. Columbia University. Available at: <https://academiccommons.columbia.edu/doi/10.7916/D8X06F93> (Accessed: 08 November 2020).
- Scott, G. A. (2017) 'The 1913 Pinjia Canon and the changing role of the Buddhist canon in Modern China', in Wu, J. and Wilkinson, G. (eds.) *Reinventing the Tripitaka: transformation of the Buddhist canon in modern East Asia* [eBook]. London: Lexington Books, Chapter 4. Available at: <https://www.amazon.co.uk/Reinventing-Tripitaka-Transformation-Buddhist-Modern> (Accessed: 7 August 2020).
- Scott, R. M. (2017) 'Contemporary Thai Buddhism', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 196-211.
- Seager, R. H. (1999) *Buddhism in America*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Seager, R. H. (2002) 'American Buddhism in the making', in Prebish C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 106-119.

Sedgwick, E. K. (2005) 'Pedagogy', in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Critical terms for the study of Buddhism*. London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 162-187.

Seeger, M. (2014) 'Orality, memory, and spiritual practice: outstanding female Thai Buddhists in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century', *Journal of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies* 7, pp. 153-190. Available at: <http://jocbs.org/index.php/jocbs/article/view/91> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Seizan, Y. and Sasaki, R. F. (1972) 'The life of Lin-chi I-hsüan', *The Eastern Buddhist* 5(2), pp. 70-94. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44361335> (Accessed: 08 November 2020).

Sekida, K.; Grimstone, A. V. (ed.) (1985) *Zen training: methods and philosophy*. London: Shambhala Publications. Shambhala classics.

Sekida, K. (trans.); Grimstone, A. V. (ed.) (2005) *Two Zen classics: The Gateless Gate and the Blue Cliff Records*. London: Shambhala Publications.

Shabkar Tsogdruk Rangdrol (2018) *The emanated scripture of Manjushri: Shabkar's essential meditation instructions*. Translated by Sean Price. Boulder: Snow Lion. The Tsadra Foundation series.

Sharf, R. H. (1995) 'Buddhist modernism and the rhetoric of meditative experience', *Numen* 42, pp. 228-283. Available at: [https://brill.com/view/journals/nu/42/3/article-p228\\_2.xml](https://brill.com/view/journals/nu/42/3/article-p228_2.xml) (Accessed: 08 November 2020).

Sharf, R. H. (2004) 'On the allure of Buddhist relics', in Germano, D. and Trainor, K. (eds.) *Embodying the Dharma: Buddhist relic veneration in Asia*. Albany: State University of New York Press, pp. 163-191.

Shaw, G. (2009) 'South Asia', in Eliot, S. and Rose, J. (eds.) *A companion to the history of the book*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to literature and culture, 48, pp. 126-137.

Shaw, S. (trans.) (2006) *The Jātakas: birth stories of the bodhisattva*. London: Penguin Books. Penguin classics.

Shaw, S. (2009) *Introduction to Buddhist meditation*. London: Routledge.

Shaw, S. (2010) 'And that was I: how the Buddha himself creates a path between biography and autobiography', in Covill, L., Roesler, U. and Shaw, S. (eds.) *Lives lived, lives imagined: biography in the Buddhist traditions*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, pp. 15-47.

Shaw, S. (2014) *The spirit of Buddhist meditation*. London: Yale University Press.

Shaw, S. (2015) 'In what way is there a Saṅghavacana? Finding the narrator, author and editor in Pāli Texts', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 36/37, pp. 423-458.

Shih, H.-c. (trans.) (1994) *The Sūtra on upāsaka precepts: translated from the Chinese of Dharmarakṣa (Taishō, Volume 24, Number 1488)*. Berkely: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 45-II.

Shūdō, I. (2004) 'The "Wu-men kuan" (J. "Mumonkan"): the formation, propagation, and characteristics of a classic Zen kōan text'. Translated by Albert Welter, in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *The Zen canon: understanding the classic texts*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 207-244.

Siddiqui, M. (2014) *How to read the Qur'an*. London: Granta. How to Read.

Sivasundaram, S. (2014) 'Palm-leaf manuscripts in Sri Lanka', in Elliot, M, Diemberger, H. and Clemente, M. (eds.) *Buddha's word: the life of books in Tibet and beyond*. Cambridge: Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge, pp. 34-35.

Skilling, P (1992) 'The Rakṣa literature of the Śrāvakayāna', *The Journal of the Pali Text Society* 16, pp. 109-182. Available at: [http://www.palitext.com/palitext/JPTS\\_PDF.htm](http://www.palitext.com/palitext/JPTS_PDF.htm) (Accessed: 22 October 2020).

Skilling, P. (2004) 'Jambudvīpe pracaramānah: the circulation of Mahāyāna sutras in India', *Journal of the International College for Advanced Buddhist Studies* 7, pp. 188-198. Available at: [https://icabs.repo.nii.ac.jp/?action=repository\\_action\\_common\\_download&item\\_id=192&item\\_no=1&attribute\\_id=22&file\\_no=1](https://icabs.repo.nii.ac.jp/?action=repository_action_common_download&item_id=192&item_no=1&attribute_id=22&file_no=1) (Accessed: 21 October 2020).

Skilling, P. (2009) 'Redaction, recitation, and writing: transmission of the Buddha's teaching in India in the early period', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 53-75.

Skilling, P. (2010) 'Scriptural authenticity and the Śrāvaka schools: an essay towards an Indian perspective', *The Eastern Buddhist* 41(2), pp. 1-47. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44362554> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).

Smagorinsky, P. (2001) 'If meaning is constructed, what is it made from? Towards a cultural theory of reading', *Review of Educational Research* 71(1), pp. 133-169. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.3102/00346543071001133> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Smart, N. (1996) *Dimensions of the sacred: an anatomy of the world's beliefs*. London: Fontana Press.

Smith, S. E., Mund, S. R. and Kam-Tuck Yip, A. (2016) *Cosmopolitan Dharma: race, sexuality, and gender in British Buddhism*. London: Brill. Studies in the History of Religions.

Smith, W. C. (1993) *What is scripture: a comparative approach*. London: SCM.

Snellgrove, D. L. (trans.) (1959) *The Hevajra Tantra: a critical study. Part I: Introduction and translation*. London: Oxford University Press.

Snelling, J. (1992) *The Buddhist handbook: a complete guide to Buddhist teaching and practice* [Second edition]. London: Rider.

Snodgrass, J. (2009) 'Publishing eastern Buddhism: D. T. Suzuki's journey to the West', in DuBois, T. D. (ed.) *Casting faiths: imperialism and the transformation of religion in East and Southeast Asia*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 46-71.

Snook, D. W., Williams, M. J. and Horgan, J. G. (2019) 'Issues in the sociology and psychology of religious conversion', *Pastoral Psychology* 68, pp. 223-240. Available at: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11089-018-0841-1> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).

Sogyal Rinpoche; Gaffney, P. and Harvey, A. (eds.) (2002) *The Tibetan book of living and dying* [Revised and updated]. London: Perfect Bound.

Sonam, R. (2008) *Āryadeva's Four Hundred Stanzas on the Middle Way; with commentary by Gyeltsap*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications. Textual studies and Translations in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism.

Soucy, A. (2017) 'Contemporary Vietnamese Buddhism', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 177-195.

- Stagg, C. (trans.); Heruka, T. (ed.) (2017) *The hundred thousand songs of Milarepa*. Boulder: Shambhala Publications.
- Stearns, C. (trans.) (2006) *Taking the result as the path: core teachings of the Sakya Lamdré tradition*. Boston: Wisdom Publications. The Library of Tibetan Classics, 4.
- Stein, L. and Zangpo, N. (trans.) (2013) *Butön's History of Buddhism in India and its spread to Tibet: A Treasury of Priceless Scripture; Butön Rinchen Drup*. London: Snow Lion Publications. The Tsadra Foundation series.
- Steinkellner, E. (2004) *A tale of leaves: on Sanskrit manuscripts in Tibet, their past, and their future*. Amsterdam: Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences. Gonda Lecture, 2003.
- Stevenson, D. B. (2007a) 'Tales of the Lotus Sūtra', in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Buddhism in practice* [Abridged edition]. Woodstock: Princeton University Press. Princeton readings in religion, pp. 311-335.
- Stevenson, D. B. (2007b) 'Death-bed testimonials of the Pure Land faithful', in Lopez, D. S. Jr. (ed.) *Buddhism in practice* [Abridged edition]. Woodstock: Princeton University Press. Princeton readings in religion, pp. 447-457.
- Stock, B. (1998) *Augustine the reader: meditation, self-knowledge, and the ethics of interpretation* [First paperback edition]. London: The Beknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Stone, J. I. (2006) "'Not mere written words": perspectives on the language of the Lotus sūtra in medieval Japan', in Payne, R. K. and Leighton, T. D. (eds.) *Discourse and ideology in medieval Japanese Buddhism*. London: Routledge, pp. 160-194.
- Strauss, R. A. (1979) 'Religious conversion as a personal and collective accomplishment', *Sociological analysis* 40(2), pp. 158-165. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3709786> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).
- Strong, J. (1995) *The experience of Buddhism: sources and interpretations*. Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company. Religious life in history series.
- Strong, J. (2008) 'Relics and the life story of the Buddha', in Robertson, E. and Jahner, J. (eds.) *Medieval and early Modern devotional objects in global perspective*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan. The new Middle Ages, pp. 11-20.
- Strong, J. (2015) *Buddhisms: an introduction*. London: Oneworld Publications.
- Stryk, L. (ed.) (1968) *World of the Buddha: an introduction to Buddhist literature*. Grove Press Eastern philosophy and literature series.
- Suarez, M. F. (2015) 'Book history from descriptive bibliographies', in Howsam, L. (ed.) *The Cambridge companion to the history of the book*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge companions to literature, pp. 199-218.
- Sujato, B. and Brahmali, B. (2013) *The authenticity of early Buddhist texts* [online]. Oxford: Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies. Supplement to the Journal of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies, 5. Available at: <https://ocbs.org/?s=authenticity+of+early+buddhist+texts&xbk0=35522505841639270&xbt0=M0.5340056639032273T&xbz0=40475549789501030> (Accessed: 19 November 2020).

- Sumedho, A. (2014a) *Ajahn Sumedho: the anthology. Volume 1: Peace if a simple step*. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Buddhist Monastery.
- Sumedho, A. (2014b) *Ajahn Sumedho: the anthology. Volume 2: Seeds of understanding*. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Buddhist Monastery.
- Sumedho, A. (2014c) *Ajahn Sumedho: the anthology. Volume 3: Direct realization*. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Buddhist Monastery.
- Sumedho, A. (2014d) *Ajahn Sumedho: the anthology. Volume 4: The sound of silence*. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Buddhist Monastery.
- Sumedho, A. (2014e) *Ajahn Sumedho: the anthology. Volume 5: The wheel of truth*. Great Gaddesden: Amaravati Buddhist Monastery.
- Sutcliffe, S. (2000) 'Wandering stars': seekers and gurus in the modern world', in Sutcliffe, S. and Bowman, M. (eds.) *Beyond New Age: exploring alternative spirituality*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, pp. 17-36.
- Suzuki, D. T.; Humphreys, C. (ed.) (1980) *The awakening of Zen*. London: Shambhala Publications. Shambhala dragon editions.
- Suzuki, D. T.; Humphreys, C. (ed.) (1983) *An introduction to Zen Buddhism* [Rider pocket edition]. London: Random House.
- Suzuki, D. T. (1998) *Buddha of infinite light: the teachings of Shin Buddhism, the Japanese way of wisdom and compassion* [Revised edition]. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- Suzuki, D. T. (2010) *Zen and Japanese culture* [First Princeton classic edition]. Woodstock: Princeton University Press. Bollingen series 64.
- Suzuki, S.; Dizon, T. (ed.) (1970) *Zen mind, beginner's mind*. New York: Weatherhill.
- Swearer, D. K. (2010) *The Buddhist world of southeast Asia* [Second edition]. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in religious studies.
- Takakusu, J. (trans.) (1896) *A record of the Buddhist religion as practiced in India and the Malay Archipelago (A.D. 671-695) by I-Tsing*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Tambiah, S. J. (1968) 'Literacy in a Buddhist village in north-east Thailand', in Goody, J. (ed.) *Literacy in traditional societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 85-131.
- Tambiah, S. J. (1976) *World conqueror, world renouncer: a study of Buddhism and polity in Thailand against a historical background*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge Studies in social anthropology, 15.
- Tambiah, S. J. (1984) *The Buddhist saints of the forest and the cult of amulets: a study in charisma, hagiography, sectarianism, and millennial Buddhism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge studies in social anthropology, 49.
- Tamney, J. B. (2008) 'Afterword: Modernization, Globalization, and Buddhism', in Numrich, P. D. (ed.) *North American Buddhists in Social Context*. Leiden: Brill. Religion and the social order, 15, pp. 225-241.



Tanabe, G. J. (2004) 'Chanting and liturgy', in Buswell, R. E. (ed.) *Encyclopedia of Buddhism. Volume One A-L*. New York: Macmillan Reference, pp. 137-139.

Tanaka, K. K. (2007) 'The individual in relation to the sangha in American Buddhism: an examination of "privatized religion"', *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 27, pp. 115-127. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/30152897> (Accessed: 08 November 2020).

Tāranātha; Chattopadhyaya, D. (ed.) (1970) *Tāranātha's History of Buddhism in India*. Translated by Lama Chimpa Alaka Chattopadhyaya. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.

Tashi Namgyal, D. (2019) *Moonbeams of Mahāmudrā, with Dispelling the darkness of ignorance by Wangchuk Dorje, the Ninth Karmapa*. Translated by Elizabeth M. Callahan. Boulder: Snow Lion. The Tsadra Foundation series.

Tatelman, J. (trans.) (2005) *The heavenly exploits: Buddhist biographies from the Divyāvadāna. Volume one*. New York: New York University Press. Clay Sanskrit Library.

Tatz, M. (trans.) (1994) *The Skill in Means (Upāyakauśalya) Sūtra*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers.

Taylor, E. (2003) 'Buddhism and Western psychology: an intellectual memoir', in Segall, S. R. (ed.) *Encountering Buddhism: Western psychology and Buddhist teachings*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in transpersonal and humanistic psychology, pp. 179-196.

Thiradhammo, A. (2014) *Working with the five hindrances* [Online]. Belsay: Aruno Publications. Available at: <https://forestsangha.org/teachings/books/working-with-the-five-hindrances?language=English> (Accessed: 05 November 2020).

Thompson, A. (2017) 'Contemporary Cambodian Buddhist traditions: seen from the past', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 236-257.

Thondup, T.; Talbott, H. (ed.) (2002) *Masters of meditation and miracles: lives of the great Buddhist masters of India and Tibet*. Boston: Shambhala Publications.

Thrangu, K. (1993) *The practice of tranquillity and insight: a guide to Tibetan Buddhist meditation: a commentary on the eighth chapter of the Treasury of Knowledge of Jamgön Kongtrül*. Translated by Peter Roberts. London: Shambhala Publications.

Thubten Yeshe, L.; Ribush, N. (ed.) (2012) *Becoming your own therapist: an introduction to the Buddhist way of thought and Make your mind an ocean: aspects of Buddhist psychology*. Boston: Lama Yeshe Wisdom Archive.

Thubten Zopa, R.; Cameron, A. (ed.) (2010) *Kadampa teachings*. Boston: Lama Yeshe Wisdom Archive.

Thubten Zopa, R.; McDougall, G. (ed.) (2012) *How to practice Dharma: teachings on the eight worldly Dharmas*. Boston: Lama Yeshe Wisdom Archive. FPMT lineage series.

Thurman, R. A. F. (1978) 'Buddhist hermeneutics', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 46(1), pp. 19-39. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1462752> (Accessed: 18 October 2020).

Thurman, R. A. F. (ed.) (2006) *Life and teachings of Tsongkhapa*. Translated by Library of Tibetan Works and Archives [Revised edition]. Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives.

- Tikhonov, V. (2017) 'Contemporary Buddhism and education', in Jerryson, M. (ed.) *The Oxford handbook of contemporary Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 518-531.
- Tiyavanich, K. (1997) *Forest recollections: wondering monks in twentieth-century Thailand*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Todaro, D. A. (2004) *Shingon texts: The Mitsugonin confession; the illuminating secret commentary on the five chakras and the nine syllables by Kakuban (Taishō Volume 79, Number 2527m 2514)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 98-VI, VII.
- Todorov, T. (1980) 'Reading as construction', in Suleiman, S. R. and Crosman, I. (ed) *The reader in the text: essays on audience and interpretation*. Guildford: Princeton University Press.
- Todorov, T. (2000) 'The origin of genres', in Duff, D. (ed.) *Modern genre theory*. London: Routledge. Longman critical readers, pp. 193-209.
- Towheed, S. (2011) 'Introduction', in Crone, R. and Towheed, S. (eds.) *The history of reading. Volume 3: methods, strategies, tactics*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 1-12.
- Trainor, K. (1997) *Relics, ritual, and representation in Buddhism: rematerializing the Sri Lankan Theravāda tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Trainor, K. (ed.) (2004) *Buddhism: the illustrated guide*. London: Duncan Baird Publishers. Reference classics.
- Trần, T. D. (2018) 'A mandala of literacy practices in premodern Vietnam: a study of Buddhist temples', *Journal of Vietnamese Studies* 13(3), pp. 88-126. Available at: <https://online.ucpress.edu/jvs/article-abstract/13/3/88/60602> (Accessed: 08 November 2020).
- Trulshik Rinpoche (2006) 'Foreword', in Lingpa, J., Patrul Rinpoche, Geshe Mahapandita. *Deity mantra and wisdom: development stage meditation in Tibetan Buddhist Tantra*. Dharmachakra Translation Committee. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 9-10.
- Trungpa, C.; Baker, J. and Casper, M. (ed.) (1999) *Cutting through spiritual materialism* [Shambhala dragon edition]. Boston: Shambhala South Asia editions. Shambhala dragon editions.
- Trungpa, C.; Gimian, C. R. (ed.) (2007) *Shambhala: the sacred path of the warrior* [First mass market edition]. Boston: Shambhala Publications.
- Tweed, T. A. (1999) 'Night-stand Buddhists and other creatures: sympathizers, adherents, and the study of religion', in Williams, D. R. and Queen, C. S. (eds.) *American Buddhism: methods and findings in recent scholarship*. Richmond: Curzon Press. Curzon critical studies in Buddhism, pp. 71-90.
- Tweed, T. A. (2000) *The American encounter with Buddhism, 1844-1912: Victorian culture and the limits of dissent* [First paperback edition]. London: The University of North Carolina Press.
- Tweed, T. A. (2002) 'Who is a Buddhist? Night-stand Buddhists and other creatures', in Prebish, C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 17-33.
- Uhlmann, P. R. (2010) 'Sŏn master Pang Hanam: a preliminary consideration of his thoughts according to the Five Regulations of the Saṅgha', in Park, J. Y. (ed.) *Makers of modern Korean Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Korean studies, pp. 171-198.

- Unno, M. T. (2006) 'The body of time and the discourse of precepts', in Payne, R. K. and Leighton, T. D. (eds.) *Discourse and ideology in medieval Japanese Buddhism*. London: Routledge, pp. 126-147.
- Van Schaik, S. (2011) *Tibet: a history*. London: Yale University Press.
- Van Schaik, S. (2016) *The spirit of Tibetan Buddhism*. London: Yale University Press. The sacred literature series.
- Van Schaik, S. (2018) *The spirit of Zen*. London: Yale University Press. The sacred literature series.
- Van Schaik, S. (2020) *Buddhist magic: divination, healing, and enchantment through the ages*. Boulder: Shambhala Publications.
- Van Voorst, R. E. (2008) *Anthology of world scriptures* [Sixth edition]. Belmont: Thomson Higher Education.
- Veidlinger, D. (2006) 'When a word is worth a thousand pictures: Mahāyāna influence on Theravāda attitudes towards writing', *Numen* 53(4), pp. 405-447. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/27643233> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).
- Veidlinger, D. (2007) *Spreading the Dhamma: writing, orality, and textual transmission in Buddhist Northern Thailand*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Southeast Asia: politics, meaning, memory.
- Victoria, B. D. (2006) *Zen at war* [Second edition]. Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Waddell, N. (trans.) (1994) *The essential teaching of Zen master Hakuin: a translation of the Sokkōroku Kaien-fusetsu*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Waddell, N. (trans.) (1999) *Wild ivy: the spiritual autobiography of Zen master Hakuin*. London: Shambhala Publications.
- Wald, K. D. and Calhoun-Brown, A. (2011) *Religion and politics in the United States* [Sixth edition]. Plymouth: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Wallace, B. A. (2002) 'The spectrum of Buddhist practice in the West', in Prebish, C. S. and Baumann, M. (eds.) *Westward Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London: University of California Press, pp. 34-50.
- Wallace, V. (2009a) 'Diverse aspects of the Mongolian Buddhist manuscript culture and realms of its influence', in Berkwitz, S. C., Schober, J. and Brown, C. (eds.) *Buddhist manuscript cultures: knowledge, ritual, and art*. London: Routledge. Routledge critical studies in Buddhism, 52, pp. 19-34.
- Wallace, V. (2009b) 'The body as a text and the text as the body: a view from the Kālacakratantra's perspective', in Arnold, E. A. (ed.) *As long as space endures: essays on the Kālacakra Tantra in honor of H. H. the Dalai Lama*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 179-191.
- Walshe, M. (trans.) (2012) *The Long Discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Dīgha Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications. Teachings of the Buddha.
- Waples, D., Berelson, B. and Bradshaw, F. R. (1940) *What reading does to people: a summary of evidence on the social effect of reading and a statement of problems for research*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Warder, A. K. (1961) 'The Pali Canon and its commentaries as an historical record', in Philips, C. H. (ed.) *Historians of India, Pakistan and Ceylon*. London: Oxford University Press. Historical writing on the peoples of Asia, pp. 44-56.

- Waterhouse, H. (1997) *Buddhism in Bath: adaptation and authority*. Leeds: Community Religions Project, Department of Theology and Religious Studies, University of Leeds. Monograph series 6.
- Waters, B. A. (2015) 'The spirituality of reading', *Public Library Quarterly* 12(4), pp. 25-27. Available at: [https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1300/J118v12n04\\_03](https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1300/J118v12n04_03) (Accessed: 27 October 2020).
- Watson, B. (trans.) (1993) *The Zen teachings of Master Lin-chi: a translation of the Lin-chi Lu*. London: Shambhala Publications. Shambhala Dragon editions.
- Watson, R. (2009) 'Some non-textual uses of books', in Eliot, S. and Rose, J. (eds.) *A companion to the history of the book*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to literature and culture, 48, pp. 480-492.
- Watts, A. (1973) *In my own way: an autobiography 1915-1965*. Novato: New World Library.
- Wedemeyer, C. K. (2014) *Making sense of Tantric Buddhism: history, semiology, and transgression in the Indian traditions* [Paperback edition]. Chichester: Columbia University Press. South Asia across the disciplines.
- Welch, H. (1967) *The practice of Chinese Buddhism 1900-1950*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. Harvard east Asian studies, 26.
- Welter, A. (2004) 'Lineage and context in the "Patriarch's Hall Collection" and the "Transmission of the Lamp"', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *The Zen canon: understanding the classic texts*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 137-179
- Welter, A. (2008) 'Buddhist rituals for protecting the country in medieval Japan: Myōan Eisai's "Regulations of the Zen Schools"', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *Zen ritual: studies in Zen Buddhist theory in practice*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 113-138.
- Whalen-Bridge, J. and Storhoff, G. (2009) 'Introduction', in Whalen-Bridge, J. and Storhoff, G. (eds.) *The emergence of Buddhist American literature*. Albany: State University of New York Press. SUNY series in Buddhism and American culture, pp. 1-17.
- Wiegand, W. A. (2009) 'Libraries and the invention of information', in Eliot, S. and Rose, J. (eds.) *A companion to the history of the book*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to literature and culture, 48, pp. 531-543.
- Wijayawardhana, G. D. (1979) 'Literature in Buddhist religious life', in Carter, J. R. (ed.) *Religiousness in Sri Lanka*. Colombo: Marga Institute, pp. 67-77.
- Wiles, R. (2016) 'Buddhadāsa Bhikkhu', in Powers, J. (ed.) *The Buddhist world*. London: Routledge, pp. 641-649.
- Wilkinson, G. and Frederick, N. J. (2017) 'Inventing Buddhist Bibles in Japan: from Nanjoo Bun'yuu to Numata Yehan', in Wu, J. and Wilkinson, G. (eds.) *Reinventing the Tripitaka: transformation of the Buddhist canon in modern East Asia* [eBook]. London: Lexington Books, Chapter 3. Available at: <https://www.amazon.co.uk/Reinventing-Tripitaka-Transformation-Buddhist-Modern> (Accessed: 7 August 2020)
- Willemen, C. (1994) *The storehouse of sundry valuables: translated from the Chinese of Kikkāya and Liu Hsiao-piao (Compiled by T'an-yao) (Taishō, Volume 4, Number 203)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 10-I.

Willemen, C. (1999) *The scriptural text: verses of the doctrine, with parables: translated from the Chinese of Fa-li and Fa-chü (Taishō Volume 4, Number 211)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 10-II.

Williams, P. (2009) *Mahāyāna Buddhism: the doctrinal foundations* [Second edition]. London: Routledge.

Williams, R. B. (1970) 'Historical criticism of a Buddhist scripture: The Mahāparanibbāna Sutta' *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 38(2), pp. 156-167. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1461172> (Accessed: 15 October 2020).

Willingham, D. T. (2017) *The reading mind: a cognitive approach to understanding how the mind reads*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Winternitz, M. (1972) *A history of Indian literature. Vol. II: Buddhist literature and Jaina literature* [Second edition]. Translated by S. Ketkar and H. Kohn. New Delhi: Oriental Books Reprint Corporation.

Wittern, C. (2017) 'The digital Tripitaka and the modern world', in Wu, J. and Wilkinson, G. (eds.) *Reinventing the Tripitaka: transformation of the Buddhist canon in modern East Asia* [eBook]. London: Lexington Books, Chapter 5. Available at: <https://www.amazon.co.uk/Reinventing-Tripitaka-Transformation-Buddhist-Modern> (Accessed: 7 August 2020)

Wright, D. S. (1998) *Philosophical meditations on Zen Buddhism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Cambridge studies in religious traditions.

Wright, D. S. (2003) 'Empty texts/sacred meaning: reading as spiritual practice in Chinese Buddhism', *Dao: A Journal of Comparative Philosophy* 11(2), pp. 261-272. Available at: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2FBF02857198> (Accessed: 27 October 2020).

Wright, D. S. (2006) 'Introduction: the concept of classic literature in Zen Buddhism', in Heine, S. and Wright, D. S. (eds.) *Zen classics: formative texts in the history of Zen Buddhism*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 3-14.

Wu, J. (2016a) 'The Chinese Buddhist canon through the ages: essential categories and critical issues in the study of a textual tradition', in Wu, J. and Chia, L. (eds.) *Spreading Buddha's word in East Asia: the formation and transformation of the Chinese Buddhist canon*. New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 15-45. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7312/wu--17160> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).

Wu, J. (2016b) 'From the cult of the book to the cult of the canon: a neglected tradition in Chinese Buddhism', in Wu, J. and Chia, L. (eds.) *Spreading Buddha's word in East Asia: the formation and transformation of the Chinese Buddhist canon*. New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 46-78. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7312/wu--17160> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).

Wu, J. and Wilkinson, G. (2017) 'Introduction', in Wu, J. and Wilkinson, G. (eds.) *Reinventing the Tripitaka: transformation of the Buddhist canon in modern East Asia* [eBook]. London: Lexington Books, Introduction. Available at: <https://www.amazon.co.uk/Reinventing-Tripitaka-Transformation-Buddhist-Modern> (Accessed: 7 August 2020).

Wuthnow, R. (2013) 'Spirituality and spiritual practice', in Fenn, R. K. (ed.) *The Blackwell companion to sociology of religion* [First paperback edition]. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. Blackwell companions to religion, pp. 306-320.

Wuthnow, R. and Cadge, W. (2004) 'Buddhists and Buddhism in the United States: the scope of influence', *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 43(3), pp. 363-380. Available at: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1468-5906.2004.00240.x> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).

Wynne, A. (2004) 'The oral transmission of the early Buddhist literature', *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 27(1), pp. 97-127. Available at: <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/8945> (Accessed: 26 October 2020).

Wynne, A. (2015) *Buddhism: an introduction*. London: I. B. Tauris. I. B. Tauris introductions to religion.

Yamabe, B. and Sueki, F. (trans.) (2009) *The Sūtra on the Concentration of Sitting Meditation (Taishō Volume 15, Number 614): translated from the Chinese of Kumārajīva*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka.

Yampolski, P. B. (trans.) (1971) *The Zen master Hakuin: selected writings*. London: Columbia University Press. Records of civilization: sources and studies.

Yen, S. (1994) *Reading Sūtras as spiritual practice*. Available at: <https://www.westernchanfellowship.org/Dharma/Dharma-library/Dharma-article/1994/reading-sutras-as-a-spiritual-practice/> (Accessed: 14 January 2021).

Yoeli-Tlalim, R. (2009) 'The Kālacakra empowerment as conducted by Kirti Tsenshab Rinpoche', in Arnold, E. A. (ed.) *As long as space endures: essays on the Kālacakra Tantra in honor of H. H. the Dalai Lama*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, pp. 416-448.

York, M. (2001) 'New Age commodification and appropriation of spirituality', *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 16(3), pp. 361-372. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13537900120077177> (Accessed: 28 October 2020).

Yoshida, O. (trans.) (1999) The Faith-mind maxim: in Sengaku, M. (ed.) *Three Chan classics: the recorded sayings of Linji; Wumen's Gate; The Faith-mind Maxim (Taishō Volumes 47 and 48 Numbers 1985, 2005, 2010)*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. BDK English Tripiṭaka 74-I, II, III.

Zacchetti, S. (2016) 'Notions and visions of the canon in early Chinese Buddhism', in Wu, J. and Chia, L. (eds.) *The formation and transformation of the Chinese Buddhist canon*. New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 81-108. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7312/wu--17160> (Accessed: 22 October 2020).

Zhiru, S. (2010) 'Scriptural authority: a Buddhist perspective' *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 30, pp. 85-105. Available at: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40864871> (Accessed: 19 October 2020).

Ziegler H. H. (trans.) (2015) *The Collection for the Propagation and Clarification of Buddhism. Volume I (Taishō Volume 52, Number 2102) [compiled by Shi Sengyou]*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.

Ziegler H. H. (trans.) (2017) *The Collection for the Propagation and Clarification of Buddhism. Volume II (Taishō Volume 52, Number 2102) [compiled by Shi Sengyou]*. Moraga: BDK America. BDK English Tripiṭaka series.

Žižek, S. (2007) *The universal exception* [Paperback edition]. London: Continuum.

Zürcher, E. (1984) 'Beyond the Jade Gate': Buddhism in China, Vietnam and Korea', in Bechert, H. and Gombrich, R. (eds.) *The world of Buddhism: Buddhist monks and nuns in society and culture*. London: Thames and Hudson, pp. 193-211.

Zürcher, E.; Silk, J. A. (ed.) (2013) *Buddhism in China: collected papers of Erik Zürcher*. Leiden: Brill. Sinica Leidensia.

Zwalf, W. (ed.) (1985) *Buddhism: art and faith*. London: British Museum Publications.

Zwilling, A.-L. (2013) 'Lire et interpréter: l'exégèse, le texte et le lecteur', in Zwilling, A.-L. (ed.) *Lire et interpréter: les religions et leur rapports aux textes fondateurs*. Genève: Labor et Fides. Religions et modernités, pp. 198-214.